

IDENTIFYING MODERATE VALUES IN THE TEXTBOOK OF *SEJARAH KEBUDAYAAN ISLAM* FOR THE 6TH GRADE OF *MADRASAH IBTIDAIYAH* IN INDONESIA

Sibawaihi¹, Mansour Ibrahim Altamimi², Muqowim³,
Siti Nursheila Khairuddin Yap⁴

UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia^{1,3},
Imam Mohammad Ibn Saud Islamic University, Saudi Arabia², Malaysia National
Institute of Educational Management and Leadership Sarawak Branch, Malaysia⁴
E-mail: sibawaihi@uin-suka.ac.id¹, mihussain@imamu.edu.sa²,
muqowim@uin-suka.ac.id³, sitinursheila@iab.moe.gov.my⁴

DOI: 10.14421/al-bidayah.v13i1.646

ABSTRACT

The study investigates the implementation of the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* in the textbook of *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam* for the 6th Grade of *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* in Indonesia. By library research using content analysis, the authors conclude that the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* are very relevant to the character education that is currently being rolled out and promoted by the Indonesian government. There are nine values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* demonstrated through the storytelling in the textbook: *tawassuṭ* (taking the middle path), *tasāmuḥ* (tolerance), *musāwāh* (egalitarian/non-discrimination), *shūrā* (deliberations), *i'tidāl* (straight and firm), *iṣlāḥ* (reform), *aulawīyyah* (prioritizing priorities), *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* (dynamic and innovative), and *taḥaddud* (civilized). The authors suggest that the textbook's Core Competencies and Basic Competencies need to be expanded to cover all the values included in the story. In addition, proportionally, all the values need to be put because there is no value explained to be much more dominant than others.

Keywords: character education; *Islām wasaṭiyyah*; madrasah ibtidaiyah (Islamic elementary school); moderate Islam; *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam* (Islamic history)

INTRODUCTION

In the Muslim world, respect for differences is not something new but is a teaching of Islam itself.¹ In history, mutual respect and tolerance towards differences had given rise to a new phase for Islamic civilization. This phase is known as the golden age of Islam, when Muslim scientists from various disciplines created discoveries contributing to science development.² This respect and tolerance in the Islamic world sparked the authors' interest in highlighting the moderation of Islam and its implementation in learning in the Islamic educational institution. It is assumed that inculcation of moderate values in students' learning will sooner or later affect their mindset in seeing diversity.

¹ Seyyed Hossein Nasr, *Islam: Religion, History, and Civilization* (San Francisco: Harper-San Francisco, 2003), xviii-xix.

² Oliver Leaman, *An Introduction to Medieval Islamic Philosophy* (Cambridge University Press, 1985).



In highlighting the moderate values in Islamic education institutions, this study investigates the implementation of the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* in *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* (Islamic Primary School) in Indonesia. Regardless of its multidimensional definitions,³ *Islām wasaṭiyyah* is identical to moderate Islam.⁴ In Indonesia, the term *Islām wasaṭiyyah* has recently been echoed. Several sources inspired the term *Islām wasaṭiyyah* in Indonesia. Such as the term strengthening of religious moderation, which the Ministry of Religious Affairs introduced;⁵ the recommendation of the Indonesian Ulema Council (*Majelis Ulama Indonesia*/MUI) for practicing it;⁶ and a meeting of global Muslim leaders in May 2018 that encouraged to implement it.⁷

Moderate values in Islam have generally been studied theoretically to respond to radical understandings in the Muslim world or accommodate ideas that aim to uphold inclusiveness.⁸ This study is not one of the two, but rather research directed at identifying the moderate Islamic values in a textbook. It directs study to the textbook of *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*—literally meaning History of Islam for the 6th Grade of Islamic Primary School—by the consideration, that textbook is a representative object to look the curriculum and student learning materials in school. The selection of the 6th grade is based on the fact that it is the final grade for the primary school level. This study answers these questions: What is the significance of the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* for the learning of *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* students? How is the implementation of those values in the textbook? After answering these questions, the authors try to criticize the textbook, hoping that it can improve learning material to cultivate moderate values.

³ Joshua T. White, “Beyond Moderation: Dynamics Of Political Islam In Pakistan,” *Contemporary South Asia* 20, no. 2 (June 1, 2012): 179–94, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2012.670200>.

⁴ Muhamadul Bakir Bin Hj Yaakub and Khatijah Binti Othman, “A Conceptual Analysis of Wasatiyyah (Islamic Moderation-IM) from Islamic Knowledge Management (IKM) Perspective,” *Revelation and Science* 7, no. 1 (July 3, 2017), <https://journals.iium.edu.my/revival/index.php/revival/article/view/189>.

⁵ Redaksi Pendis Kementerian Agama RI, “Kemenag Perkuat Moderasi Beragama bagi Guru, Kepala dan Pengawa Madrasah Poso” (2019), retrieved from <http://www.pendis.kemenag.go.id/new/2019/07/23/kemenag-perkuat-moderasi-beragama-bagi-guru-kepala-dan-pengawas-madrasah-poso/>.

⁶ Laily Rahmawaty, “MUI Terus Sosialisasikan Islam Wasathiyah” (2019), retrieved from [https://www.antaranews.com/berita/917063/mui-terus-sosialisasikan-islam-wasathiyah#:~:text=%22MUI%20sebagai%20lembaga%20yang%20mengarahkan,Senin%20\(17%2F6\)](https://www.antaranews.com/berita/917063/mui-terus-sosialisasikan-islam-wasathiyah#:~:text=%22MUI%20sebagai%20lembaga%20yang%20mengarahkan,Senin%20(17%2F6).).

