THE APPOINTMENT OF NON-MUSLIM LEADERS
(Study of Surah *Al-Mâ'idah* verses 51 and 57 Using Semantic Approach)

Umum B. Karyanto
IAIN Pekalongan
umumbudi@ymail.com

Abstracts:

It is a common thing that there is a controversy over non-muslim leadership in the majority of muslims. Historically, this issue has been long-standing and has always been debatable among experts from time to time. As the result of this issue,Ulamas are divided into two groups, one of them is forbid the non-muslim issue, but others permit. Indonesia, which has muslim as the most population often experience a collision related to the appointment of non-muslim leaders. Essentially, leadership is a mandate that must be mandated to those who can afford it. Indonesian law guarantees all its citizens to emerge as both muslim and non-muslim leaders. Therefore, this paper attempts to analyze the appointment of non-Muslim leaders with a semantic approach according to verses of the Qur'ân that textually prohibit muslims (believers) to appoint non-muslims as leaders. It is because of the words waliy and auliyā'which textually have the meaning as "protector and leader". This paper used semantic approach refers to the basic and relational meaning to make it fairer in interpreting the text.

Keywords: non-muslim, waliy, auliyā', semantic, Al-Qur'ân.

Abstrak:

Kontroversi mengenai kepemimpinan non-muslim di mayoritas muslim telah menjadi hal yang umum. Secara historis, ini merupakan masalah yang sudah muncul sejak lama dan selalu diperdebatkan di antara para ahli dari waktu ke waktu. Akibatnya, ulama terbagi menjadi dua kelompok, satu kelompok melarang non-muslim menjadi pemimpin, sedangkan kelompok lainnya mengizinkan. Indonesia, yang merupakan negara dengan mayoritas penduduk muslim sering mengalami perdebatan terkait pengangkatan pemimpin non muslim. Intinya, kepemimpinan adalah amanat yang harus diamanatkan kepada mereka yang mampu menanganinya. Hukum di Indonesia menjamin semua warganya untuk menjadi pemimpin, baik bagi muslim maupun non-muslim. Oleh karena itu, jurnal ini mencoba untuk menganalisis pengangkatan pemimpin non-muslim dengan pendekatan semantik menurut ayat-ayat Al-Qur'an yang secara tekstual melarang Muslimuntuk menunjuk non-muslim sebagai pemimpin. Alasanny adalah kata-kata waliy dan auliyā' yang secara tekstual memiliki arti sebagai "pelindung dan pemimpin". Pendekatan semantik yang digunakan dalam makalah ini mengacu pada makna dasar dan relasional agar lebih adil dalam menafsirkan teks

Kata Kunci*: non-muslim, waliy, auliya, semantik, Al-Qur'an*

Introduction

Indonesia is a pluralistic state, which has many ethnics, cultures, and cultural tribes, and it has various religions held by the inhabitants. In order to unite the nation and state, Indonesia declared "Bhineka Tunggal Ika" as the motto, which makes Pancasila as the basis of the state. Although most of Indonesians are Muslim, the founders of Indonesiadid not choose Islamic shari'a as the basis of the state.

Islam as a guide is a unified totality that offers a solution to all life problems. As a religion of *rahmatan lil'âlamîn*, Islam is full of rules of law that become reference in human life in every thing they do, including

family life, economy, and politics. The rules of Islam in general can be grouped into two, namely the rule of law on human relations with God (*hablun minallâh*) and the rule of law on human relations with God's fellows (*hablun minannâs*). The first type of the relationship is called worship (*ibâdah*), while the second type is called *mu'âmalah*. This brief study will discuss one part of the second type of the relationship pattern, namely *mu'âmalah*, especially about the pattern of relationships in the life of the state (politics).

Leadership is amultidisciplinary field concerned as well with ethics and morality. However, leadership is conceived differentlyin the West and the Islamic view. This difference is largely attributed to the differences in culture and their respectiveworld views.

In Islamic concepts (*manhaj*), leaders are final and fundamental. He occupies the highest position in Islamic society. For islamic fellow, the leader is like the head of all his limbs. He has a strategic role in pattern setting (*minhaj*) and movement (*harakah*). His skill in leading will lead his people to achieve their goals, namely the glory and prosperity with the accompaniment of Allah Swt.

One of the problems that arises in the matter of leadership is the questionsof non-muslim leaders. The question is whether non-muslims can be leaders in muslim-majority areas? The high level of religious plurality in Indonesia allows the government led by someone who has a of minor belief. This question is considered as a kind of contextual one, especially in Indonesia. The fact can be seen on the phenomenon of Basuki Tjahaya Purnama or Ahok, as a non-Muslim candidate who won DKI Jakarta election as a governor in 2017. Because of nominating of Basuki Tjahaya Purnama, called Ahok, the discussion of non-Muslim leaders is very influential and contextual to be discussed, especially according to *Qur'ân*.

