

Radicalism on World Wide Web and Propaganda Strategy

Nurdin

Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Palu

nnurdin@iainpalu.ac.id and nnudin69@gmail.com

Abstract

Radical individual and organizations are setting strong foothold on Internet. They operate in dark network hidden from authorities view to persuade, recruit, and coordinate radical and violent actions. The presence of radical individual and organizations on Internet sites have caused massive debate and controversy among Internet users, law enforcement bodies, and policy makers regarding misuse of Internet. However, little is known how exactly radical individual and organizations deliver their propaganda on Internet and what radical organizations practice such activities on Internet. Through the use of content analysis approach, this study analyzed various radical websites content to provide deep insight of radical operation and propaganda on Internet. Data was collected from various popular radical organization websites and previous studies. The findings show that well-known organized radical and terrorist organizations in Indonesia and International have intensively used Internet for new arena to radical and terror public across the globe. They use Internet to persuade, deliver propaganda to a global audience, recruit new members, communicate with international supporters, solicit donations, and fostering public awareness. This study concludes that Internet has become a new instrument to spread radicalism and terror within community life.

Abstrak

Dewasa ini sejumlah individu dan organisasi radikal sudah menancapkan kaki mereka di Internet. Mereka beroperasi dalam suatu jaringan yang sulit terpantau oleh pihak penguasa untuk membujuk, merekrut anggota baru dan sekaligus berkoordinasi dalam melancarkan tindakan radikal dan kekerasan. Kehadiran mereka di dunia maya telah mendatangkan berbagai kontroversi dan perdebatan di kalangan pengguna Internet, penegak hukum, dan pembuat kebijakan terkait penyalahgunaan Internet. Namun, masih sangat terbatas penelitian dan informasi terkait bagaimana sebenarnya organisasi radikal tersebut beroperasi di dunia maya dan bagaimana cara mereka menyampaikan propaganda di Internet. Dengan menggunakan pendekatan analisa konten, penelitian ini berusaha menyajikan pemahaman yang mendalam terkait gerakan dan propaganda radikal di Internet. Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa sejumlah organisasi radikal di Indonesia dan Internasional sudah memanfaatkan Internet secara intensif dalam gerakan mereka. Mereka memanfaatkan Internet untuk mempengaruhi, menyampaikan propaganda radikal, merekrut anggota baru, berkomunikasi dengan pendukung dari berbagai negara dan menggalang dana dari publik yang simpati dengan mereka. Kesimpulan dari penelitian ini adalah Internet sudah menjadi sarana baru kelompok radikal dalam menyebarkan gagasan-gagasan radikal dan teror dalam kehidupan masyarakat dewasa ini.

Keywords Online Radicalism, Online propaganda, Radical on Internet, Radicalism

A. Introduction

Human communication models has significantly changed since the arrival of three type of technologies; hardware (computer), software, and Internet. Conventional communication modes which require face to face interaction is considered no longer compatible with current lifestyle and need. Humans need an efficient and effective communication channels which enable mass interaction 24 hours a day and seven days a week without constrained by time and geographic area. The demand of this type of communication is, then, realised when Internet is available since 1960s.

Since the emergence of Internet, it has become a crucial part of modern society's life due to its ability to facilitate communication and structure contemporary society¹. People are able to interact and collaborate in an efficient and effective manner via online space. As a result, Internet also becomes the most powerful harbinger of social change the world has ever seen². For this study purpose, Internet is understood as *a techno-social system to interact humans based on technological networks*³

Early generation of Internet was called Web 1.0 which was only able to support data exchange and reading text only. Experts called this first generation of internet as "read only web"⁴,⁵ in which the Web merely presents read-only information without interactive facilities. Most users of Web 1.0 were companies which used the Web for advertisement purposes. Meanwhile, latest generation of internet has interactive and collaborative facilities to allow users across the globe to communicate, create, and exchange online content⁶. Due to ability of new generation of World Wide Web to support collaborative and interactive

¹Hui, J. Y, The Internet in Indonesia: Development and Impact of Radical Websites. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, Vol. 33, 2010, pp. 171-191.