⁷ Intan Umbari Prihatin, “KTT Ulama dan Cedikiawan Muslim Dunia, Jokowi Dorong Lahirnya Wasattiyah Islam” (2018), retrieved from <https://www.merdeka.com/peristiwa/ktt-ulama-dan-cedikiawan-muslim-dunia-jokowi-dorong-lahirnya-wasattiyah-islam.html>.

⁸ Abdul Halim Syihab and Asmawati Muhamad, “Reviving The Wasatiyyah Values For Inter-Religious Harmony In Plural Societies,” *Journal of Al-Tamaddun* 12, no. 2 (December 30, 2017): 13–24, <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol12no2.2>.

RESEARCH METHODS

The study aimed to investigate the implementation of the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* in the textbook of *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam* for the 6th Grade of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah in Indonesia. This research is qualitative research that focuses on library research. In library research, a study that “needs only ingenuity”⁹ in analyzing and presenting data relies on books as the primary data source. In this case, the textbook of *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI* was chosen to be the research object.¹⁰ Since studying only one book as the primary source in-depth, this study uses the content analysis method to identify moderate Islam values through the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah*. Content analysis is an analysis method that is very commonly used in studies of literature.¹¹ It is “a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from texts (or other meaningful matter) to the contexts of their use.”¹² Similar to this definition, Weber defines content analysis as a research method using a set of procedures to make valid inferences from the text.¹³ Thus, this content analysis has been used to conduct an in-depth study of the book. Parts of the main procedures applied in this study are the description, interpretation, and conclusion of relevant text data in the book.

As for the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah*, which are referred to as moderate Islamic values, they are based on the formulation offered by MUI, which contains ten *wasatiyyah* values: *tawassuṭ*, *tawāzun*, *tasāmuḥ*, *musāwah*, *shūrā*, *i’tidāl*, *iṣlāḥ*, *aulawiyah*, *taṭāwur wa ibtikār*, and *taḥaddur*.¹⁴ *Tawassuṭ* means taking the middle way,¹⁵ standing in the middle without taking sides with specific interests. Implementing the *tawassuṭ* value means upholding justice based on common interests. *Tawāzun* is meant more or less as a balanced attitude,¹⁶ namely the ability to control oneself to be balanced. *Tawāzun* value

⁹ Barney G. Glaser and Anselm L. Strauss, *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research* (New Brunswick & London: Aldine Transaction, 1999), 167.

¹⁰ Written by Suhailid and edited by Patoni, the book was published by the Ministry of Religious Affairs, Republic of Indonesia, in 2020.

¹¹ Marilyn Domas White and Emily E Marsh, “Content Analysis: A Flexible Methodology,” *Library Trends* 55, no. 1 (2006): 22–45, <https://doi.org/10.1353/lib.2006.0053>.

¹² Klaus Krippendorff, *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2004), 18.

¹³ Robert Philip Weber, *Basic Content Analysis* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1985).

¹⁴ Komisi Informasi dan Komunikasi MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah” (2018), retrieved from <https://mui.or.id/produk/infografis/23935/definisi-islam-wasathiyah/>; Khairuddin Tahmid, “Esensi Dakwah Islam Wasathiyah” (2018/6/29), retrieved from <https://www.nu.or.id/post/read/92288/esensi-dakwah-islam-wasathiyah;%20>.

¹⁵ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

¹⁶ Tahmid, “Esensi Dakwah Islam Wasathiyah.”

has a relationship with the *tawassuṭ* one as both are related to justice. Implementing the *tawāzun* value means balancing oneself to be impartial, not leaning to the right or left. *Tasāmuḥ* is meant as tolerance in dealing with diversity.¹⁷ Implementing it means respecting all kinds of differences. One who is incapable of appreciating differences does not deserve this value.

Musāwah means non-discriminatory or egalitarian.¹⁸ Implementing it means having the ability to view all people equally without differentiating them from their social, cultural, religious, and political backgrounds. It is related to the *tasāmuḥ* value in terms of the diversity that must be appreciated. Also related to *musāwah* are *shūrā* and *iṣlāḥ*. *Shūrā* means deliberation,¹⁹ in which it is required to be democratic and respect diversity.²⁰ As for *iṣlāḥ*, it means reform,²¹ a value that “prioritizes reformative principles to achieve better conditions that accommodate the changes and progress of the times”²² One practicing it always thinks of making continuous improvements, including solving all problems.

I’tidāl means straight and firm.²³ Implementing it means holding on to something right in a straight, responsible, and firm manner. People who have *i’tidāl* values can be firm, not easily swayed, and are always balanced in their position. It is closely related to other three values: *aulawiyah*, *taṭāwur wa ibtikār*, and *taḥaḍḍur*. The *aulawiyah* value means prioritizing the priorities²⁴ by putting forward things that have more benefits. Implementing it means prioritizing public interests more than personal and group interests. *Taṭāwur* means dynamic and *ibtikār* means innovative.²⁵ Both are oriented towards development or change attitudes for the better. In which under *taṭāwur*, one always wishes to develop, and under *ibtikār*, one is always innovative and creative. The last one is *taḥaḍḍur* or civility value.²⁶ The civility referred to here is obtained not solely by relying on intellectual intelligence but also on emotional intelligence. According to

¹⁷ Tahmid, “Esensi Dakwah Islam Wasathiyah.”

¹⁸ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

¹⁹ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

²⁰ Raymond William Baker, “Worldly Islam: The Islamic ‘Wasathiyah’ And The Quest For Democracy,” *Oriente Moderno* 87, no. 2 (2007): 327–54, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25818130>.

²¹ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

²² Tahmid, “Esensi Dakwah Islam Wasathiyah.”

