## RIGHTS OF GROSS HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATION VICTIMS (INTERNATIONAL AND NATIONAL LAW PERSPECTIVE)

### Abdul Haris Samendawai

### Ab stra c t

Rights of gross human rights violation victims have been much regulated in a number of constitutional regulations. However, conceptual shortfalls in substantial formulations are still present in the positive law. The substantial aspect shortfalls have the potential to have detrimental implication to the protection of gross human right violation victim's rights considering the procedural aspects will refer to the material law. This condition certainly become a challenge which is expected to motivate all related parties to improve and bring their best contribution in the effort to protect, improve human rights, and enforce law and justice to the victim.

#### Introduction

The development of criminology theories in criminal law and the practice of criminal court system in a number of decades have gone through a big transformation, especially in its relation to the attentions of experts, academic ians, and practitioners towards the position of the victim in criminal court processes. A higher degree of attention towards the position of the victim in criminal court is shown by the adoption of a various legal regulation in the international and national level which regulates the protection and assurance of the victim's rights. In Indonesia, the attention towards the position of the victim in the criminal court system became clear with the adoption of the Act 13 of 2006 on the protection of witnesses and victims. In the act, there are three matters which are being regulated. The first is the formulation of rights and the forms of protection given to victims and witnesses. The second concern is the institutional aspects of Lembaga Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban (Witnesses and Victims Protection Institution). The third is the conditions on the granting of protection and aids regarding

mechanism aspects and procedures of the Witnesses and Victims Protection Institution.

This publication will discuss briefly the protection and rights of victims of gross human rights violations which is written in the international human rights law and the practical context of the regulation and implementation in national law. To formulate this publication, the term gross human rights violation refers to the definition written in Act 26 of 2000 on the Human Rights Court. The Human Rights Court Act determines that there are two actions, genocide and crime against humanity, as gross human rights violation. In the context of law enforcement, complexity will arise in conceptual and technical forms. This publication is meant to answer and find opportunities of solutions that might be found based on experience and theoretical and practical knowledge.

### International and National Human Rights Law

The main reference in international human rights law of the definition of victims is the Declaration of Basic Principle of Justice for Victim and Abuse of Power, adopted by General Assembly Resolution 40/34 of 29 November 1985 which this publication will refer as victim declaration. Other major reference is in the International Criminal Court (ICC) Rules of Procedure and Evidence which formulation strengthens the concept of victims in the context of gross human rights violations. Regarding gross human rights violations in national law, definition of victims refers to Government Regulation 2 of 2002 on the Procedure of Human Rights Violation Victims and Witnesses Protection and Act 13 of 2006 on Witness and Victim Protection. The four references of the definition in international and national is presented in the following table.

Definition of Victim Comparison Table 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Syahrial & Melly, *Pemberian Bantuan dalam Undang-undang tentang Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban*, ICW-ICJR & Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2007 page 11-13.

Witness and Vic tim Protection Act	nt Regulation 2 of 2002	Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Vic tim $\mathbf{s}^2$	Inte ma tio na l C rim ina l C o urt <sup>3</sup>
Vic tim is a person suffering mental, physical and/or economical loss due to a criminal action. (Note: Government Regulation 44 of 2008 has the same definition of vic tim with Witness and Vic tim Protection Act)	Vic tim is an individual or group suffering gross human right violations which require physical and mental protection from threats, terror, and violence from any party.	Vic tims means persons who, individually or collectively, have suffered harm, including physical or mental injury, emotional suffering, economic loss or substantial impairment of their fundamental rights, through acts or omissions that are in violation of criminal laws operative within Member States, including those laws proscribing criminal abuse of power.	suffered harm as a result of the commission of

