

Conference Paper

Analysis of the Nurse's Turnover Intentions at Private Hospitals in Indonesia

Rindu¹, Hardisman², Sutoto³, and Astrid Novita⁴

¹Doctoral Program of Public Health Science, Faculty of Medicine, Andalas University, Padang, West Sumatra, Indonesia

²Faculty of Medicine, Andalas University, Padang, West Sumatra, Indonesia

³Commission on Hospital Accreditation (KARS), Indonesia

Abstract

The number of hospitals, especially private hospitals in Indonesia, keeps growing. The hospital provides services as intangible products produced by health workers or HR at the hospital, including nurses. Globally, the rate of turnover among nurses ranges from 10% to 21% per year when the optimum standard of turnover for nurses in a hospital is 10% per year [1]. High turnover rates have a detrimental impact on hospitals, in terms of management, financing, and service quality. The purpose of this study is to determine the direct and indirect effects of transformational leadership, job characteristics, and quality of work life on the desire for a turnover. This study used a cross-sectional design. For data analysis, it used a variant-based Structural Equation Model (SEM) method or generally referred to as Smart Partial Least Square/Smart PLS. The results of this study indicate that the indirect effect of transformational leadership through job characteristics on the desire to retreat (turnover intention) is the highest value influence. Based on that results, the suggestion of this study is to increase leadership management from the hospital to be prioritized. Besides that, hospital management also needs to pay attention to the quality of life of the nurses, in order to achieve the conditions of human resources that can support a realization of high work productivity.

Keywords: hospital, nurse, turnover intentions

Corresponding Author:

Rindu

rindualghie@gmail.com

Received: 17 October 2018

Accepted: 5 November 2018

Published: 5 December 2018

Publishing services provided by
Knowledge E

© Rindu et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons](#)

[Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the 2nd ICHA Conference Committee.

1. Introduction

According to Accountability Performance Report of Government Agencies in 2016 by Ministry of Health of the Republic of Indonesia [2], the number of hospitals in Indonesia in the period of 2015–2016 generally increase to 5.5%, especially private hospitals by 10%. The increasing number of private hospitals requires these hospitals to have a competitive advantage or strengths that can make them a community choice. In providing value to its customers, it's not enough for the hospital to be seen only in

OPEN ACCESS

terms of infrastructure and facilities, but also in terms of service processes in the hospital.

Health workers in hospitals consist of medical personnel, pharmacy personnel, nursing staff, other health workers, and non-health personnel. Without undermining the role of other health workers, nurses are the main force and driving force in services provided by hospitals for all clients for 24 hours [3]. The proportion of nurses in hospitals is 40–60% of other health workers, and nurses also absorb hospital budget of more than 50% [4], but the problem of shortage of nursing staff and the high rate of turnover among nurse are the problems of nursing staff in many hospitals around the world [5].

Globally, the rate of turnover among nurse ranges from 10–21% per the year in all countries [6] and according to *Nursing Management: A Systems Approach* by D. Gillies (1994) [7], the optimum standard for turnover among nurses in a hospital is 10% in a year. High turnover rates have a detrimental effect on hospitals, management, financing, and service quality [8], [9]. Turnover is the flow of entering and leaving the organization among employees that often used as indicators of company performance and easily perceived negatively as a result of the company's effective efficiency policy [10].

The turnover intention of an individual is the worst impact of the organization inability to manage an individual behavior. Turnover will be high if the company is only paying attention to profits, not to the existence of its employees. However, on the opposite situation, turnover will be low if the company pays more attention to its employees, even allocates part of the company's funds to improve employee performance, such as providing regular training to each employee [11].

In Indonesia, turnover rates among nurse are quite high and often occur in private hospitals, because private hospitals are a form of company that has rules, guidelines, and commitments that are regulated internally. On the other hand, the demand for optimal health services for the community requires nurses to work professionally with a high workload [12]. From the several previous research, we can see that its results showing that the number of turnover among nurses in hospitals is quite high. In Ibnu Sina YW-UMI Makassar Hospital, data during 2010–2012 showed that in this three the years, turnover of nurses in Ibnu Sina YW-UMI Makassar Hospital is still high with the percentage for each the year was 15% in the year 2010, 12.87% in the year 2011, and 10.18% in the year 2012 [13]. Besides that, another data from a study was conducted at BaliMed Hospital during 2008–2010 showed an increase in turnover among its nurse, which was 8.68% in the year 2008 to 10.42% in the year 2009, and became 15.76%