²³ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

²⁴ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

²⁵ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

²⁶ MUI, “Definisi Islam Wasathiyah.”

Goleman,²⁷ it is the primary success determinant in life as it enables people to have self-awareness, emotional management, motivation, empathy, and social skills.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

RESULT

The Significance of the Values of Islām Wasatiyyah for Students of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah

Given that the Indonesian nation is so pluralistic and vulnerable to extremism and radicalism,²⁸ the values of *Islām wasatiyyah*, as described above, seem to be a necessity. These values are consistent and in line with the character education, currently the government's flagship and priority program.²⁹

As a religious education institution that teaches Islamic values, *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* is the initial stage for students to recognize values that promote noble character. Therefore, in the context of religion, the values of *wasatiyyah* or moderation in religion need to be habituated. The best habituation process is carried out from an early age and is maintained until adulthood because a person's character has begun to form from an early age.³⁰ In history, these *wasatiyyah* values had been practiced by Muslims who were aware of the progress of their civilization.³¹ This phenomenon can be seen in the practices carried out by the *Wali Songo* as in the book, which will be explained in the next session.

Islām wasatiyyah is the identity of the teachings of Islam itself.³² Based on the verses of the Quran, the term *wasatiyyah* is identical with a balanced, just, and intermediate approach in a plural society without surpassing constraints, not extreme in the matter of religion, and not ignoring obligations as a vicegerent of Allah on earth.³³

²⁷ Daniel Goleman, *Emotional Intelligence* (New York: Bantam Books, 1995).

²⁸ Sjafrin Sairin, "Disintegrasi Sosial : Sebuah Tinjauan Budaya," *Humaniora* 12, no. 3 (August 3, 2012): 306–12, <https://doi.org/10.22146/jh.703>.

²⁹ Maemonah Maemonah, "Implementasi Pendidikan Karakter di Madrasah/Sekolah," *Al-Bidayah : jurnal pendidikan dasar Islam* 7, no. 1 (2015), <https://doi.org/10.14421/al-bidayah.v7i1.151>.

³⁰ Lawrence J. Schweinhart, *Significant Benefits: The High/Scope Perry Preschool Study through Age 27* (Ypsilanti, MI: High/Scope Press, 1993).

³¹ Mohammad Hashim Kamali, *The Middle Path of Moderation in Islam: The Qur'anic Principle of Wasatiyyah* (Oxford & New York: Oxford University Press, 2015); Syihab and Muhamad, "Reviving the Wasatiyyah Values for Inter-Religious Harmony in Plural Societies," 15-17.

³² Muhammad Asad, *The Message of the Qur'an* (Gibraltar: Dar al-Andalus, 1980); see also his *The Road to Mecca*, 4th rev. ed. (Louisville, KY: Fons Vitae, 1980), 305.

³³ Bakir and Othman, "A conceptual analysis of wasatiyyah (Islamic Moderation-IM) from Islamic Knowledge Management (IKM) perspective," 23.

The term *Islām wasaṭiyyah* has now been used in various fields “such as linguistic, socio-psychologies, social development and human capital development in Islam, either within the scope of religious contexts or sociopolitical strategies.”³⁴ Because of their characteristics, the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* endorse the propagation of love for the universe (*rahmah lī al-‘ālamīn*). Therefore they can serve as a model not just for Muslims but also for the rest of humanity. The values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* becomes a spirit in every step so that those who can understand and practice them should be able to become agents of *rahmah lī al-‘ālamīn*. By such understanding, in Islamic education institutions, especially madrasah, the educational process should lead to the formation of literate individuals of *wasatiyyah* values, namely having knowledge and experience of *wasatiyyah* values and living these values in everyday life.

Nevertheless, it seems this hope has not fully occurred in the *madrasah*. Several indicators regarding this include the emphasis on cognitive aspects of religion, which tends to dominate.³⁵ Even though it emphasizes the cognitive aspects, reasoning on religious issues still lacks attention. Appreciation of religious practices is not emphasized,³⁶ and religion is still used as a context of justification, not a context of discovery in which religious values inspire self-and-others’-transformation.³⁷ If this phenomenon occurs continuously, it is feared that religion will lose its vital role even in *madrasahs* themselves.

The Implementation of the Values of Islām Wasaṭiyyah in the Textbook

The book *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI* consists of nine chapters that tells the story of nine well-known saints (*Wali Songo*) in the Archipelago (Indonesia): Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Sunan Ampel, Sunan Giri, Sunan Bonang, Sunan Drajat, Sunan Kalijaga, Sunan Muria, Sunan Kudus, dan Sunan Gunung Jati. This book outlines a biography of the figure in each chapter. In addition, the chapters in this book also present the role of the figure in developing Islam in Indonesia. The positive attitude of the figure

³⁴ Bakir and Othman, “A conceptual analysis of wasatiyyah (Islamic Moderation-IM) from Islamic Knowledge Management (IKM) perspective,” 21-22.

³⁵ Fathul Lubabin Nuqul et al., “‘Cognition Without Affection’: Refleksi Program Akselerasi di Madrasah,” *Psikoislamika: Jurnal Psikologi dan Psikologi Islam* 10, no. 2 (December 30, 2013), <https://doi.org/10.18860/psi.v10i2.6365>.

³⁶ See Ahmad Qodri Azizy, *Pendidikan (Agama) untuk Membangun Etika Sosial: Mendidik Anak Sukses Masa Depan, Pandai dan Bermanfaat* (Semarang: Aneka Ilmu, 2002).