²Krotoski, A, The internet's cyber radicals: heroes of the web changing the world Retrieved 20 February 2016, from The Guardian <http://www.theguardian.com/technology/2010/nov/28/internet-radicals-world-wide-web>, 2010

³Aghaei, S., Nematbakhsh, M. A., & Farsani, H. K, Evolution of the World Wide Web: From Web 1.0 to Web 4.0 *International Journal of Web & Semantic Technology (IJWesT)*, Vol. 3 No. 1, 2012, p.1

⁴Berners-Lee, T, The World Wide Web: A very short personal history. Retrieved 17 February 2016 <https://www.w3.org/People/Berners-Lee/ShortHistory.html>, 1998

⁵O'Reilly, T, What is Web 2.0: Design Patterns and Business Models for the Next Generation of Software. *Communications & Strategies*, Vol. 1 No. 1, 2007, p. 17.

⁶Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M, Users of the World, Unite! The Challenges and Opportunities of Social Media. *Business Horizons*, Vol. 53 No.1, 2010, p. 61.

activities, more and more internet applications ~~are also~~ emerged. For example, various social media sites have emerged to support interactive and collaborative activities in online space.

Realizing those advantages, radical individuals and groups who utilize Internet for radical purposes flourished. The growing of modern radical and terrorist on the Internet is at the nexus of two key trends: the democratization of communications driven by user-generated content on the Internet and the modern terrorists' growing awareness of the Internet's potential for their Purposes⁷. In a seminal study carried out by Gabriel Weimann⁸ found that about 90percent of organized radical and terrorism use Internet venue for their opertaion. For example, they use Intenet to recruit new friends and to obtain support across the globe. In this context, Internet has become a powerful tool for facilitating recruitment, reaching global audiences, linking with other extremist groups, and spreading hate materials that help to persuade others to violence and terrorism⁹.

Althought radicalism on World Wide Web has grown exponentially in recent years, very little is known about how radical individuals and groups use of Internet for their propaganda and for what purposes those individuals and groups use the Internet. Studies which focus in this issue is also limited. Eventhough few studies, e.g: Weiman¹⁰ and Hui¹¹, on the use of Internet by radical and terrorist have been carried out, but those studies did not deeply address issues of radical propaganda strategies on Internet. Lack understanding of radicalism in online space may harm our national security and generation.

Motivated by this phenomenon, the author intents to explore how radical individuals and groups use Internet as new venue for radical purposes. This study is expected to shed light on how radical individuals and organizations operate in online space particularly through the use of Internet for propaganda. This might become useful information for

⁷Weimann, G. 2006. *Terror in Cyberspace* (pp. 31). Washington: Haifa University, p.2

⁸CBCnews, "Terrorist Groups Recruiting Through Social Media" Retrieved 26 June 2015 <http://www.cbc.ca/news/technology/terrorist-groups-recruiting-through-social-media-1.1131053> (2015)

⁹Zhou, Y., Reid, E., Qin, J., Chen, H., & Lai, G, "US Domestic Extremist Groups on the Web: Link and Content Analysis". Paper presented at the IEEE Intelligent Systems Conference, Arizona, 2005, PP.44-51

¹⁰Weimann, G., Lone Wolves in Cyberspace. *Journal of Terrorism Research*, Vol. 3 No. 2, 2012, p. 18

¹¹Hui, J. Y, The Internet in Indonesia, P.2

relevant government or contra terrorism organizations in combating online radicalism. This study might also help experts and practitioners in terrorism, law-reinforcement, intelligence, and policy-making actors better understand the domestic and international extremist and radicals' operation to boost our national security.

In conducting this study, the author will address the following research questions: ***Why do radical organizations use world wide web/ Internet and how do they deliver propaganda on the Internet?***

The structure of this paper is as follows; the next section presents literature review which includes definition of radicalism, World Wide Web, and radicalism in online context. Section fourth discusses methodology used to write to this paper. The result and discussion are presented in section fifth which then followed by conclusion in the final section.

B. Literature Review

1 Understanding World Wide Web

First world wide web was created in 1990s in a lab at Cern in Geneva, Switzerland by Tim Berners-Lee and his team. The aim was to set the agenda for far-reaching transformations in the political sphere, in economies everywhere, in social interaction, even in concepts of our own identity¹². The World Wide Web (commonly known as the web) is the most prominent part of the internet that can be defined as a techno-social system to interact humans based on technological networks¹³. Since it was created, the Internet has been improved significantly as we experience this day.

