

Conference Paper

Implementing Holistic Criticism Model Based on Multicultural Approach in Art Appreciation Subject

Iriaji

Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia

Abstract

The practices in our teaching and learning setting suggests that art appreciation subject at school does not emphasize on exploring visual art forms and relevant critics on them as most teachers only present information about the artwork. Such teaching and learning activity cannot effectively improve students' understanding, awareness, and sensitivity towards the cultural diversity that Indonesia owns. In response to this issue, the researcher conducts a research and development study to apply holistic criticism model in teaching art appreciation. The research begins with a preliminary study as a need and content analysis that consists of several stages: (1) identifying the difficulties that teachers face in developing art appreciation subject, (2) exploring relevant references, expert's testimony, and FGD followed by a collaborative work with teachers in the field to decide the conceptual structure to implement holistic criticism model based on multicultural approach in art appreciation. The results show that: (1) the level of difficulty or the problems that hinder the teachers to develop and implement art appreciation subject is quite complex, (2) as an output of the study, the researcher produces a guidebook, a student book, and a worksheet that contain the conceptual structure of holistic criticism model based on multicultural approach.

Corresponding Author: Iriaji,
 email: iriaji_21@yahoo.com

Received: 1 March 2017

Accepted: 27 March 2017

Published: 12 April 2017

Publishing services provided
 by Knowledge E

© Iriaji. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the LSCAC Conference Committee.

Keywords: holistic approach, multicultural, art appreciation

1. Introduction

Webster's New World Dictionary defines "appreciation" as "the state of appreciating something; an ability to understand the worth, quality, or importance of something; making estimation correctly; and being fully aware and sensitive about something". Smith in [9] argued that the definition needs to be clarified. Smith stated that there is a distinction between appreciating and enjoying something. Appreciation requires "logical operation" to make definition, predict the value and provide relevant description about an object; such course of action is not needed when we enjoy an artwork since we tend to use our feeling and sense. However, to construct comprehension which helps us get more emotional satisfaction in enjoying an artwork, logical operation is deemed necessary.

In this case, [16] explained that appreciating an artwork is similar to "sharing the artist's experience" which goes beyond understanding the meaning it carries but

 OPEN ACCESS

knowing more detailed elements making up the artwork itself. Art appreciation is interpreting the idea or intention of the artist. The appreciation of an artwork does not only deal with the impersonal meaning but also the aesthetic aspects relevant to it.

Art appreciation is often correlated to art criticism. Fiaccus in [18] explained how art criticism is commonly adopted in the USA to teach art appreciation. Saini in [10] added that one of the objectives of studying art critiques is to foster our appreciation process to be more critical. There are three assumptions in criticism: criticism for art appreciation, criticism for judgement, criticism as an art itself [2]. Unlike criticism for art appreciation which puts more emphasis on the understanding to enhance sensitivity in order that art can be enjoyed and appreciated, criticism for giving judgment focuses more on giving critical judgment based on argumentation or other scientific rationale based on reliable standard.

In art education, art appreciation subject is aimed at developing students' potential. In [13] explained that basically each person has their own aesthetic awareness which often appears as aesthetic impulse or inner drive. Artwork itself can be regarded as an aesthetic object which stimulates aesthetic response of the observers. It involves psychological aspects and triggers both stimulus and response. By observing an artwork, we can give response and create perception about element of arts. At this point, someone's aesthetic impulse will be stimulated and it is believed to be able to develop understanding, awareness, sensitivity, and aesthetic attitude that lead to the ability to respect, enjoy, and value an artwork as an appreciation. Hence, art appreciation learning should be integrated to arts subject along with expression and creation activities to develop students' aesthetic potential.

Besides fostering students' aesthetic potential, learning art appreciation can develop students' awareness on the artwork and values owned by their country [4]. In [1] explained that within the context of popular arts, art appreciation taught using critical methodology is capable of increasing students' awareness of moral criticism, socio-cultural, and spiritual aspects towards the arts and culture in their surroundings.

The basic pursuit of art appreciation subject taught at school is not only aimed at fostering students' aesthetic potentials but also their personal potentials (mental, physical, emotional, and social). It is also useful to instill the understanding and awareness of the value of their country's national culture as well as to develop the awareness about moral, sociocultural, and spiritual critics for the students.

According to [6], there are three domains within art appreciation: aesthetic theory domain, philosophy of arts, and philosophy of critics. Aesthetic theory domain covers the description of aesthetic attitude which has correlation to aesthetic object. Philosophy of arts domain covers the concepts and sub-concepts of arts as well as their connection to an aesthetic object or an artwork while philosophy of critics domain deals with the description, interpretation and evaluation of an art object being studied

or observed. Aesthetic theory domain is regarded as an attitude-based appreciation while philosophy of arts and philosophy of critics are based on cognitive experience.