³⁷ See Budhy Munawar-Rachman, *Argumen Islam untuk Liberalisme, Islam Progresif dan Perkembangan Diskursusnya* (Jakarta: Grasindo, 2010).

is also presented in each chapter. Before explaining those chapters, the book describes Core Competencies (*Kompetensi Inti*) and Basic Competencies (*Kompetensi Dasar*) that become the standards set to be achieved by students of the 6th grade *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*. This description is given for both Odd Semester and Even Semester.³⁸

Basic Competency is the ability to achieve Core Competency that students must acquire through learning.³⁹ We have observed the statements in the book's Core Competencies, and there are at least four values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* contained in them. First, the statement "Accepting, implementing, and respecting the teachings of the religion they adhere to"⁴⁰ shows the *tasāmuḥ* (tolerance) value which in its Basic Competence is shown in the narration of all the figures. Next, the statement "Showing honest behavior, discipline, responsibility, courteous, caring, and confident in interacting with family, friends, teachers, and neighbors and loving the country"⁴¹ shows the *i'tidāl* value, which is straight and firm. Then, the statement "Understanding factual and conceptual knowledge by observing, questioning, and trying based on curiosity about himself, God's creatures and their activities, and the objects they find at home, at school, and at play"⁴² shows *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* (dynamic and innovative) values. Lastly, the statement "Presenting factual and conceptual knowledge in a clear, systematic, and logical language in aesthetic works, in movements that reflect healthy children, and in actions that reflect the behavior of children who have faith and noble character"⁴³ shows the *taḥaddur* (civilized) value. However, based on the author's investigation, in various parts, this book in principle covers not only those four values but also four other values. These are indicated as in the following identification:

First is *tawassuṭ* value, and second is *shūrā* value. Both *tawassuṭ* values and *shūrā* values are touches upon in only one occasion in the book, namely when telling the story of Maulana Malik Ibrahim. In this instance, the saint is described as someone who always "became a peacemaker when he met a disputing society."⁴⁴ This peacemaker means

³⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI* (Jakarta: Kementerian Agama RI, 2020), viii-xiii.

³⁹ Regulation of Minister of Education and Culture, Republic of Indonesia, No. 24, 2016, about Core Competence and Basic Competence in the 2013 Curriculum for Primary School and Secondary School.

⁴⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, viii & ix.

⁴¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, viii & ix.

⁴² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, viii & x.

⁴³ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, ix & x.

⁴⁴ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 6.

someone who made peace efforts using dialogue or deliberation, which means he implemented *shūrā* value. In principle, the effort that the figure made can also be included to implement the *tawassuṭ* value, taking the middle path. In the Indonesian context, dialogue or deliberation is needed “to achieve the country’s goals.”⁴⁵

The third is *tasāmuḥ* value. Almost all of the figures narrated in this book are associated with tolerant behavior. They did tolerant behavior during their lifetime. In the story, Maulana Malik Ibrahim is described as a figure who always maintained good relations with the broader community and the rulers of the Majapahit Kingdom. In this relationship, the saint respected all the traditions held by the community and the kingdom. In turn, he was appointed to be the king’s advisor and the royal minister.⁴⁶ Sunan Ampel is described as a figure who preached Islam “in peaceful, moderate, tolerant ways, and adapted to the existing community traditions that contain Islamic values.”⁴⁷ In carrying out this *dakwah*, the next saint, Sunan Giri, sometimes “gathered people together in traditional events such as *selamatan* (pray for salvation). At times like this, Sunan Giri conveyed the teachings of Islam, which gradually they were able to accept themselves voluntarily without coercion.”⁴⁸

Sunan Bonang has a unique experience. It is described that when initially violence was carried out in conveying Islamic teachings, Sunan Bonang faced resistance from the community and resulted in failure. Therefore, he then changed it into polite ways by trying to understand the traditions of society first and then inserted Islamic values into them. *Tantrayana* religious rituals, for example, were transformed into a circle of *kenduri* or *selamatan* (pray for salvation), which was filled with the recitation of *dhikr* and prayers.⁴⁹ Sunan Muria also used this method. “The tradition of feasting, reciting *dhikr*, *tahlil*, and prayers for Muslims who have died on the third day (*nelung ndina*), the fortieth day (*matang puluh*), the hundredth day (*nyatus*), until the thousandth day (*nyewu*) was not prohibited. He replaced the tradition of burning incense, reciting *mantras*, with the recitation of prayers, *salawat*, and alms.”⁵⁰

⁴⁵ Asfa Widiyanto, “Islam, Multiculturalism And Nation-Building In The Post-Truth Age: The Experience Of Indonesia,” *Journal of Al-Tamaddun* 14, no. 1 (June 14, 2019): 1–12, <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol14no1.1>.

⁴⁶ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 6-12.

⁴⁷ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 22.

⁴⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 37.

⁴⁹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 50.

⁵⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 88.

Meanwhile, Sunan Kudus received resistance and bad treatment from the community, but that did not stop him from approaching the community. “Together with the community, he built mosques, holy minarets, and *padasan* or ablution places using an architecture that adopted Hindu-Buddhist architecture.”⁵¹ He pioneered religious tolerance by “prohibiting the slaughter of cows during *qurban* (*Eid al-Adha*) worship. This prohibiting was done as a form of tolerance to the teachings of other religions that positioned cows as respected and sacred animals.”⁵² Sunan Gunung Jati showed similar behavior. “Sunan Gunung Jati also respect to different cultures and traditions that came from outside and individuals of different religions”.⁵³ Thus, the guardians have practiced tolerance. They carried out the tolerance by “accepting differences as factual” and “being involved with others in differences and variations”.⁵⁴

Fourth is *musāwah* value. This book reveals and explains the *musāwah* value even though not many specifics are found. This value is described as being practiced by Sunan Ampel and Sunan Gunung Jati throughout the authors’ investigation. Raden Rahmat, another name for Sunan Ampel, is described as “a leader who embraced [all the people] regardless of caste and position.”⁵⁵ Sunan Ampel’s position as king or regent at that time made it easy for him to mingle with all people from any circle regardless of their background or social status.