Basic components formulated in the definition of victims contain two important matters: first, victim subject which include individual orgroups, and second, loss and suffering due to a violation of law. After the birth of Witness and Victims Protection Act, the definition of victim shifts to individualize the victim. Compared to Government Regulation 2 of 2002, Witnesses and Victims Protection Act and Government Regulation 44 of 2008 on the Compensation,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power (adopted by General Assembly resolution 40/ 34 of November 1985), "Victims" means persons who, individually or collectively, have suffered harm, including physical or mental injury, emotional suffering, economic loss or substantial impairment of their fundamental rights, through acts or omissions that are in violation of criminal laws operative within Member States, including those laws proscribing criminal abuse of power.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Rules of Procedure and Evidenc: Rule 85 Definition Of Victims For the purposes of the Statute and the Rules of Procedure and Evidence:

<sup>(</sup>a) "Victims" means natural persons who have suffered harm as a result of the commission of any crime within the jurisdiction of the Court;

<sup>(</sup>b) Victims may include organizations or institutions that have sustained direct harm to any of their property which is dedicated to religion, education, art or science or charitable purposes and to their historic monuments, hospitals and other places and objects for humanitarian purposes.

Restitution, and Aids to Witnesses and Victims do not state the collective condition of victims when most human rights violation victims are groups/collective individuals.

The norm formulated in the act is constructed in the individual definition and do not cover groups as stated in the definition in Government Regulation 2 of 2002 or the Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power (adopted by General Assembly resolution 40/34 of November 1985) and Rule 85 of the International Criminal Court. In the context of the duty and authority of the protection institution this juristic formulation problem becomes a task that should be handled seriously to give better service on protecting the victim. The limited scope of victim subject will certainly bring implications especially for the development of protection and aid regulations which the institution will deliver to the victim.

### Rights of Gross Human Rights Violation Victims

In the victim declaration, a number of main rights of victims must be assured and protected by the state. They are: first, the victims right of the availability of justice mechanism and achieve immediate compensation (in the form of compensation and restitution); second, right of information on their rights in pursuing compensation and receive information on the progress of legal processes for compensation; third, right to express their views and opinions; fourth, rights to receive aid in the process of punishment; fifth, right of protection from disturbance, intimidation, and retaliation from the convict, personal freedom protection and safety protection of person and family; and sixth, right of speedy and simple justice process/mechanism without any delay.

Meanwhile, in the Rome Statute and Rules of Procedure and Evidence as the main international legal instruments for human rights which is closely related to gross human rights violation give special attention on the position of victims in the tribunal process. This matter is regulated in a number of articles on the rights of victims during the tribunal processes. They are first, victims' right of protection during the trial (Article 57 regulates the pre trial protection and Article 68 regulates the rights of victims during the trial process such as

vic tims; participation, protection mechanism in the proving stages to give statements in camera and giving evidence in electronic media); second, right of protection in the context of financial and other facilities for the vic tims and their families (Article 79 regulates the establishment of a Thust Fund to ensure the rights of violation vic tims and their families).

Aside from the two documents mentioned above, the international human rights law recognizes the van Boven principles and Joinet principles as two main references formulated through deep study conducted by Special Rapporteurs of the UN Human Rights Sub Commission and independent experts. Based on a number of international law norms, every violation of the human rights will raise the right of recovery. Recovery meant by Van Boven is every type of redress in material and non material form for victims of human rights violation therefore compensation, restitution, and rehabilitation include specific aspects of recovery. Boven proposed six basic principles which the state that will formulate a policy on the fulfillment of victims' rights must obey. The first is that recovery can be pursued individually or collectively. The second is that the state is obligated to apply special steps that enable the recovery steps to be conducted effectively and fully. Recovery must be in balance with the weight of the violation and damage it caused which includes restitution, compensation, rehabilitation, fulfillment, and guarantee that similar event will not occur. The third principle is that every state must announce through a public mechanism or private institution within and outside the state about the availability of recovery procedures. The fourth principle is that the limiting regulations may not apply in the duration of no effective settlement of the human rights and humanitarian law violation. The Fifth principle is that every country must enable the speedy availability of all information regarding the requirements of recovery. The sixth principle is that decisions regarding recovery of gross human rights and humanitarian law vio la tion vic tims should be implemented me tic ulously and quickly.4