Semantics and the LanguageMeaning

Semantics is the systematic study of meaning, and linguisticsemantics is the study of how languages organize and express meanings.[1] Semantics (as the study of meaning) is central to the study of communication; and as communication becomes more and more pressing. Semantics is also at the centre of the study of human mind –thought processes, cognition, conceptualization – all these are intricately bound up with the way in which we classify and convey our experience of the word through language.[2]

Semantics is part of the language structure that is related to the meaning of expression and structure of the meaning of a speech. Meaning is the purpose of speech, the

---

[1]Charles W. Kreidler, *Introducing English Semantics* (New Fetter Lane, London: Taylor & Francis Group, 1998), 3.

[2]Geoffrey Leech, *Semantics: The Study of Meaning* (Great Britain: Penguin Books, 1985), ix.

influence of the language unit in understanding the perception, as well as human or group behavior.[3] The meaning of the word is the field of study discussed in semantics. Various types of word meaning are examined in semantic science. The connotative meaning is one of the types of meaning discussed in the semantic study, which meansthat the meaning is not true. It is stated in a clause.

Etymologically, semantics means the study of word meaning(knowledge of the intricacy andshiftingof the words meaning).[4] According to Izutsu, semantics is a study that deals with phenomena of meaning in the broader sense of the word. It is based on belief that almost anything might be considered to have meaning, and it is the objective of semantic study.[5] The word semantics is actually a technical term that refers to the study of the language meaning.[6]

The meaning of the language varies according to the context of its use in the sentence. In semantic analysis, it must be realized that the language is unique and has a close relationship with cultural issues.

Therefore, a language analysis only applies to that language and cannot be used to analyze other languages. For example, the word fish in Indonesian refers to the type of animal that lives in water and is usually eaten as a side dish. In English, the word is called fish. But the word "*iwak*" in Javanese does not only means fish (ikan) or fish, but also meat used as a side dish.

According to Verhaar, semantics is a systematic branch of language that investigates the meaning.[7]Another opinion stated by Abdul Chaer, who claimed that in semantics, there is discussion of the relationship between words with the concept or meaning of the words, as well as objects or things have the meaning that is outside the language. The meaning of a word, phrase or discourse is determined by the context.[8]

According to Tarigan, semantics examines the symbols or signs that express the meaning, the relationship of meaning to one another, and its influence on humans and society. Thus, semantics is always related to the meaning used by its speakers. Based on some opinions above, it can be concluded that semantics is the study of the symbols or signs that express the meaning, the relationship of meaning to one another, and the relationship

---

[3]Harimurti Kridalaksana, *Kamus Linguistik* (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2001), 193.

[4]W.J.S. Poerwadarminta, *Kamus Umum Bahasa Indonesia*, Cet. V (Jakarta: PN Balai Pustaka, 1976), 903.

[5]Toshihiko Izutsu, *Relasi Tuhan dan Manusia: Pendekatan Semantik terhadap Al Qur'an*, terj. Agus Fahri Husein dkk. Cet. I (Yogyakarta: TiaraWacana, 1997), 2.

[6]James Hurford & Brendan Heasley, *Semantics: A Course Book* (London: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 1.

[7]J.W.M.Verhaar, *Pengantar Linguistik*, Cet. XX (Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada, 1995), 9.

[8]Abdul Chaer, *Pengantar Semantik Bahasa Indonesia* (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2009), 60.

between words according to the concept or meaning of the word.[9]

According to Toshiko Izutsu, semantics is an analytic study of the key terms for a language with a view that comes to conceptual understanding*for weltanschauung* (worldview) of people who use the language, not only as a tool of speech and thinking, but also the conceptualization and interpretation of the world that surrounds it. Toshihiko argues that a language can not simply be moved into another one without the intervention of a "concept error".[10]

According to Nurhayati, word meaning is a field of study discussed in semantic science. Semantics is a branch of linguistics that studies the meaning of a word in language, while linguistics is the study of spoken and written language that has systematic, rational, and empirical features as a description of the structure and rules of the language.[11] Based on the opinion above, it can be concluded that the meaning of a word in the language can be known by implementing semantic study. In Kamus Bahasa Indonesia (KBI), the word "*makna*" means the meaning or meaning of word; *bermakna berarti*; *mempunyai* (*mengandung*) *arti*: *kalimat itu ~*

rangkap.[12] Meanwhile, Fatimah argued that meaning is the link that exists between the elements of the language itself (especially the words).[13] In accordance to that opinion, Lyons as quoted by Fatimah, mentioned that studying the meaning or giving meaning of a word. It means that the study understand the word related to relations of meaning which make the word is different from other words.[14]

The Translation of the *Qur'ân*

Translation is expressing what written in one language (SL) into another language (TL), so, actually it is expressing one thought or more by words. Translation is a communication or, more precisely, a form of cross-cultural communication. Translation is the act of translating. To translate means to change from one language to another, to interpret, to transfer, and to change. Translation is the act of rendering what expressed in one language by means of another language.[15]

On the other hand, Nida and Taber state that "*translating consists in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message*".