Sunan Gunung Jati was also depicted as a ruler who respected all different traditions and cultures by respecting each individual regardless of their social background and religious affiliation.⁵⁶ In this connection, there are similarities between these two saints in terms of their background as rulers, allowing them to mingle with many people and treat them equally and egalitarian. Upholding egalitarian character is an indispensable behavior in the implementation of *wasatiyyah* values.⁵⁷

⁵¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 96.

⁵² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 98.

⁵³ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 116.

⁵⁴ Rahman, Nur Farhana Abdul, and Khadijah Mohd Khambali. “Religious Tolerance in Malaysia: Problems and Challenges.” *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 3 (2013): 81. <https://doi.org/10.24035/ijit.3.2013.007>.

⁵⁵ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 24.

⁵⁶ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 116.

⁵⁷ Syihab and Muhamad, “Reviving the Wasatiyyah Values for Inter-Religious Harmony in Plural Societies,” 15-17.

Fifth is *i'tidāl* value. Besides meaning straight and firm, as explained above, *i'tidāl* can also be understood as responsibility. This value is demonstrated through at least three saints: Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Sunan Bonang, and Sunan Gunung Jati. It is described that Maulana Malik Ibrahim was a figure who was sincere and responsible in conveying Islamic teachings so that “with his sincerity and responsibility, ... he got the trust of the community,”⁵⁸ although he was regarded as “a propagator of the new religion.”⁵⁹ Sunan Bonang is also described as a persistent and tenacious saint in delivering *dakwah* despite being hostile to Bhairawa-Tantrana teaching figures. “This condition did not make him resign from developing Islamic preaching. He changed the strategy of preaching through arts and culture that were popular with the community.”⁶⁰ This effort means that Sunan Bonang did not give up easily in doing something. So did Sunan Gunung Jati, who “had a great influence on the development of Islam in Indonesia.”⁶¹ His consistency and responsibility as king in Cirebon in delivering Islamic *dakwah* made Islam developed rapidly.

Sixth is *iṣlāḥ* value. The *iṣlāḥ* value is also discussed in this book, even though the authors assume it was not explicitly intended to cover the value of reform. There is one place where this value is alluded to, namely when describing the figure of Maulana Malik Ibrahim. This saint is described as someone who could change the economy of society who lived in the north coast of Gresik by teaching the community to change the way they irrigated their rice fields through irrigation techniques.⁶² Apart from that, this book also alludes to Sunan Kudus, which “taught [the public] things related to daily life such as blacksmiths and other carpentry tools.”⁶³ This book was not accompanied by an explanation of the impact of the effort from an economic perspective. The explanation about the impact of the effort on increasing the community’s economic welfare was also not accompanied. However, in this connection, based on the stories told in the book, the authors believe that all the figures carried out reforms in their time by the assumption that they were able to change society from one condition to another. In the sense that

⁵⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 6.

⁵⁹ G. Coedes, *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*, ed. Walter F. Vella (Canberra: Australian National University Press, 1975), 241.

⁶⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 49.

⁶¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 113.

⁶² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 10.

⁶³ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 96.

there was a transformation carried out by them to improve the quality of life of the community, that is not easy to do.⁶⁴ A person who adheres to *iṣlāḥ* value will always think of making continuous improvements in various things, and all the figures in the book have shown this.

Seventh is *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* values. The *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* values are found to be most demonstrated in the book. Maulana Malik Ibrahim “learned the local language to facilitate communication and fluency in his preaching so that in a relatively short time Maulana Malik Ibrahim can adapt to the community....” “Sunan Ampel had an important role in forming kinship networks through the marriage of Islamic propagators with the daughters of the rulers of the Majapahit kingdom. This strategy was what made Islam gradually stronger and got the support of the rulers.”⁶⁵ Sunan Giri, before building the *pesantren*, “conducted trading businesses belonging to his adoptive mother, Nyi Ageng Pinatih [a rich merchant]. He carried out trading expeditions in the Java region and other areas such as Makassar. He undertook Islamic preaching while trading until finally, he decided to establish a *pesantren*.”⁶⁶ Nyi Ageng Pinatih was his adoptive mother.⁶⁷ “In its development, the *pesantren* taught various kinds of knowledge such as religion, culture, art, economy.”⁶⁸ Sunan Giri, who was also the ruler of Giri, also “developed open education for the community”⁶⁹ and “utilized performing arts as a medium of preaching.”⁷⁰ All the ways and strategies that were implemented show that those figures were very dynamic and innovative in conveying Islamic teachings in a society with different traditions and cultures.

The strategy shown by Sunan Bonang was to take advantage of the public’s admiration for him, where he was known as a “figure with lots of talents,”⁷¹ for example, he was “very good at finding water sources in places where water was scarce.”⁷² Apart

⁶⁴ Haridimos Tsoukas and Demetrios B. Papoulias, “Understanding Social Reforms: A Conceptual Analysis,” *Journal of the Operational Research Society* 47, no. 7 (July 1, 1996): 853–63, <https://doi.org/10.1057/jors.1996.111>.

⁶⁵ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 21.

⁶⁶ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 31.

⁶⁷ M.C. Ricklefs, *A History of Modern Indonesia since c.1300, 2nd Edition* (London: MacMillan, 1991), 10.

⁶⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 33.

⁶⁹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 34.

⁷⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 35.

⁷¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 46.