in the year 2010 [14]. Study at the Islamic Hospital 'Ibn Sina' Yarsi West Sumatra Bukit Tinggi showed that from 2009–2010, the turnover rate among nurses tended to rise by 21.3% in the year 2009 to 24.3% in the year 2010 [15]. Then, study was conducted at three private hospitals at Medan City, namely Mitra Sejati Hospital, Vina Estetica Hospital, and Imelda Hospital in 2009 showed a high turnover rate among nurses, which found the rate of turnover among nurse for each hospital was 34.88% in Mitra Sejati Hospital, 26.19% in Vina Estetica Hospital, and 24.60% in Imelda Hospital [16]. In Jakarta, preliminary research in several hospitals also found high rates of turnover among nurse. Data from Zahirah Hospital showed that the percentage of turnover among its nurse from April 2009 until April 2010 was 39% [17], while the percentage of turnover among nurse at Atma Jaya Hospital in 2009–2012 was 17.3% in the year 2009, 16.2% in the year 2010, 12.8% in the year 2011, and 30.9% in the year 2012 [18].

Various studies shows that the problem of turnover intention is triggered by the emergence of individual behavior such as job characteristics, work stress, and transformational leadership patterns of a leader that will trigger job satisfaction and organizational commitment [19]. Turnover intention is the desire of an employee to move from one organization to another. There are factors that influence turnover intention, namely job characteristics, perception, leadership, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction [20]. In addition, research done by Hanafiah published in *e-Journal of Psikol* (2014) [21] revealed that the factors that contribute to employees' desire to change jobs are job satisfaction and job insecurity. Other studies were done by Almutairi published in *Int. J. Bus. Manag* (2016) [22] show that transformational leadership has a significant positive effect on organizational commitment.

Based on some of these findings, this study aims to determine predictive modeling to measure the desirability of turnover (turnover intention) among nurse in class C hospital.

2. Methods

This study used a cross-sectional design, with data collection done through using questionnaire measurement tools. Data collection was conducted from March to August 2016 in class C private hospital. For the creation and construction of predictive-oriented models, the data were processed using a variant-based Structural Equation Model (SEM) method or referred to as Smart Partial Least Square/Smart PLS.

3. Results

In accordance with tables 1 and 2, the problem-solving indicators of quality of work derived from the model because it has a loading of less than 0.50 (0.43). The results of AVE in each construct have values above 0.50, which means that each construct is valid, and also the CR (composite reliability) and alpha Cronbach values are all above the value of 0.70, which means it has good reliability (Hair et al., 2016).



Figure 1: Model outer.

In addition, the R^2 value of turnover intention is 0.368444, which can be interpreted that the variability of the turnover intention construct that can be explained by the variability of transformational leadership, job characteristics, and quality of work life is 36.8%, while 63.2% has been explained by other variables exclude variables were researched through this study.

4. Discussion

Based on the results of this study, it is known that the quality of nurses' work life in the hospital has a significant effect on the desire to resign among nurse. When the quality of nurses' work life is good, the desire/intention to resign will be low. This is in accordance with the previous research [23] explained that the positive impact of

TABLE 1: Summary of loading, AVE, CR, Cronbach's Alpha, and R-Square.

Variable	Indicator	Loading	AVE	CR	Cronbach Alpha	R ²
Turnover Intention	Often Thinking Out of Work	0.935581	0.841696	0.940972	0.905848	0.368444
	Desire To seek work outside the organization	0.884863				
	Probably will leave work if there is a better chance	0.931018				
Transformational leadership	Intellectual Stimulation	0.897075	0.830832	0.951542	0.932312	
	Individual Consideration	0.935604				
	Inspirational Motivation	0.924571				
	Idealist Influence	0.887920				
Job Characteristic	Skill Variations	0.632032	0.622566	0.889645	0.864308	0.268135
	Task identity	0.916976				
	Task meaning	0.732836				
	Autonomy	0.696439				
	Feedback	0.922196				
Quality of Work Life	Employee participation	0.773809	0.655332	0.929402	0.910506	
	Career development	0.818980				
	Proud of the company	0.848838				
	Fair compensation	0.742125				
	Facilities gained	0.877871				
	Job security	0.651259				
	Communication	0.922897				

quality of work life is to improve or improve the work situation from the perspective of the hospital nurse and the perspective of the organization or hospital to develop into larger than before, so that there will be a balance between satisfaction in work and the performance of hospital nurses. However, if the quality of work life is low, then a decrease in job satisfaction, a lack of organizational commitment, a non-conductive organizational culture, increased work stress, burnout, long shifts, and work-family conflicts have been identified to make nurses leave their workplaces [24-27].