[9]Henry Guntur Tarigan, *Pengajaran Semantik*(Bandung: Angkasa, 1985), 7.

[10]Tosihiko Izutsu, *Etika Beragama dalam Al Qur'an*, terj. M. Djoely(Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1993),5.

[11]Endang Nurhayati, *Sosiolinguistik Kajan Kode Tutur dalam Wayang Kulit* (Yogyakarta: Kanwa Publisher, 2009), 3.

[12]Dendy Sugono, *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia* (Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, 2008), 903.

[13]Fatimah. T. Djajasudarma, *Semantik 1: Pengantar ke Arah Ilmu Makna* (Bandung: PT. Eresco, 1993), 5.

[14]*Ibid*.

[15]Jeremy Munday, *Introducing Translation Studies: Theories and Applications,* 2nd Edition,(London: Routledge, 2008), 4.

This definition is more comprehensive than the previous ones. Nida and Taber explicitly state that translation is closely related to the problems of languages, meaning, and equivalence.[16]

From the definitions mentioned above, it can be concluded that translation is a process which is intended to find meaning equivalence in the target text.

The term translation itself has several meanings: it can refer to the general subject field, the product (the text that has been translated) or the process (the act of producing the translation, otherwise known as translating). The process of translation between two different written languages involves the translator changing an original written text (the source text or ST) in the original verbal language (the source language or SL) into a written text (the target text or TT) in a different verbal language (the target language or TL).[17]

The activity of translating the *Qur'ân* is not new. The translation program of *Al-Qur'ân* aims to facilitate the process of learning *Qur'ân*. This activity has been done since the beginning of the 2nd century AD when*Qur'ân* was translated into Latin by Robert of Ketton (Robert de Retines).[18] Until now *Qur'ân* has been translated into various languages, such as Persian, Turkish, Urdu, Indian, Japanese, English, French, Spanish, Mandarin, Indonesian and African countries.[19]Translation of A*l-Qur'ân* from the past until now has become part of the history of the Muslim scientists. Currently one of the best means of *tablîg* is translating*Qur'ân* and introduce the essence and study of *Qur'ân* following *syarah* and *tafsir* to the people of the world.

The holy Quran has been translated into many languages, since translation has a great role in spreading Islam all over the world. These translations have varied between free and literal translations. In the other way, questions raised about the acceptability of literal translation by Muslim scholars, especially about the fidelity to the original text. If we look at these glorious meanings with literal translation, it is obvious that there is a huge difference between both, the source text and the target text.

Translation *Al-Qur'ân*defined as transfering and interpreting *Qur'ân* from the source language, *i.e.* Arabic, into the target language. This process meansthat the translation and interpretation are printed into several manuscriptsthat can be read by a person who does not understand Arabic so he

---

[16]Eugene A.Nida and Charles R. Taber, *The Theory and Practice of Translation* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1982), 12.

[17]Jeremy Munday, *Introducing Translation*, 5

[18]Rifa'i Sauqi dan M. Ali Hasan, *Pengantar Ilmu Tafsir*(Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1992), 169–171.

[19]Muḥammad Taqiyuddin Al-Hilāl and Muḥammad Muḥsin Khān, *Al-Qur'ān al-Karīm wa Tarjamatu Ma'ānīhi ilā al-Lugati al-Injiliziyyah, The Noble Quran*: *English Translation of the Meanings and Commentary*(Madina: King Fahd Complex for the Printing of the Holy Qur'an, 1404 H), 153.

canunderstand the purpose of the book of Allah with this intermediate translator.[20]Translating activity, especially *Qur'ân* into the Foreign language, is an activity that requires high caution so that people who are interested in translating *Qur'ân* must have detailed knowledge of Arabic, master the target language completed with good word-writing techniques and has the criteria as a *mufassir*/interpreter. Therefore, translating *Qur'ân* is not an easy workfor anyone, except those who are interested and talented to be an interpreter.