⁷² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 46.

from that, he also took advantage of his mastery of “arts and culture”⁷³ through his literary work *Suluk Wujil*.⁷⁴ Sunan Drajat also utilized his expertise in the arts, especially puppets and songs.⁷⁵ This creative and innovative strategy was applied to convey Islamic teachings to the community. This creativity is also evident in Sunan Kalijaga, who was also good at playing puppets wherein every performance was held, and he did not charge a fee.⁷⁶ The show was sought to “combine local culture and Islam.”⁷⁷ Similar to Sunan Kalijaga, Sunan Muria faced “people who still adhered to Hinduism and Buddhism and had strong Javanese traditions. Religious traditions were not immediately eliminated, but they were given Islamic colors and developed into new religious traditions under Islamic values.”⁷⁸ Sunan Kudus had also adopted the use of arts and culture in his strategy to teach Islamic values.⁷⁹ Thus, these saints kept the old traditions and then interpreted them in the direction of a new understanding by Islamic teachings. Apart from utilizing arts and culture, Sunan Kudus also “taught things related to everyday life such as blacksmiths and other woodworking tools.”⁸⁰ Because of the various strategies adopted by Sunan Kudus, it is said that he was “a creative figure who always thought to look for unique ways to attract public sympathy.”⁸¹ As for Sunan Gunung Jati used the *Kraton* (the Palace) as a center for arts and culture with religious nuances by not eliminating Hindu-Buddhist elements but integrating it harmoniously to Islamic teachings so that all residents of the Pasundan land embraced Islam.”⁸²

Eighth is *tahaddur* value. Apart from the *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* and *tasāmuḥ* values, the *tahaddur* value is also one of the values whose implementation is most often shown in the book. Maulana Malik Ibrahim showed an attitude of “polite and generous in conveying his preaching. This attitude was shown when trading by holding a cheap market, and always gave alms to the poor.”⁸³ In conveying this Islamic teaching, Sunan Ampel also showed a “polite and wise attitude without insulting other opinions and

⁷³ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 48.

⁷⁴ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 49.

⁷⁵ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 56-60.

⁷⁶ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 73.

⁷⁷ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 75.

⁷⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 84.

⁷⁹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 96.

⁸⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 96.

⁸¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 104.

⁸² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 115.

⁸³ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 11.

religions.”⁸⁴ Such a similar attitude was also shown by Sunan Bonang, who changed his preaching style, which was previously pursued through violence “like destroying statues that were revered by the community.”⁸⁵ Such a method of violence turned out to “create conflict, and many public figures were hostile to him.”⁸⁶

Meanwhile, Sunan Drajat is described as someone who had severe concern for the poor. Even this concern had become his primary concern in his closeness to society.⁸⁷ Sunan Muria showed an unpretentious and straightforward lifestyle where he “chose to live in a remote area, far from cities and centers of power. He associated with the marginalized community.”⁸⁸ He was also known to be generous.⁸⁹ Sunan Kudus is a familiar figure and has a “polite speech style and noble character.”⁹⁰ Sunan Gunung Jati is described as a figure who respected humanity’s values. In delivering a statement, he did so with “respect for the rights of others, and it was based on compassion amid cultural and ethnic diversity.”⁹¹ Thus, almost all the figures narrated in this book are described as implementing this *tahaddud* value.

Ninth is *aulawiyah*. This value has not been exposed much in this book. There is only one place when it says that Sunan Drajat “prioritizes improving the welfare of the community.”⁹² This value is following his character, who has been known as a figure who had a social soul and has concern for the lives of the poor. This figure preferred one particular attitude or goal over others, indicating that he was applying the *aulawiyah* value or the value that prioritizes priorities.

DISCUSSION

The implementation of the values of *Islām wasatīyyah* in the lives of those nine figures is very relevant to be taught for students of the 6th Grade of *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* because those figures are those who come from none other than the Archipelago. This finding shows that the implementation of Islamic values does not have to be exemplified

⁸⁴ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 24.

⁸⁵ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 46.

⁸⁶ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 46.

⁸⁷ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 57; see also Agus Sunyoto, *Atlas Wali Songo* (Jakarta: Pustaka Iman, 2016), 309.

⁸⁸ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 88.

⁸⁹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 88.

⁹⁰ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 96.

⁹¹ Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 116.

⁹² Suhailid, *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*, 57.

by figures from Arabs because there are also many figures from the Archipelago homeland who can imitate their behaviors and attitudes. Studying historical figures from within the country can also enrich insights into the pluralistic culture of the nation. As shown in the book, those figures faced various traditions and cultures, which were then interacted with and integrated into Islam. However, there are not many historical records covering the guardians, let alone published in international forums, so this content analysis study seems quite monotonous without significant comparisons.

This book is interesting because it is also equipped with descriptions of core and basic competencies and stories. This finding shows its characteristics as a textbook that becomes a guide for students. In describing the core competencies and basic competencies, the authors look that of the ten values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah*, and there are only four values that are directly covered: *tasāmuḥ* (tolerance), *i'tidāl* (straight and firm), *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* (dynamic and innovative), and *taḥaḍḍur* (civilized). Whereas, in fact, based on the identification and explanation in the previous session, the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* contained in the book are not only four but nine, namely: *tawassuṭ* (taking the middle path), *tasāmuḥ* (tolerance), *musāwah* (egalitarian/non-discrimination), *shūrā* (deliberations), *i'tidāl* (straight and firm), *iṣlāḥ* (reform), *aulawīyyah* (prioritizing priorities), *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* (dynamic and innovative), and *taḥaḍḍur* (civilized). It means that there is only one value that is not explicitly covered in the book, namely *tawāzun* (balance). Thus, the textbook's elaboration regarding the core competencies is too simple if it is related to the fact of values that are in principle contained in the book, especially in the story of each figure which generally consists of the biographies of figures, the roles of figures in developing Islam in Indonesia, and the figures' positive attitudes. Therefore, it can be said that the core competencies section of the book can still be added with other points of explanation that can increase students' insight into praiseworthy and kind behaviors as contained in the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah*.