In [17] argued that those three domains can be used as the underlying fundamental to develop and determine the concept, content, and principle of art appreciation subject at school based on the objective and level of education. Art appreciation subject based on aesthetic attitude involves more sense and personal feeling to express what the observers feel when studying an art object while art appreciation subject based on cognitive experience is not only aimed at giving enjoyment purpose but also teaching comprehension, awareness, sensitivity, attitude and appreciation towards an artwork.

In [9] suggested that the teaching of art appreciation for middle school is more appropriate using an approach which engages more cognitive experience since it suits students' age development, needs, and interest. Middle school students are more advanced in terms of analytical thinking and their aesthetic awareness can evolve better if teachers facilitate them with cognitive experience to understand the subject. At this level, the observation is not only focused on getting the pleasure from the artwork being studied but also empowering the motivation to understand the meaning of the artwork, for example analyzing how it was created.

One of the models of art appreciation learning based on cognitive experience is holistic criticism model. This model is developed by [18] to teach art appreciation for Javanese culture in middle schools in Indonesia. This model is seen as an effective model to enhance students' awareness, sensitivity and aesthetic feeling towards Indonesian culture.

The development of holistic criticism model in art appreciation subject has strong relevance to the current condition of education in Indonesia that seems to lose its direction. The rapid development of science, technology, economy, social life and culture has created postmodernist way of thinking and social issues which trigger the need of having 'the ideology of social reconstruction'; the demand that art appreciation subject should facilitate children's social and personal development makes it necessary to have art education ideology for children; the needs to have acknowledgement and preservation of Indonesian culture with "pluralism" influence as an entity and identity of Indonesian culture also provides an important reason for having multiculturalism thinking. In response to this condition, we need an alternative model to develop art appreciation subject so that aesthetic experience that students get at school can be holistic and integrated to social life issues (contextualized) using holistic criticism model based on multicultural approach.

The term "multicultural" comes from "multi" which means plural (multidimensional) and "culturalism" which means the knowledge about culture. "Culturalism" does not only acknowledge varying culture but also has implication in politic, law, social, and economy. In [20] stated that pluralism has correlation to democracy principles in the society formed by different communities which have their own rights and custom.

In the education field, the study about multiculturalism focus more on the activities related to race, ethnicity, culture, religion, gender, and social class which contribute to the success of education. In this case, multicultural education is supported to lift the domination of one culture and promote the cultural diversity by being more open towards other culture under the consideration of ethnicity, culture, religion, gender, social class, and certain point of view or circumstance.

In the study of art education, multicultural arts education has particularly greater emphasis on promoting social-cultural and contextual diversity, objected to a disciplined approach that bases its educational programs on western art tradition. The essence of the concept of multicultural art education included in the school curriculum is aimed to build awareness of the students own culture ([14], p. 8). In some conceptual multicultural education in the fine arts is seen as a multicultural spirit to promote cultural diversity through artistic activities, namely through assessment, creation and appreciation of art.

Holistic critique model is a synthesis of the three streams of critics groups (genetic criticism, objective criticism and affective criticism) developed by [7, 12, 15]. The model offers a framework for a holistic critique i.e. a complete critique that includes three components of criticism, with the intention of not merely for the purpose of analysis of the work of art itself (as a factor of intra aesthetic) through perception and description of objective reality art form; but also combined with efforts to find genetic factors and affective factors (as an extra factor aesthetic).

Genetic factors are information relating to the background of the presence of the artwork. According Gotshalk in [19], they include the genetic factors that are subjective and objective in nature. Subjective genetic factors are those relating to the conditions of the artists, e.g. his/her personality, his/her psychological state, his/her taste, his/her skills, his/her experience, his/her goal, his/her sensitivity, his/her imagination, and so on. While objective genetic factors, which related to the background that affects artists, include social environment, neighborhood cultural climate associated with the symbols of culture, a culture of physical environment associated with natural/surrounding materials, processes and techniques of creation and so on. Meanwhile, objective factor is information related to the facts or objective reality existing on the artwork itself. Objective facts of artwork can be obtained from the emission of aesthetic form of art, namely through looking at the elements and examining the relationship of various elements of artworks form a single unit of work. While the affective factor is a real sense of reality and is in itself an observer. The value of the artwork is what is created by the seeker after the capture beams aesthetic value of artwork. Appreciator is seen as an interpreter of contemporary creators of every piece of art that is lived. The quality of appreciation depends on the cultural experience, psychological conditions, and creativity of appreciator. Information includes any affective response that is felt and arisen in appreciator depending on the work being observed.