It is of course true that studying the Qurʾan as a source for the lifeand thought of Muhammad. In the nineteenth century, this shift was intimately linked to the question of how Muhammad was to be evaluated as a person. The emphasis that Qurʾanic Studies places on viewing the Qurʾanas part and parcel of the wide expanse of monotheistic literature canbe seen as a corrective shift that was long overdue.

Muslim always define translation as a way to understand the meaning of *Qur'ân*. All Arabian and Arabianmuslims intentionally obtain satisfaction and blessings of the pronunciation of the sacred words. The words are what the Prophet said, and read by his friends as well as the next generation of Muslims in different lands and throughout the Islamic era.[21]

Semantic Studies of Qur'anic verses about Non-Muslim Leadership

The leadership in Islam is a trust and isrooted in the *Qur'ân*, literally the word of God and the Sunnah, sayings and doings of Prophet Muhammad. The leadership values emphasized in Islam can be expressed in one word, tawhid. A leader who subscribes to tawhid means that he/she truly believes in the unity and sovereignty of God. So aligned, the leaders will always be mindful of vertical accountability to God and horizontal accountability to fellow beings for all deeds and actions.

So attuned, the leaders will always seek to enjoin good and forbid evil. The leader will be guided by the shari'ah and will take decision on the basis of mutual consultation (shura) thus creating a high level of trust and support among the followers needed to enhance their commitment to the cause of pleasing Allah and serving the humanity. Leadership requires a leader to guide, protect and treat the followers fairly with justice ('adl).

Leadership from Western Perspective defined as "a particular type of power relationship". Considering that leadership and politics (defined as power) are inextricably

---

[20]Muḥammad Aly Aṣ Ṣābūny, *Pengantar Study al-Qur'ân, Cet. I,* (Bandung: At-Tibyan Al-Ma'arif, 1984), 276.

[21]Abdul Ḥayy Al-Farmāwy, *Metode Tafsir Maudhu'i dan Cara Penerapannya*(Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2002), 22.

linked. It insists that an understanding of "the nature of leadership requires understanding of the essence of power, for leadership is a special form of power".[22]

Power in its various forms (coercive, legitimate, reward and expert or Weberian traditional, bureaucratic and charismatic power) is present to some degree in any leader-follower relationship. Power, however, is the ever-present inescapable common feature of Western and other secular political systems and has been criticized by the Western scholars themselves.

Regardless of the pros and cons, there are at least four verses of *Qur'ân* that are tell about non-Muslim leaders. From some verses of *Qur'ân*, it can be explained that a muslim must choose a muslim leader. The verses that tell about leaders, are 1. A*l-Qur'ân* surah *Ali Imran* [3]: 28; 2. *Al-Qur'ân* surah *Al-Mâ'idah* [5]: 51; 3. *Al-Qur'ân* surah *Al-Mâ'idah* [5]: 57; 4. *Al-Qur'ân* surah *An-Nisâ* [4]: 144; and 5. *At-Taubah* [9]: 12. In *Al-Qur'ân* surah *Al-Mâ'idah* [5]: 51, Allah asserts:

> O you who believe! take not the Jews and Christians as *Auliyâ'* (friends. protector, helpers), they are but *Auliyâ'* of each other. And if any amongst you takes them (as *Auliyâ'*) then surely he is one of them. Verily, *Allâh* guides not those people who are the *Zâlimūn* (polytheist and wrong-doers and unjust).

The above verse seems to invite Muslims to be "fanatical". Why does *Qur'ân* affirm this? Is there any tolerance for choosing non-Muslim leaders? In *Qur'ân* and its translation by the team of Ministry of Religious Affairs, the word *auliyâ* is translated with the leaders. The word *aūliyâ* is also contained in surah *'Ali Imrân* verse 28, surah *An-Nisâ* verse 144, and surah *Al-Mâ'idah* verses 51 and 57. The word *aūliyâ* is a plural (plural) form of *waliy* (ولى), which originally has lexical meaning as "close". Then from the original meaning, there are some derivatives meanings arisen, such as *walâ-yalî* which means close to and follow. *Wallâ* (ولى) which means to master, help, and love. *Aulâ* (أولى) which means to authorize, entrust and do. *Tawallā* (تولى) means fulfilling, treating, taking care, and mastering. All derivative words of *waliy* refer to the meaning of proximity, except when accompanied by the word *'an* explicitly and implicitly as in the *walâ' 'an* and *'tawallâ' 'an*, then its intended meaning is to stay away or turn away. Therefore, the word "*walî*" thus has many meanings, i.e. close ones, friends, helpers, guardians, allies, followers, protectors, guards, leaders, the loving, the beloved, and the ruler all bound by the proximity of the red thread.[23]

Like a father, he is the most important person to be the guardian (*wali*) of his

---

[22]Abdul Rashid Moten, "Leadership in the West and the Islamic World: A Comparative Analysis," *World Applied Sciences Journal* 15 (3) (2011): 339-349.