In addition, the explanation of the book in various parts seem to be dominated by only a few values, especially the value of tolerance (*tasāmuḥ*) and the value of civility (*taḥaḍḍur*). Some countless statements or sentences demonstrate the significance of these two values. Nevertheless, on the other hand, several other values that are no less important to show for students are neglected. For example, attempts to demonstrate the importance of the values of deliberation (*shūrā*) have little to say. Even as far as the authors

investigate, there is only one place where this value is conveyed. The value of prioritizing the priority (*aulawiyyah*) was also found in only one place, and they were not explored more adequately. Likewise, the designation of the value of taking the middle path (*tawassuṭ*) is found together with the value of deliberation (*shūrā*) in the same context. Indeed, there is no obligation to cover all the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* in that book, but it would be better if the two values are also given a portion that is more than just mentioning it once.

CONCLUSION

The values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* are very relevant and in line with the character education currently being rolled out and promoted by the Indonesian government. *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, a religious education institution that teaches Islamic values, is the initial stage for students to recognize the values that promote noble characters. Understanding and cultivating the values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah* from an early age is an appropriate moment because a person's character has started to form from an early age. *Wasaṭiyyah* values will become a spirit in every step of the students so that those who can understand and practice them in principle can show Islam as *raḥmah lī al-‘ālamīn*.

Of the ten values of *Islām wasaṭiyyah*, there are nine contained in the narrative of the textbook: *tawassuṭ* (taking the middle path), *tasāmuḥ* (tolerance), *musāwah* (egalitarian/non-discrimination), *shūrā* (deliberations), *i'tidāl* (straight and firm), *iṣlāḥ* (reform), *aulawiyyah* (prioritizing priorities), *taṭāwur wa ibtikār* (dynamic and innovative), and *taḥaḍḍur* (civilized). *Tawassuṭ* and *shūrā* were practiced simultaneously and in the same context by Maulana Malik Ibrahim. In this case, this figure is depicted as a figure who mediated between those at odds in which the two values were implemented. *Tasāmuḥ* value was practiced by all figures except Sunan Drajat and Sunan Kalijaga in their behaviors which appreciated all the differences, including culture, tradition, and religion. The *musāwah* value was practiced by Sunan Ampel and Sunan Gunung Jati. There was a similarity between the two, namely that they were the rulers in their respective territories that enabled them to get along with many people while showing them egalitarian behaviors. *I'tidāl* was practiced by Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Sunan Bonang, and Sunan Gunung Jati. They are all described as assertive, upright, and responsible people in the book. *Iṣlāḥ* value can be interpreted as change, and therefore it was practiced by all figures, although there is no indication that the author of the book

directed his study to this value. The one described as having a big influence from this change is Maulana Malik Ibrahim when he initiated the irrigation system that impacted improving the people's economy. *Aulawiyyah* is pinned on the figure of Sunan Drajat, who gave priority to improving the welfare of the community. *Taṭāwur wa ibtikār* values were practiced by all the figures. Their creativity in delivering *da'wah*, especially the use of arts and culture, colored the implementation of these values. *Tahaḍḍur* was practiced by Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Sunan Ampel, Sunan Bonang, Sunan Drajat, Sunan Muria, Sunan Kudus, and Sunan Gunung Jati. They are described as people who had noble characters in associating with the community.

The narrative of the nine figures in the book for the 6th grade of the *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* is significant considering that they are outstanding local figures which showed cultural development in this country, especially concerning the interaction of Islamic culture and pre-Islamic cultures, particularly Hinduism and Buddhism. However, the formulation of core competencies and basic competencies needs to some extent to be expanded. This expansion of competencies is because several values are included in the narrative but are not included in the competencies' statements. Formulating those kinds of competencies is essential and must be observed before moving on to the storytelling. In addition, the book narrative needs to make the messages conveyed proportional in the sense that each value receives the same portion. It is supposed to be that there is not any value explained to be highly dominant compared to other values, which can then cause other values to be neglected.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

-

DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTERESTS

I would like to confirm that there will no be potential conflicts of interest dealing with the research, authorship, and publication of the article.