Meanwhile, the bottom line of the Joinet principle is an effort of protection and promotion of human rights through steps to eliminate impunity

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Theo Van Boven, Mereka yang Menjadi Korban, Hak Korban atas Restitusi, Kompensasi, dan Rehabilitasi. Pengantar Buku ; Ifdhal Kasim page xxi-xxii, ELSAM, 2002.

by adopting universal human rights basic principles to be implemented to the efforts in the working mechanism of domestic law. The study explained the principles in four important points: right of information, right of justice, right of reparation, and right of no recurrence guarantee. One of the rights of justice principle which is very important to discuss is the regulation on the principles of limitation which is justified by the desire to fight impunity regarding amnesty regulation in gross human rights violation.

The principle clearly states that amnesty cannot be granted to the perpetuator of the violation before the victims achieve justice through effective trial. Amnesty may not have any legal effects on the trial process submitted by the victim regarding reparation.<sup>5</sup>

The criminal court system can develop efforts of reparation for victims of human rights violation which is grouped into two main groups: monetary remedies and non monetary remedies. Monetary remedies are reparation which uses material values in the form of money of physical products to repair damage/loss caused by human rights violation. Non-Monetary remedies are victims' effort of repairs which is more based on the recovery of damage/loss caused by the violation by specific steps which cannot be valued with a specific material value such as apology of perpetuator/state, rehabilitation, non recurrence guarantee, truth telling, punishment for violator, or declaratory judgments.

In the national law ground, since Witnesses and Victims Protection Act and Government Regulation 44 of 2008 are put into effect, victims protection regarding victims of gross human rights violation refer to the two regulations. Other constitutional regulations are still in effect as long as they do not conflict the two regulations. The regulations do not differentiate specifically rights of victims from the rights of witnesses. This means that the act has accommodated right of justice for victims because the protection of victims are delivered since the investigation is being conducted. In the Witnesses and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Kontras, Menolak Impunitas, Serangkaian Prinsip Perlindungan dan Pemajuan Hak Asasi Manusia. Prinsip-Prinsip Hak Korban. Kontras, 2005.page 128.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Dinah Shelton, Remedies in International Human Rights Law, Oxford University, 1999.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Act 26 of 2000, Government Regulation 2 of 2002 on the Procedure of Protection of Witnesses and Victims of Gross Human Right Violation and Government Regulation 3 of 2002 on Compensation, Restitution, and Rehabilitation of Victims of Gross Human Rights Violation.

Victims Protection Act, victims of gross human rights violations have two exclusive rights granted by the act which are rights of compensation and aid a side from the rights to ask for restitution to the violator. In the view of the writer, the formulation of definition of compensation stated in Government Regulation 44 of 2008 has a fundamental conceptual mistake. The formulation of compensation in the Government Regulation is compensation given by the state because the violator is incapable of giving full compensation.

With the formulation, new compensation which will be conducted depends on the presence of the violator and/or the capability of the violator in giving compensation. This is certainly not consistent with the concepts and principles of human rights law which gives the obligation towards states to give protection and assurance to the victims maximally by taking correct steps, meticulous steps, and give satisfaction to the victims of gross human rights violation. This certainly becomes a very important note for the author and all discussion members.

Article 5, 6, and 7 of Witness and Victims Protection Act become the reference for rights, forms of protection, and forms of aids guaranteed by the constitution. In article 5, there are thirteen rights of witnesses and/or victims which should be noted in protecting by the protection institution. In that article, the Witness and Victims Protection Act stated that the main protection needed is protection of personal, family, and belonging safety and that they should be free from threats regarding their testimony in the trial process. More information of the witnesses' or victims' rights given by the protection institution is concluded in table 1. Aside of what is stated in Article 5, the victims have the right for compensation and restitution as regulated in Article 7 of the Witness and Victims Protection Act. According to Article 6 of the Witness and Victims Protection Act, the victims of human rights violation have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Detailed discussion on the compensation and restitution can be seen at Wahyu Wagiman & Zainal Abidin, *Praktik Kompensasi dan Restitusi di Indonesia, sebuah Kajian Awal*, ICW-ICJR, dan Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2007. Explanation on aid can be seen at dilihat, Syahrial MW& Melly, *Pemberian Bantuan dalam Undang-undang tentang Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban*, ICW-ICJR & Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2007 and *Naskah Akademis dan RPP Pemberian Kompensasi dan Restitusi serta Bantuan bagi Saksi dan Korban Usul Inisiatif Masyarakat*, ICW – ICJR- Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2008.