[23]Sahabuddin, *Ensiklopedia Al Qur'an.* Cet. IV(Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2007), 1060–1061.

daughterbecause he is the closest to her. A person who is very obedient and devoted to worship is named "*wali*" because he is close to God. It is likewise the leader,because he should be close to the persons he leads. It is thus seen that all the meanings mentioned above can be covered by the word *auliyâ*.[24] Therefore, this word of God shows that it is not permissible to make Jews and Christians as leaders.The word is a form of closeness to something that makes up and loses the boundary between the approaching and the approached in the purpose of that closeness. If the goal is in the context of piety and help, the word *auliyā*means helpers, but n the context of association and compassion, the word *auliyā* means the attraction of the soul, whereas in the context of obedience, the word waliy means who rules and has to be obeyed.[25]

In semantic study, it is necessary to distinguish between the basic and relationalmeaning. The basic meaning is something that is attached to the word itself, which is alwayscarried wherever it is put. For example, the term *kafara*, in pre-Islamic times this word precisely and fundamentally has the meaning "ungrateful" to others whoprovide help or have done good so that at this time the term *kafara* is exactly opposite to the word *syakara*. This is the prevalent meaning of the verbs *kafara* in the wider Arabic context. The basic meaning of this verb has not changed either by Muslim or non-Muslim Arabs. This word is known byall of the communities for Arabic native speakers. In addition, the basic meaning of this word has remained so from pre-Islamic times to the present day.[26]

In the study of relational meaning, there is a shift of meaning in the verb of *kafara* or the noun *kufr*deviated slightly from its original meaning "not grateful", and becomesincreasingly close to the meaning of "unbelief" as a form of denialof the concept of faith.[27] Thus, *Al-Qur'ân* by bringing relational meaning, without eliminating the basic meaning that was understood before by fighting with faith (belief) and Islam (surrender), in *Qur'ân*is still found the meaning *kufr/kafara* both are in basic and relational meaning.

Semantically, the term *kufr* has a strong connection with other terms in *Qur'ân* containing bad ethics. The terms that are directly and explicitly contain the meaning of *kufr* in itself, besides the term *kufr* itself, are *juhud, ilhad, inkar*, and *syirk*. While other terms that implicitly imply and contain the meaning of infidelity are *fisq (fusūq), zulm, fujūr, jurm (ijrâm), dalâl* and *ghayy, fasâd, i'tidâ, isrâf, isyân, kibr* (takabbur, istikbâr), kidhb (takhdîb) and ghaflât. These terms when appearin the form of ism *al-fâ'il* (active

---

[24]M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah: Pesan, Kesan, dan Keserasian Al-Qur"an*, Vol. III(Jakarta: Lentera Hati, 2002), 146.
[25]*Ibid*, 151.

[26]Toshihiko Izutsu, *Etika Beragama,*12–14.
[27]*Ibid*, 15.

participant, perpetrator),generally refer to unbelievers. It proves that *kufr* is a dimensionless term which can be seen from various aspects of meaning, and at the same time occupies a central position of all malicious ethics in *Qur'ân*.[28]

The Ulama's View of Non-Muslim Leaders

Associated with non-muslim leaders, there are some interpretationsof some ulama , which stated as follows.

1. Sheikh Imām Qurṭubi

He argued that the leader must be held by muslim and it is very dangerous if the leader is occcupiedby non-muslim. In his book *Tafsīr al-Qurṭubi*, he declared, in this day and age the situation has been reversed and changed in such a way that many muslims entrust everything to the disbelievers much more.[29]

2. Hasbi ash-Siddiqy

He stated that cooperation, mutual aid, and loyal friendship between two people of different religions for the benefit of the world is not prohibited as his statement in *Tafsīr al-Qur'ānul Mājid an-Nūr*. God only forbids you to be faithful with those who are fairly hostile to you, fight you, drive you out or help those who drive you away as the Meccan polytheists did.[30]

3. Sayyid Quṭb

In the *Tafsîr Fî-*Zhilâlil-*Qur'ân*, he assumed that Islam demandfellows to tolerate and engage in good relations with the Kitabist, especially those who say: "*We are indeed Christians.*"

However, *Al-Qur'ân* forbids them to give loyalty to them because of tolerance and join togetheras far as a matter of morals and behavior. On the other hand, the problem of *wala* (loyalty) is a matter of faith and the problem of arranging people.[31]

4. Ahmad Mustafâ al-Marâgi

He argued that the appointment of non-muslim officials is not a problem, indeed many verses ofQur'an strictly prohibit muslims from appointing non-muslims to be their protectors, but there are reasons to forbid them.