FUNDING

-

ORCID iD

Sibawaihi  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0139-9418>

REFERENCES

- Asad, Muhammad. *The Message of the Qur'an*. Gibraltar: Dar al-Andalus, 1980.
- Asad, Muhammad. *The Road to Mecca*, 4th rev. ed. Louisville, KY: Fons Vitae, 1980.
- Azizy, Ahmad Qodri. *Pendidikan (Agama) untuk Membangun Etika Sosial: Mendidik Anak Sukses Masa Depan, Pandai dan Bermanfaat*. Semarang: Aneka Ilmu, 2002.
- Baker, Raymond William. "Worldly Islam: The Islamic 'Wasatiyyah' And The Quest For Democracy." *Oriente Moderno* 87, no. 2 (2007): 327–54, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25818130>.
- Bakir, Muhamadul and Othman, Khatijah. "A Conceptual Analysis of Wasatiyyah (Islamic Moderation-IM) from Islamic Knowledge Management (IKM) Perspective," *Revelation and Science* 7, no. 1 (2017): 21-31. DOI:10.32350/jitc.71.02.
- Coedes, G. *The Indianized States of Southeast Asia*, ed. Walter F. Vella. Canberra: Australian National University Press, 1975.
- Glaser, Barney G. and Strauss, Anselm L. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. New Brunswick & London: Aldine Transaction, 1999.
- Goleman, Daniel. *Emotional Intelligence*. New York: Bantam Books, 1995.
- Kamali, Mohammad Hashim. *The Middle Path of Moderation in Islam: The Qur'anic Principle of Wasatiyyah*. Oxford & New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Kementerian Agama RI, Redaksi Pendis. "Kemenag Perkuat Moderasi Beragama bagi Guru, Kepala dan Pengawa Madrasah Poso" (2019). <http://www.pendis.kemenag.go.id/new/2019/07/23/kemenag-perkuat-moderasi-beragama-bagi-guru-kepala-dan-pengawas-madrasah-poso/>.
- Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan. "Penguatan Pendidikan Karakter Jadi Pintu Masuk Pembinaan Pendidikan Nasional," (2017). <https://www.kemdikbud.go.id/main/blog/2017/07/penguatan-pendidikan-karakter-jadi-pintu-masuk-pembinaan-pendidikan-nasional>.
- Krippendorff, Klaus. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2004.
- Leaman, Oliver. *An Introduction to Medieval Islamic Philosophy*. Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- MUI, Komisi Informasi dan Komunikasi. "Definisi Islam Wasathiyah" (2018). <https://mui.or.id/produk/infografis/23935/definisi-islam-wasathiyah/>.
- Munawar-Rachman, Budhy. *Argumen Islam untuk Liberalisme, Islam Progresif dan Perkembangan Diskursusnya*. Jakarta: Grasindo, 2010.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein. *Islam: Religion, History, and Civilization*. San Francisco: Harper-San Francisco, 2003.

- Nuqul, Fathul Lubabin, Zamroni Zamroni, Oktalia Rahmawati, and Dwi Candra Pranata. “‘Cognition Without Affection’: Refleksi Program Akselerasi di Madrasah.” *Psikoislamika : Jurnal Psikologi dan Psikologi Islam* 10, no. 2 (December 30, 2013). <https://doi.org/10.18860/psi.v10i2.6365>.
- Prihatin, Intan Umbari. “KTT Ulama dan Cedikiawan Muslim Dunia, Jokowi Dorong Lahirnya Wasathiyah Islam” (2018). <https://www.merdeka.com/peristiwa/ktt-ulama-dan-cedikiawan-muslim-dunia-jokowi-dorong-lahirnya-wasathiyah-islam.html>.
- Rahman, Nur Farhana Abdul, and Khadijah Mohd Khambali. “Religious Tolerance in Malaysia: Problems and Challenges.” *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 3 (2013): 81. <https://doi.org/10.24035/ijit.3.2013.007>.
- Rahmawaty, Laily. “MUI Terus Sosialisasikan Islam Wasathiyah” (2019). [https://www.antarane.ws.com/berita/917063/mui-terus-sosialisasikan-islam-wasathiyah#:~:text=%22MUI%20sebagai%20lembaga%20yang%20mengarahkan,Senin%20\(17%2F6\)](https://www.antarane.ws.com/berita/917063/mui-terus-sosialisasikan-islam-wasathiyah#:~:text=%22MUI%20sebagai%20lembaga%20yang%20mengarahkan,Senin%20(17%2F6)).
- Regulation of Minister of Education and Culture, Republic of Indonesia, No. 24, 2016, about Core Competence and Basic Competence in the 2013 Curriculum for Primary School and Secondary School.
- Ricklefs, M.C. *A History of Modern Indonesia since c.1300, 2nd Edition*. London: MacMillan, 1991.
- Sairin, Sjafrî. “Disintegrasi Sosial : Sebuah Tinjauan Budaya,” *Humaniora* 12, no. 3 (August 3, 2012): 306–12, <https://doi.org/10.22146/jh.703>.
- Schweinhart, Lawrence J. *Significant Benefits: The High/Scope Perry Preschool Study through Age 27*. Ypsilanti, MI: High/Scope Press, 1993.
- Suhailid. *Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam MI Kelas VI*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama RI, 2020.
- Sunyoto, Agus. *Atlas Wali Songo*. Jakarta: Pustaka Iman, 2016.
- Syihab, Abdul Halim, and Asmawati Muhamad. “Reviving The Wasatiyyah Values For Inter-Religious Harmony In Plural Societies.” *Journal of Al-Tamaddun* 12, no. 2 (December 30, 2017): 13–24. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol12no2.2>.
- Tahmid, Khairuddin. “Esensi Dakwah Islam Wasathiyah” (2018). <https://www.nu.or.id/post/read/92288/esensi-dakwah-islam-wasathiyah;%20>.
- Tsoukas, Haridimos, and Demetrios B. Papoulias. “Understanding Social Reforms: A Conceptual Analysis.” *Journal of the Operational Research Society* 47, no. 7 (July 1, 1996): 853–63. <https://doi.org/10.1057/jors.1996.111>.
- Weber, Robert Philip. *Basic Content Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1985.
- White, Joshua T. “Beyond Moderation: Dynamics Of Political Islam In Pakistan.” *Contemporary South Asia* 20, no. 2 (June 1, 2012): 179–94. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2012.670200>.
- White, Marilyn Domas, and Emily E Marsh. “Content Analysis: A Flexible Methodology.” *Library Trends* 55, no. 1 (2006): 22–45. <https://doi.org/10.1353/lib.2006.0053>.

Widiyanto, Asfa. "Islam, Multiculturalism And Nation-Building In The Post-Truth Age: The Experience Of Indonesia." *Journal of Al-Tamaddun* 14, no. 1 (June 14, 2019): 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.22452/JAT.vol14no1.1>.

This page is intentionally left blank