The tendency of the results of the responses are subjective, but if the pleasure of taste is dependent on the object of the observed work and became associated by external factors related to the elements of aesthetic (color, line, shape, proportion and so on), then the pleasure of taste becomes objectified and arrested aesthetically. This is where the process of interpreting the aesthetic element relationships with genetic factors are synthesized, resulting enjoyment of aesthetic sense.

The initial survey results show that art appreciation subject is likely to be limited to the use of the conventional approach that is implemented using expository approach that emphasizes the presentation of information and knowledge of art appreciation, history or just practice that describe artwork based on the physical aspects of art appreciation. The practices of teaching and learning of art appreciation is not concerned with the active role and critical creativity of students either directly or indirectly upon aesthetic object facts of art events.

Research model of art appreciation subject has been done by several researchers. In [18] tried to develop an art appreciation teaching model in middle school called 'criticisms model'. Between 2001 and 2002, Art Appreciation Education Program (PAS) supported by Ford Foundation also has tested a variety of learning approaches to improve the ability of students to the appreciation of the local art. The study proves that there is body of knowledge, but development holistic model criticism based on multiculturalism that could potentially increase the efforts of planting heritage wisdom values of local cultural arts is under-developed. The issue inspired the need to immediately conduct a research and development based on holistic model of multicultural criticism in learning art appreciation. This begins with preliminary studies as necessity and content analysis, with the aim of: (1) identifying the difficulties of teachers in developing teaching art appreciation, and (2) reviewing literature, consulting experts, conducting FGD and continuing collaboration with teachers in defining the formulation of conceptual structure-based holistic model multicultural learning art appreciation.

2. Method

This study develops an adaptation and modification of models of research and development by [3]. In addition, the study drafts a procedural model developed by [11] conducted through the following stages: (1) the preliminary study stage i.e. need and content analysis, (2) the development stage i.e. the design, development, and evaluation stages, and (3) testing stage i.e. to tryout the effectiveness of the product as a semi-summative evaluation. In this study, an initial phase i.e. the preliminary study stage as needs and content analysis is conducted through a survey.

At this stage of need and content of this analysis, the instruments used include: (1) using closed and open questionnaire used to collect data to illustrate the difficulties,

conditions and needs of cultural art teachers in teaching junior high school art appreciation subject; (2) studying the library document to examine the conceptual underpinnings of the learning model developed for art appreciation subject; (3) recording sheets and the format of FGD consultation with the expert of art education and practitioners of art teaching for developing the conceptual draft of the research product.

Percentage analysis is employed to analyze data on the difficulties, conditions and needs of cultural art teachers in teaching art appreciation subject. The results of consultations and FGD are analyzed descriptive-qualitatively.

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1. Constraints, Condition, and the Need of Teachers towards Art Appreciation Subject

Based on the questionnaires results, it can be seen that the constraints faced by art teachers in middle schools to develop and implement art appreciation learning is still fairly high. The difficulties are in: (1) developing basic competence as the indicators, (2) developing basic competence as the main subject and sub-main subject, (3) developing basic competence as a learning scenario, (4) developing learning model for art appreciation subject, (5) providing and utilizing various instructional media, (6) providing and utilizing art learning resources around the school, (7) motivating students to have their own learning resources, (8) associating and utilizing the learning resources of various local arts, (9) developing an interactive, active, and creative pattern of learning interaction, (10) enhancing the students' ability in art appreciation subject, (11) increasing students' motivation in art appreciation subject, and (12) developing the types of evaluation rubric and instrument for art appreciation subject.

In planning and implementing art appreciation subject, it can be illustrated that: (1) most of art teachers (85%) still use the approach which gives students an introduction to the history of arts, problem discussion, and description of physical aspects, (2) in contrast, only a few of them (15%) use the approach which gives emphasis on the analytical ability, interpretation of meaning, and goes up to the level of appreciating arts holistically; (3) most of art teachers (90%) who plan and implement syntax learning tend to less likely involve the students to be active and creative in following art appreciation process, and (4) mostly (70%), lesson plans developed by art teachers including the indicators, materials, and learning scenarios still tend to follow textbooks so the content of lesson plan is still not sufficient to cover the varieties of both local and national culture.