# The Rights of Witnesses and Victims as stated in Article 5 of the Law concerning Witness and Victim Protection

Articles concerning the rights	Explanation on the Law of Witness
guaranteed by the Law of Witness	and Vic tims Protection
and Victims Protection	
Lettera Enjoy the protection over the security of personal, family, and possessions, also the freedom from any threads related with the testimony which will be given, being given, or already given.  Letterb Involved in the process of choosing	This type of protection is the prominent protection needed by the witness and victims. If necessary, Witness and Victim needs to be located in a non-disclosure area to assure the safety of the witness and victim  Well explained
and determining the form of protection and security assistance  Letterc Giving information without any pressure	We ll e xp la ine d
Letterd Acquiring a translator	This right is given to the witness and victim with no fluent capability of speaking Indonesian in order to smooth the process of trial
Lettere Free from any deceiving questions Letterf Obtaining information regarding the case development; until the end of the protection period	Well explained It is often that a witness and victim only have a role in giving testimony in the court, but witness and victim does not know the development of the particular case. Therefore, the development of the case should be informed to the witness and victims
Letterg Obtain information regarding the decision of the court	This information is necessary to be known by the witness and victims as an award of their willingness in the trial process

 $<sup>^9</sup>$  Explanation on the witnesses' and victims' rights in Witnesses and Victims Protection Act can be seen in Syahrial & Melly, Pemberian Bantuan dalam Undang-undang tentang Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban, ICW-ICJR & Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2007

Le tte r h	The witness's and victim's fear of
Know if the accused is freed	receiving revenge from the
Know i the accused is freed	accused is reasonable enough and
	they have the right to be informed if
	an accused for a jail sentence will
	be set free.
LetterI	In several cases, especially when it
Coining now identity	involve an organized crime, the
Gaining newidentity	Witness and Victim could be
	threatened even though the
	accused is already being punished.
	In certain cases, Witness and
	Vic tims may be given a new
	identity.
Le tte rj	If the security of the Witness and
Acquire new settlement	Victim is felt concerned about,
Acquire hew settlement	giving a new settlement to the
	Witness and Victim must be
	considered so that the Witness and
	Victim could continue their living
	without fear. The definition of "new
	settlement" is certain place which is
	temporary and considered safe.
Le tte r k	The Witness and Victim that could
Receive reimbursement for	not afford to finance themselves in
Tweetwe le min disement 101	order to attend the location need a
transport accordingly to its need	financial assistance by the
	govemment.
Letterl	The definition of "legaladvice" is
Obtain Legal Advice	the legaladvice needed by the
	Witness and Victim when it deems
	ne c e ssa ry.
Letterm	The definition of "temporary daily
Receive temporary daily financial	financial assistance" is daily cost
	which is appropriate with the
a ssista nc e	c urrent situation at that time, for
	example the cost for daily meal.

### IPSK Role in Protecting Witness and Victim of Human Right Violation 10

The above explanation regarding the rights of victims, produce several categories or stages that will be the duty and authority of LPSK, which is:

First, the form of physical protection given by the LPSK is: Protection over personal security, family, and possessions (Article 5 Phrase (1) a); Protection

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> The explanation in this part is extracted from the sub-chapter concerning duty and function of LPSK according to the Law of Witness and Victim Protection, Syahrial &Melly, *Pemberian Bantuan dalam Undangundang Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban*, ICW-ICJR & Coalition of Witness Protection, 2007.

from any threats (Article 5 Phrase (1) a); Obtain new identity (Article 5 Phrase (1) i); and Acquiring new settlement (Article 5 Phrase (1) j).