TABLE 2: Summary of results.

Hypothesis	Original Sample (O)	T-Statistic	Description
Job Characteristics → Self-withdrawal Desire	0.011680	0.111782	Not significant
Transformational Leadership → Job Characteristics	0.517818	9.070924	Significant
Transformational leadership → Self-withdrawal Desire	-0.053659	0.422867	Not significant
Quality of Work Life → Self-withdrawal Desire	-0.568084	5.272966	Significant

From the results of this study, it is also known that there is a considerable indirect effect between transformational leadership through job characteristics on the desire to withdraw hospital nurses. This is consistent with several theories which say that transformational leadership has an influence on employee satisfaction, where with good leadership behavior, nurses will be more satisfied with their working conditions. Then, they will not only be willing to be loyal but also provide the best service with high quality for their patients [28, 29]. In addition, other theories also reinforce that leadership is a science that studies comprehensively about how to direct, influence, and also supervise others to carry out tasks in accordance with the planned orders [30].

The direct influence of transformational leadership on the desirability of self-withdrawal is also illustrated in this study. This is reinforced by the theory that transformational leadership is considered as one of the most effective leadership strategies and more likely to inspire employees to continue working with their organizations compared to other leadership styles [31, 32]. Transformational leadership influences commitment without using rewards or penalties. It directly influences the level of participation and must show the same relationship with participation in the organization. The commitment of organizational members is important for an organization in creating the survival of the organization itself [33, 34].

5. Conclusion

The indirect effect of transformational leadership through job characteristics on the desire for retreat (turnover intention) among nurses in the hospital is the highest influence.

Where to run an organization such as a hospital, it needs a leader with a good capability to carry out operational and non-operational activities. The hospital is a

large organization, it requires great thinking and action as well as effective policies and mature decisions. In accordance with the result of this study, it can be reported that transformational leadership is considered the most effective in the field of nursing and class C hospital management, where nurses feel trust, admiration, loyalty, and respect for leaders, they are motivated to do more than usual.

The suggestion of this research is to increase leadership management from the hospital to be prioritized, and hospital management also needs to pay attention to the quality of work life, in order to achieve a conducive condition of human resources to support the realization of high work productivity both physically and psychologically.

References

- [1] Gillies, D. (1998). *Nursing Management: A Systems Approach* (third edition). Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders Company.
- [2] Ministry of Health of the Republic of Indonesia. (2016). *Accountability Performance Report of Government Agencies in 2016*. Jakarta.
- [3] Gillies, D. (1998). *Nursing Management: A System Approach* (3 Sub-edits). Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders Company.
- [4] Ilyas, Y. (2011). *Hospital HR Planning: Theory, Method and Formula* (revised edition). Depok: Faculty of Public Health, University of Indonesia.
- [5] Rahman, S. M., et al. (2010). Factors affecting recruitment and retention of community health workers in a newborn care intervention in Bangladesh. *Human Resources for Health*, vol. 8, no. 12.
- [6] El-Jardali, F., Dimassi, H., Dumit, N., et al. (2009). A national cross-sectional study on nurses' intent to leave and job satisfaction in Lebanon: Implications for policy and practice. *BMC Nursing*, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 1–13.
- [7] Gillies, D. (1994). *Nursing Management: A Systems Approach* (third edition). W.B. Saunders Company.
- [8] James, J. (2008). Effect of turnover on performance and effectiveness of human resource practices and policies in retention: A case study of hotel industry. *The Journal of Applied Research*, vol. 6, no. 1, pp. 65–78.
- [9] Butali, N. D., Wesang'ula, M. P., and Mamuli, L. C. (2013). Effects of staff turnover on the employee performance of work at Masinde Muliro University of Science and Technology. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 67–74.