Most of art teachers (90%) need a competence enhancement to plan and implement art appreciation subject which cover the following sub-competence: (1) developing an art appreciation subject with various methods and techniques in order to improve

Teacher's Activities	Main Steps	Students' Activities
Showing artwork to be responded by students and ask the students' first impression on the artwork (as written on students' tasks)	Step 1: Creating groups to The orientation of students' impression as a group towards the observed artwork	Grouping (4-5 students for each group), explaining the group's first impression towards the observed artwork
Assisting students in analysing the theory/concept/principle of appreciation and guiding them do art appreciation's steps in holistic criticism model	Step 2: Setting the art appreciation steps in holistic criticism model	Analysing the theory/concept/principle and setting the art appreciation's steps in holistic criticism model
Motivating students to describe the genetic factors related to artist's condition or environmental condition that affects them.	Step 3: Finding the genetic information about the observed artwork	As a group, students describe the genetic factors related to artist's condition or environmental condition that affects them.
Motivating students to discover the objective information related to elements that create harmony and unity in the artwork being studied	Step 4: Finding the objective information factor about the observed artwork	As a group, students describe the objective information related to elements that create harmony and unity in the artwork being studied
Motivating students to discover the affective information factor related to all good values in characteristics of aesthetic values or described situation.	Step 5: Finding the affective information factor about the observed artwork	Students in a group describe the affective information factor related to all good values in characteristics of aesthetic values or described situation.
Motivating students to synthesize /combine the previous discoveries as an interpretation matters to compare their artwork or similar artwork by others artists.	Step 6: Synthesis' description	Students in a group synthesize /combine the previous discoveries as an interpretation matters to compare their artwork or similar artwork by other artists.
Helping students in discussing the result of art appreciation. Teacher plays role as experts	Step 7: Presenting the result of art appreciation Enriching the art appreciation material	Presenting the result of art appreciation Discussing the result of art appreciation for each group classically Question and answer
Conducting a test	Step 8: Evaluation	Taking the test

TABLE 1: Art appreciation learning steps in holistic criticism model.

students' active and creative participation, (2) developing an art appreciation learning model that not only involves physical analysis but also analysis on the meaning of sign/symbol interpretation, (3) developing an art appreciation learning model that can synthesize the views critically based on the appreciation towards pluralism, (4) constructing clearer and easier syllabus, lesson plan, model and instrument of art appreciation learning process, (5) developing various, accommodative, and relevant

learning media, and (6) developing various, accommodative, and relevant learning resources for local and national arts. Art teachers in junior high school believe that product's specification of holistic criticism model based on multicultural approach in junior high school that will be developed can enhance the quality of learning result and process in art appreciation.

Based on the developed product's specification, this study has successfully implemented holistic criticism learning model based on multicultural approach in art appreciation subject (adapted and modified from [18]). Through consultation and FGD with experts and practitioners, this study has resulted a syntax learning plan in holistic criticism model based on multicultural approach in art appreciation and has successfully developed learning instrument including teachers' book, students' book, and students' tasks. The syntax of criticism model based on multicultural approach in art appreciation subject can be seen at the following table.

Teacher book that has been created can be teacher's guide to implement the learning process in class. Teacher book consists of lesson plans, which is step by step activities to achieve the learning goals [5, 8]. The developed teacher book consists of concepts, principles, and learning steps as follows: (1) the concept of holistic criticism model in art appreciation subject based on multicultural approach that includes introduction subtitle, scope of learning resources in art appreciation subject, and holistic criticism model in art appreciation subject based on multicultural approach; (2) the developed syllabus; (3) the developed lesson plan, and (4) the examples of art appreciation products.

Based on the consultation with some experts in art education and art teachers, we got the description that the concept of teacher's book draft has been good and appropriate to be used by teachers as the guidance in developing the art appreciation subject in school. There are several suggestions that need to be taken into account: (1) the syntax of the subject needs to be more focused on students' training process of art appreciation, and (2) it is better to complete the teacher's book with supporting details such as power point slides, some artwork as examples, and some art appreciation models.

Student's book that has been created in the form of artwork appreciation materials covers essential information about: (1) the concept of artwork, (2) varieties, characteristics, and artwork samples, (3) examples on how to appreciate artwork, and (4) exercises. Suggestions for the student's book are: (1) it is better to choose simpler and more communicative language so that students can understand it better (2) the cover and layout should be organized to be more appealing by making some improvement on the front cover, layout and adding an object and more colors on the background.

Student exercise book created in this study is a learning instrument that will guide students in the learning process. The developed exercise book includes: (1) objectives, (2) activities in describing and responding to artwork, (3) activities to answer several

questions for group discussion, and (4) project-based activities done through group discussion to describe and respond to artwork based on art appreciation procedures. Suggestions for this exercise books are: (1) the exercise book should be completed with models/examples of art appreciation, (2) the content needs to be simplified and the pictures should be clearer and more attractive.