Se cond, the form of witness/victim's participation in the LPSK protection program is: witness and/or victim have the right to participate in the process of choosing and determining the form of protection and security assistance (Article 5 Phrase (1) b).

Third, the form of assurance related to the court's administration in every stage of legal process is: Witness and/or victims may give testimony without any pressure in every stage of legal processing (Article 5 Phrase (1) c); Witness and/or victim will be accompanied by translator in the existence of a language barrier (Article 5 Phrase (1) d); Witness and/or victim should be free from any deceiving question (Article 5 Phrase (1) e); Witness and/or victim should receive information regarding the development of the case until the end of the protection period (Article 5 Phrase (1) h); Witness and/or victim will be informed if the accused is set free (Article 5 Phrase (1) h); Witness and/or victim have the right to be accompanied by legal council to receive legal advices (Article 5 Phrase (1) l).

Fourth, the form of financial assistance and medics/psycho-social service is: transportation cost (Article 5 Phrase (1) k); Temporary living cost (Article 5 Phrase (1) m); Medical assistance (Article 6 a); and psycho-social rehabilitation assistance (article 6 b).

Fifth, the form of reparation for the victim of gross violation of human right that might be proposed by the IPSK is: Compensation proposal for the victim (Article 7 Phrase (1) a) and restitution proposal for the victim (Article 7 Phrase (1) b).

Sixth, the form of action and services given by the IPSK described the duty and function of IPSK as stated in the Law concerning IPSK, in particularly Article 1 Number 3 and Article 12.

Article 1 Number 3

The Institution of Witness and Victim Protection (IPSK) is an institution which duty and authorities is to give protection and other rights to the witness and/orvic tim as regulated in this Law.

Artic le 12

IPSK is responsible to handle the granting of protection and assistance for the witness and victim according to the duty and authority as stated in this Law.

In Article 10, IPSK also have a mandate from the Law concerning Witness and Victim Protection to ensure the protection for the witness and victim about the assurance by the Law, whereas the witness and victim may not be prosecuted in private or criminal court regarding to the information given or the ir te stimony.

### Artic le 10

- (1) Witness, Victim, and Informant could not be prosecuted in private or criminal court for the information, testimony that will be, being, or already given.
- (2) A witness which is also an accused in the same case could not be free from the criminal law suit if he is convincing and legally proven guilty, but his testimony could become a consideration for the judge to give a dispensation for the criminal sentences.
- (3) The provision stated in Phrase (1) would not be in effect for the witness, victim, and informant that give information without any good-will.

Article 10 also gives a duty for IPSK to assure the dispensation of sentences for the accused that is also become the witness of IPSK Even though the dispensation of sentences is an absolute authority of the judge, Article 10 Phrase (2) clearly relates the duty and function of IPSK in the trial process to assure the dispensation for a witness which is also an accused that is joining the IPSK protection program.<sup>11</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Article 10 Phrase (2) of the Law concerning Witness and Victim Protection is basically similar with the mechanism of plea bargaining (the definition of plea bargaining is the process whereby the accused and the prosecutor in a criminal case work out a mutually satisfactory disposition of the case subject t court approval. It usually involves the defendant's pleading guilty to a lesser offense or to only one or some of the counts of a multi-count indictment in return for a lighter sentence than that possible for the graver charge. See Black's Law Dictionary). According to this Article, LPSK should assure the existence of criminal sentence dispensation for the accused which is also a witness. Meaning that LPSK must take the necessary step to negotiate with the other law enforcer especially the Judge.