In general the prohibition is about taking non-muslims as friends in any way that endanger themselves, such as unlocking special cases relating to religious affairs, conspiring to fight against other muslims.[32] Furthermore Al-Marâgi argued in his

---

[28]Harifuddin Cawidu, *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an* (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1991), 229.

[29]Syeikh Imam Qurṭubi, *Tafsīr al-Qurṭubi,* terj. Dudi Rosyadi, *et.al*), Jilid. IV (Jakarta: Pustaka Azzam, 2008), 446.

[30]Teungku Muhammad Hasbi ash-Shiddiqy, *Tafsīr al-Qur'ānul Majīd An-Nūr*, Cet. II Jilid V (Semarang: PT Pustaka Rizki Putra, 2000), 4193.

[31]Sayyid Quṭb, *Tafsīr Fi Ẓilālil Qur'ān*, terj. As'ad Yasin, Cet. I Jilid III (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 2002), 265.

[32]Ahmad Muṣṭafa al-Marāgi, *Terjemah Tafsir al-Marāgi*, terj. Bahrun Abubakar, *et.al.*, Cet. II, Jilid. VI (Semarang: PT. Toha Putra, 1993), 250.

commentary that employing *dhimmykufr* in Islamic government is not prohibited. All of *Sahabat r.a.* employed them in *amiriyah* offices.[33]

5. M. Quraish Shihab

He argued that non-muslims who have bad character, criticized by *Qur'ân*, are forbidden to appoint him as a state official.

On the contrary, non-muslims who are not badly criticized by *Qur'ân*, may be allowed to appoint him as one of the state officials. According to M. Quraish Shihab, leadership is an ability and readiness possessed by a person to be able to maintain, supervise and protect the people he leads. Leadership is a mandate that must be surrendered by those who can afford it.[34] Thus, the appointment to carry out the mandate must be in accordance with his or her expertise so that the duty can be managed properly. The appointment of a person to carry out a position that is not correlated with his or her competence will adversely affect the government system itself. According to him, *Qur'ân* gives guidance either explicitly or implicitly in various aspects of human life, including an effort to answer "who is appropriate to choose".

From the slit of the *Quranic*verses, there are at least two basic characters that must be carried by a person who endures a position relating to the people rights. Both of them should be taken into consideration in determining the choice. "*Verily, the best of men for you to hire the strong, the trustworthy,*" said the daughter of the Prophet Syu'aib, which was justified and stated in *Al-Qur'ân* surah *Al-Qaṣâṣ* verse 26.

6. Wahbah al-Zuhaili

He stated that supporting non-muslims as leaders demonstrates the impression muslims perceiving both the paths of unbelief pursued by non-Muslims.

He said that blessing of disbelief of muslims means they also have disbelieved. However, if there is cooperation with non-muslims related to the world affairs without the blessing of their disbelief, then it is not prohibited.[35] This prohibition related to the relationships and ties with non-muslims in depth. Meanwhile, if the relationship is merely a normal interaction and trade without deep-rooted assimilation, it is not prohibited because the ProphetMuhammad SAW. also interacted with jews and mortgaged an armour to him.[36]

7. Hamka

He confirmed the prohibition of choosing non-muslim leaders issue. He warnedeveryone those who believe that they do not take the unbeliever to be *wali*. A person who does not believe in God can not

---

[33]*Ibid.*, Jilid V, 319.

[34]M. Quraish Shihab, *Tafsir Al-Misbah*, 314.

[35]Wahbah al-Zuhaili, *al-Tafsīr al-Munīr fī al-'Aqīdah wa as-Syarī'ah wa al-Manhaj*, Cet. XXVIII (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr al-Mu'aṣir, t.th.), 199–200

[36]Wahbah az-Zuhaili, *Tafsīr al-Wasīṭ*, terj. Muhtadi, dkk, Cet. I, (Jakarta: Gema Insani, 2012),412.

be *waliy* as a leader or *waliy* as a friend. He said that the consequences will appear in the future because muslims will be led by them (non-muslim leaders) into the *ṭâgût*. If they made friends, muslims would be invited to the perverted path by leadingmuslims to do evil things and prevent doing good.[37]This Hamka's opinion should be seen as the caution of muslims, who are the majority of this country. This caution can be seen from his description, by the time interpreting the verses about the prohibition of non-muslim leaders.