- [10] Suhanto, E. (2009). *The Effect of Job Stress and Organizational Climate on Turnover Intention with Job Satisfaction as an Intervening Variable (Study at Bank Internasional Indonesia)*. Diponegoro University.
- [11] Aamodt, M. G. (2007). *Industrial/Organizational Psychology: An Applied Approach* (fifth edition). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth.
- [12] Langitan, R. E. (2010). *Factors Affecting Turnover Events of Executing Nurses at Bhakti Yudha Hospital*. University of Indonesia.
- [13] A. S. (2013). *Factors Related to Turnover Intentions Nurses at Ibn Sina Hospital YW-Umi Makassar*. Hasanuddin University Makassar.
- [14] Faida, E. (2010). *Analysis of the Effect of Subjective Workloads, Perceived Organizational Support, Psychological Atmosphere, Job Satisfaction and Commitments to Process Work Withdrawals at the Muhammadiyah Hospital in Surabaya*. Airlangga University.
- [15] Aryanto. (2011). *Factors Related to Nurses' Turnover Tendency at Islamic Ibn Sina Hospital YARSI, West Sumatra Bukit Tinggi*. Andalas University.
- [16] Tobing, P. (2009). *Effect of Nurse Characteristics and Work Environment on Intention of Turnover Nurses in Private Hospitals in Medan City*. Universitas Sulawesi Utara, Medan.
- [17] Adlin, R. (2010). *Analysis of Factors Related to Nursing Job Satisfaction at the Zahirah Hospital in 2010*. University of Indonesia.
- [18] Muliana, S. (2013). *Factors Affecting the Desire of Moving Nurses at Atma Jaya Hospital Jakarta*. Esa Unggul University.
- [19] Caesary, A. G., Wessiani, N. A., and Santosa, B. (2011). *Factor Analysis that Affects Turnover Intention of Outbound Call Agents of PT. Infomedia Nusantara Uses the Structural Equation Modeling Method*. Surabaya.
- [20] Tamalero, Y., Swasto, B., and Hamid, D. (2012). The influence of job characteristics and job satisfaction on organizational commitment and intention to quit. *J. Provit*, vol. 6, no. 2.
- [21] Hanafiah, M. (2014). The influence of job satisfaction and job insecurity with turnover intentions on employees of PT Buma Suaran Village, Sambaliung District, Berau Regency. *eJournal Psikol.*, vol. 1, no. 3, pp. 303–312.
- [22] Almutairi, D. (2016). The mediating effects of organizational commitment on the relationship between transformational leadership style and job performance. *International Journal of Business & Management*, vol. 11, no. 1.
- [23] Hafizurrachman. (2012). *Development of Predictive Models in Measuring Nurse Performance and Policies in Tangerang Regional General Hospital*. Gajah Mada University.

- [24] De Gieter, S., Hofmans, J., and Pepermans, R. (2011). Revising the impact of job satisfaction and organizational commitment to nurse turnover intention: An individual differences analysis. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, vol. 48, no. 12, pp. 1562–1569.
- [25] Almalki, M. J., Fitzgerald, G., and Clark, M. (2012). The relationship between quality of work life and turnover intention of primary health care nurses in Saudi Arabia. *BMC Health Services Research*, vol. 12, no. 314, pp. 1–11.
- [26] Brewer, C. S., Kovner, C. T., Greene, W., et al. (2012). Predictors of actual turnover in a national sample of newly licensed registered employees in hospitals. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, vol. 68, no. 3, pp. 521–538.
- [27] Mosadeghrad, A. M. (2013). Occupational stress, and turnover intention: Implications for nursing management. *International Journal of Health Policy and Management*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 169–176.
- [28] Mohammed, W. A. A., Tadadej, C., Kittipichai, W., et al. (2014). Relationship between leadership behaviors and job satisfaction among nurses in hospitals of South Kordofan State, Sudan. *Journal of Nursing Science*, vol. 32, no. 4, pp. 70–77.
- [29] Abdelhafiz, I. M., Alloubani, A. M., Khaledeh, M., et al. (2015). Impact of leadership styles among nurses on level of job satisfaction among staff nurses. *European Scientific Journal*, pp. 203–216.
- [30] Fahmi, I. (2013). *Organizational Behavior-Theory, Application and Case* (first edition). Bandung: ALFABETA.
- [31] Wells, J. E. and Peachey, J. W. (2011). Turnover intentions: Do leadership behaviors and satisfaction with the leader matter? *Team Performance Management: An International Journal*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 23–40.
- [32] Renjith, V. and George, A. (2015). Transformational leadership in nursing. *International Journal of Scientific Research and Management*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 112–118.
- [33] Avolio, B. J., Zhu, W., Koh, W., et al. (2004). Transformational leadership and organizational commitment: Mediating role of psychological empowerment and moderating role of structural distance. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, vol. 25, pp. 951–968.
- [34] Judge, T. A. and Piccolo, R. F. (2004). Transformational and transactional leadership: A meta-analytic test of their relative validity. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, vol. 89, no. 5, pp. 755–768.