## Categories of Action and Service Provided by the IPSK

Categories of Action and Services		Fo	Form of Protection and also the Refered Articles	
1	Physic ally protection	A B	Pro te c tion over personal security, family, and possessions (Article 5 Phrase (1) a)  Pro te c tion from any threats (Article 5 Phrase (1) a)	
		C	Obtaining new identity (Article 5 Phrase (1) i)	
2	Assurance of the witness/victim's participation in the IPSK protection program	D	Acquiring new settlement (Article 5 Phrase (1) j).  Witness and/or victim have the right to join the process of choosing and determining the form of protection and security assitance (Article 5 Phrase (1) b)	
3 Court Administrat		A B C	Witness and/orvic tim give information without presure in every stage of legal processing (Article 5 Phrase (1)c)  Witness and/orvic tim will be accompanied by translator in the existence of a language barrier (Article 5 Phrase (1)d)  Witness and/orvic tim is free from any deceiving question (Article 5 Phrase (1)e)	
	Ad ministra do n	E F	Witness and/orvic tim should receive information regarding the development of the case until the end of the protection period (Article 5 Phrase (1) f)  Witness and/orvic tim will be informed if the accused is set free (Article 5 Phrase (1)h)  Witness and/orvic tim have the right to be accompanied by legal council to receive legal advices (1) l)	
4	Financial assistance and medical/psych o -social services	A B C D	Transportation cost (Article 5 Phrase (1) k) Temporary living cost (Article 5 Phrase (1)m) Medical assistance (Article 6 a) Psycho-social rehabilitation assistance (Article 6 b)	
5	Form of reparation	В	Restitution proposal for the victim (Article 7 Phrase	

### Conclusion

It could be concluded from the explanation above that the

conceptual weaknesses from the substance of the constitutional regulation regarding the victim of gross violation of human right is still exist in our positive law. The substantial aspects could result in a bad implication towards the protection of the gross violation of human right victim's rights, whereas the procedural aspect is almost clearly referring to the material law. This condition would become a challenge that could stimulate every party to fix and give their best contribution in protecting, human right development, also law enforcement and justice for the victim

### References

- Dina h She lto n, Re me die s in International Human Rights Law, Oxford University, 1999.
- EISAM, Mahkamah Pidana Inte masio nal, Statuta Roma, Hukum Acara, dan Unsur-unsur Ke jahatan, EISAM, 2007.
- KO NTRAS, Me no lak Impunitas, Se rang akian Prinsip pe rlindung and an pe majuan Hak asasi Manusia. Prinsip-Prinsip Hak Korban, KO NTRAS, 2005.
- Syahrial Martanto Wiryawan & Melly Setyowati, Pemberian Bantuan dalam Undang-undang tentang Perlindungan Saksi dan Korban, ICW-ICJR & Koalisi Perlindungan Saksi, 2007
- The o Van Boven, Me re ka yang Menjadi Korban, Hak Korban atas Re stitusi, Kompensasi, dan Rehabilitasi, EISAM, 2002.
- Tim Ke rja RPP Pe mbe rian Kompensasi, Restitusi, dan Bantuan, Naskah Akade mis dan RPP Pe mbe rian Kompensasi dan Restitusi se nta Bantuan bagi Saksi dan Komban Usul Inisiatif Masyam kat, ICW ICJR-Coalition of Witness Protection, 2008.
- Wa hyu Wa gima n & Za ina l Ab id in, *Pra ktik Kompensa si dan Re stitusi di*Indone sia, se buah Ka jian Awal, ICW-ICJR, dan Coalition of Witness Protection, 2007.
- Black's Law Dictionary, Sixth Edition
- Law Number 26 Year 2000 concerning the Human Right Court
- Law Number 13 Year 2006 concerning Witness and Victim Protection
- Government Regulation Number 2 Year 2002 concerning the Method of Protection for the Witness and Victim in Gross Violation of Human Right
- Gove mment Regulation Number 3 Year 2002 concerning the Compensation, Restitution, and Rehabilitation for the Witness and Victim in Gross Violation of Human Right
- Government Regulation Number 44 Year 2008 concerning the Granting of Compensation, Restitution and Rehabilitation for the Witness and Victim
- Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power (adopted by General Assembly resolution 40/34 of November 1985),