8. Ibn Taymiyya

Ibn Taymiyya gave a very brave statement:*"It is better led by a just pagan leader, than led by an unjust muslim leader"*. He stated that a person who can be appointed as a leader is a person who has the power and integrity, is able to do justice and have strong commitment to the prosperity of the people he leads regardless of his faith. Thus, the relevance of Ibn Taimiyah's thought in the case of non-muslim choosingas a leader among muslims appears, which means that it is permissible as long as the leaderfulfill the requirements. *First*, obtaining the support of the most muslim is determined by consultation or discussion and *bai'at*. *Second*, gaining support from *Ahl Asy-Syaukah* or elements of stake holders in society. *Third*, having personal power and being trusted completed by honesty, trustful, and just so a

leader will be able to provide good habits to other people.[38] Ibn Taymiyyah's argued*"God supports justice government eventhough it is* kāfir*, and does not support tyrannical rule eventhoughit is muslims"*.[39]

In Islam, the process of determining a leader who can lead people becomes an interesting discourse to discuss. One of the opinions is from Anis Malik Thoha, who said that in Islam, government or *khilâfah* includes religion and world leadership that replaces Prophet Muhammad saw., as stated by the Ulama. Therefore, in this case, the leadership should not replace the Prophet Muhammad saw., except a Muslim. The positions which do not related to religious understandings(besides army and judicial leaders) can be filledby non-muslims who have the competencies. In fact, the *fuqaha* like Al-Mawardi claimed that *kafir dhimmi* are allowed to hold executive positions. For example, there were some Christians held ministerial positions in the Abbasid caliphate era, such as Nasr ibn Harun (369 AH) and Isa ibn Nasturus (380 AH).[40]

---

[37]Hamka, *Tafsir al-Azhar,* Juz III, (Jakarta: Panji Masyarakat, 1982), 184–185.

[38]Abu Tholib Khalik, "Pemimpin Non-Muslim dalam Perspektif Ibnu Taimiyah," last modified October 25, 2017, https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/58306-ID-pemimpin-non-muslim-dalam-perspektif-ibn.pdf.

[39]Imam Ibn Taimiyah, *Majmū' Fatāwā Li Ibni Taimiyah*, Jilid. XXVIII, t.th, 63.

[40]Anis Malik Thoha, *Tren Pluralisme Agama: Tinjauan Kritis* (Jakarta: Perspektif, 2005), 260.

Conclusion

Muslims who appoint non-muslims to be leaders are legitimate or permissible as long as they are not harmful. Leadershipis an ability and readiness possessed by a person to be able to maintain, supervise and protect the people he leads. It is a trust that must be put on the people who are able to carry it out. In terms of contextuality, the law in Indonesia stated it is not prohibited rising non-muslim into one of the government officials. There is no statement of Indonesian Constitutionthat prohibits them (non-muslims) to hold a position in government. Working with non-muslims in the social life is not prohibited as long as it does not involve the ritual religious activities of a leader.

The author keepconsidering the opinions of Ulama who do not allow muslims appoint non-muslim leaders because it is based on their caution and concern if non-muslims become heads of government. The author also does not agree with statement"as long as he is a muslim, it is no problemalthough he is disreputable". In Islam view, both candidates of leaders are equally bad (less) so the one that should be chosen is the most minimal shortcomings. The recent argumentis choosing the disreputableperson to be a good one is easier than forcing a non-muslim person to be a muslim. The elected leader can not do what he wishes anymore longer. In carrying out his duties and obligations he is bound by the rules (act). If he still performs his bad habits and goes against the rules, he will be subjected sanctions, even punishment.

The final conclusion is if the prospective leader of the original muslim is not good, he can be forced to follow the existing provisions to prevent him in acting arbitrarilybecause if he does that such attitude, he will be prosecuted. On the other hand, an appropriate non-muslim leader candidatemust have the distincion (goodness). However, the belief are contrary to *Qur'ân*. Then, as muslims, although it is difficultto prove that he will not have good attitude for the nation and country, but if we believe Allah and the Book of God, we must follow the provisions of *Qur'ân*.

References

Cawidu, Harifuddin. 1991. *Konsep Kufr dalam Al-Qur'an*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang.

Chaer, Abdul. 2009. *Pengantar Semantik Bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.

Departemen Agama RI. 1986. *Al-Qur'an dan Terjemahnya*. Jakarta: Yayasan Penyelenggara Penterjemah/Pentafsir Al-Qur'an.

Djajasudarma, Fatimah. T. 1993. *Semantik 1: Pengantar ke Arah Ilmu Makna*. Bandung: PT. Eresco.

Al-Farmāwi, Abdul Ḥayy. 2002. *Metode Tafsir Maudhu'i dan Cara Penerapannya.* Bandung: Pustaka Setia.

Hamka. 1982. *Tafsir al-Azhâr*. Juz III. Jakarta: Panji Masyarakat.