4. Conclusions and Suggestion

Based on the result of data analysis and discussion, the conclusions are as follows. First, the description of difficulties and problems based on the survey are: (1) the level of difficulties in implementing the learning of art appreciation subject among art teachers in junior high school is still high, (2) the provided facilities and the implementation of the learning of art appreciation subject are considered insufficient to improve quality of process and learning result, (3) the teachers need to improve their competence in advising and implementing learning model for art appreciation subject by using holistic criticism model. Secondly, the products developed based on literature studies, consultation and FGD with experts of art education and art teachers are: (1) conceptual draft of holistic criticism model in art appreciation subject based on multicultural approach; (2) draft of learning instruments (i.e. teachers' book, students' book, and students' tasks). Model and supporting learning media can increase active and creative students' participation in the learning process and also increase the learning result in art appreciation subject with the analytical ability on the meanings of sign/symbol, synthesizing the views critically based on the appreciation of pluralism. The other desired outcomes are increasing students' understanding, awareness, sensitivity, and imposition of aesthetic values towards the various arts and cultures.

Suggestions for the future research are as follows: (1) product's model and learning instruments should be actualized immediately in the form of syllabus and lesson plans based on competence of art appreciation in order to be applicable for teaching and learning process in school, (2) holistic criticism model in art appreciation subject based on multicultural approach should involve students' direct participation in art appreciation activities, for example by assigning them to artworks or art event, associating the understanding of meanings/essences of values towards appreciated artworks and having joyful learning process of art appreciation.

References

- [1] J. D. Andrew, "The major film theories," N. Y., Oxford, 1976.
- [2] C. S. Bangun, Art Criticism, 2001.
- [3] W. R. Borg and M. D. Gall, 1979, Longman Inc., Education Research.

- [4] L. H. Chapman, *Approaches to art in education*, Harcourt Brace Jovanovich Publishers, New York, 1978.
- [5] Depdiknas, *Contextual Approach*, Dirjen Dikdasmen, Jakarta, 2002.
- [6] G. Dickie, *United States of America: the Bobbs*, Merill Company, Inc, United States of America: the Bobbs, 1979.
- [7] E. B. Feldman, *Art as image and idea*, Prentice-Hall, Inc, Englewood Cliffs, NJ, 1967.
- [8] R. M. Gegne and W. W, *Principle of instructional design*, Holt. Reinhard & Waston, New York, 1992.
- [9] A. Hurwitz and S. S. Madedja, *The joyous vision: A source book for elementary art appreciation*. Englewood Cliffs, Prentice-Hall, Inc, New Jersey, 1977.
- [10] S. D. Kartika, (2007). *Art Criticism*. Bandung: Rekayasa Sains.
- [11] S. McKenney, *Computer-based support for science education materials developers in Africa: Exploring potensials*. Doctoral dissertation, Twente [Doctoral, thesis], University of Twente, Twente, 2001.
- [12] G. A. Mittler, (1981), *Learning to look/looking to learn: A proposed approach to art appreciation at the secondary school level*. In George W. Hardiman and Theodore Zernich (Eds.), *Foundations for curriculum development and evaluation in art education* (pp 463-474). Uebana Illinois: Stipes Publishing Company.
- [13] Read. Herbert, *Art and society*, Schocken Books, New York, 1974.
- [14] Salam., "Tracing the Purpose of Art Education at School," in *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan*, vol. 9, 2003, Januari, 2003.
- [15] R. A. Smith, "Aesthetic criticism: The method of aesthetic education," in *Concepts in art and education: An anthropology of current issue*, Pappas and George, Eds., The Macmillan Company, London, 1970.
- [16] S. Sumartono, "Visual Pollution in the Context of Conflicting Design Requirements," *ITB Journal of Visual Art and Design*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 187-196, 2009.
- [17] A. J. Soehardjo, "Art education from concept to program., Malang," *Jurusan Seni dan Desain FS-UM*, 2005.
- [18] H. Sutopo, *A model of art cricism for teaching appreciation of Javanese traditional art in Indonesia*. Unpublished Doctoral dissertation [Doctoral, thesis], Florida: The Florida State University, 1987.
- [19] H. Sutopo, (1990). *Structure of holistic critique: An introduction to open and flexible art criticism*. Paper presented in Seminar dan Lokakarya Penelitian Kualitatif Masalah-Masalah Kesenian di Jurusan PSRK-FPBS-IKIP Surabaya, 22-23 January 1990.
- [20] H. A. R, *Multiculturalism, The Future Global Challenges of the Future in Education Transformation*, Grasindo, Jakarta, 2004.