Al-Hilālī, Muḥammad Taqiyyuddin and Muḥammad Muḥsin Khān. 1404 H. *Al-Qur'ân al-Karîm wa Tarjamatu*

Ma'ânîhi ilâ al-Lugati al-Injiliziyyah, *The Noble Quran*: *English Translation of the Meanings and Commentary*. Madina: King Fahd Complex for the Printing of the Holy Qur'an.

Hurford, James & Brendan Heasley. 1986. *Semantics: A Course Book*. London: Cambridge University Press.

Ibn Taimiyah, Imam. Tt. *Majmū' Fatāwā Li Ibni Taimiyah*, Jilid. XXVIII.

Izutsu, Toshihiko. 1993. *Etika Beragama dalam Al-Qur'an,* terj. M. Djoely. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus.

_____. 1997. *Relasi Tuhan dan Manusia: Pendekatan Semantik terhadap Al-Qur'an*, Cet. I, terj. Agus Fahri Husein dkk. Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana.

Khalik, Abu Tholib. "Pemimpin Non-Muslim dalam Perspektif Ibnu Taimiyah." last modified October 25, 2017. https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/58306-ID-pemimpin-non-muslim-dalam-perspektif-ibn.pdf

Kreidler, Charles W. 1998. *Introducing English Semantics*. New Fetter Lane, London: Taylor & Francis Group.

Kridalaksana, Harimurti. 2001. *Kamus Linguistik*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Leech, Geoffrey. 1985. *Semantics: The Study of Meaning*. Great Britain: Penguin Books.

Al-Marāgi, Aḥmad Musṭafā. 1993. *Terjemah Tafsīr al-Marāgi*, Cet. II, Jilid. VI. terj. Bahrun Abubakar, *et.al*. Semarang: PT. Toha Putra.

Moten, Abdul Rashid. "Leadership in the West and the Islamic World: A Comparative Analysis." *World Applied Sciences Journal* 15 (3) (2011): 339-349.

Munday,Jeremy. 2008. *Introducing Translation Studies: Theories and Applications,* 2nd Edition. London: Routledge.

Nida, Eugene A. and Charles R. Taber. 1982. *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.

Nurhayati, Endang. 2009. *Sosiolinguistik Kajan Kode Tutur dalam Wayang Kulit*. Yogyakarta: Kanwa Publisher.

Poerwadarminta, W.J.S. 1976. *Kamus Umum Bahasa Indonesia*, Cet. V. Jakarta: PN Balai Pustaka.

Qurṭūbi, Syaikh Imam. 2008. *Tafsīr al-Qurṭūbi*. Jilid. IV. terj. Dudi Rosyadi, *et.al*. Jakarta: Pustaka Azzam.

Quṭb, Sayyid. 2002. *Tafsīr Fi Ẓilālil Qur'ān*, Cet. I Jilid III. terj. As'ad Yasin. Jakarta: Gema Insani Press.

Aṣ Ṣābūny, Muḥammad Aly. 1984. *Pengantar Study al-Qur'ân, Cet. I*. Bandung: At-Tibyan Al-Ma'arif.

Sahabuddin. 2007. *Ensiklopedia Al-Qur'an*. Cet. IV. Jakarta: Lentera Hati.

Sauqi, Rifa'i dan M. Ali Hasan. 1992. *Pengantar Ilmu* Tafsir. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang.

Ash-Shiddiqy, Teungku Muhammad Hasbi, 2000. *Tafsīr al-Qur'ānul Majīd An-Nūr*, Cet. II Jilid V. Semarang: PT Pustaka Rizki Putra.

Shihab, M. Quraish. 2002. *Tafsir Al-Misbah: Pesan, Kesan, dan Keserasian Al-Qur"an*, Vol. III. Jakarta: Lentera Hati.

Sugono, Dendy. 2008. *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan Nasional.

Tarigan, Henry Guntur. 1985. *Pengajaran Semantik*. Bandung: Angkasa.

Thoha, Anis Malik. 2005. *Tren Pluralisme Agama: Tinjauan Kritis*. Jakarta: Perspektif.

Verhaar, J.W.M. 1995. *Pengantar Linguistik*, Cet. XX. Yogyakarta: Universitas Gajah Mada Press.

Az-Zuhaili, Wahbah. Tt. *al-Tafsīr al-Munīr fī al-'Aqīdah wa as-Syarī'ah wa al-Manhaj*, Cet. XXVIII. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr al-Mu'aṣir.

Az-Zuhaili, Wahbah. 2012. *Tafsīr al-Wasīṭ*, Cet. I. terj. Muhtadi, dkk. Jakarta: Gema Insani Press.