The arrival of new generation of Internet has supported the emergence of various communication and collaboration applications such as email and social media sites. These applications help people to connect with others and communicate in a virtual space. Most activities, which previously were practiced with face to face interaction, have moved to online space. People are no longer need to spend time and space to communicate, interact, and collaborate. Due to its interactivity, Internet become part of society and organizations life.

¹²Krotoski, A. 2010. The internet's cyber radicals: heroes of the web changing the world Retrieved 20 February 2016, from The Guardian <http://www.theguardian.com/technology/2010/nov/28/internet-radicals-world-wide-web>

¹³Aghaei, et al., Evolution of the World Wide Web, P.1

Internet has been used by community for many purposes. For example, Internet can be used to facilitate social relationship through online communication such as emails and social media platforms. Social media platforms is believed to be useful to facilitate social relationship to increase humans' live satisfaction^{14, 15}. McKenna et al., (2002)¹⁶ argue that *those who better express their true self over the Internet were more likely than others to have formed close on-line relationships and moved these friendships to a face-to-face basis*. For radical individual and groups, Internet is mostly used to initiate new relationship or follow up their conventional relationship.

2 Understanding Radicalisms

Radicalism has been recognized by societies and religions across the world. Radicalism has been understood as situation or behaviour which is different from universal belief. Max Weber argues that radicalism as differing in one crucial aspect from the socially sanctioned outlook of common sense¹⁷. Radicalism is not merely exists within Islam but also in other societies and religions such as in Christian¹⁸ and Judaism¹⁹.

The term radicalism has no precise definition in which the term has been defined in various contexts by scholars and practitioners according to their perspectives. The term radicalism itself was derived from Latin *radix* meaning "root" which also can be understood as something come from basic. Within political context, the term radical is defined as "*fundamental*

¹⁴McKenna, K. Y. A., Green, A. S., & Gleason, M. E. J, Relationship Formation on the Internet: What's the Big Attraction? *Journal of Social Issues*, Vol. 58 No. 1, 2002, pp. 9-31.

¹⁵Ellison, N. B., Steinfield, C., & Lampe, C. (2007). The Benefits of Facebook "Friends:" Social Capital and College Students' Use of Online Social Network Sites. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, Vol. 12 No. 4, 2007, pp. 1143-1168.

¹⁶ McKenna, et al., Relationship Formation on the Internet, p.11

¹⁷ Bittner, E. (1963). Radicalism and the Organization of Radical Movements. *American Sociological Review*, 28(6), 928-940

¹⁸ Fleet, M. (1992). Christian Communities in Chile and Peru Toronto, Kellogg Institute, 2002, p.3

¹⁹ Shahak, I. and N. Mezvinsky (1999). Jewish Fundamentalism in Israel. Bon Germany, Pluto Press.

approach to politics, rather than one that makes do and mend, and radicalism suggests complete rather than gradual change"²⁰.

Meanwhile, Islamic radicalism and extremism is understood as a thinking driven by a totalitarian interpretation of Islam that believes in a global Islamic state through an interpretation of Islamic law, or *sharia*²¹. Radicalism in Islam is often associated with word "jihad". The word Jihad is verbal noun of the form-three Arabic verb "jahada", which literally means "to do jihad". The literal root of "jihad" is also associated with the concept of "striving". The one-form verb word has similar root unequivocally means "to strive"²². Although the word "jihad" has no relationship with violent acts and war, it is often associated with terror and radicalism²³.

Mauro's (2014) argument could be influenced by early definition of radicalism provided by Egon²⁴ who defines radicalism as follows : "a conspicuously stressed attitude or frame of mind . . . which may envisage the entire complex of a society or a culture . . . [or] tends to expand in scope until [its] field is coincident with the entire setup of a society,". This definition implies that radical groups tend to change entire world order with their view and ideas. The change is not considering heterogeneity of entire society in the world. This radical call is practiced by a radical group, for example Islamic State for Syria and Iraq (ISIS), in oppose to western values and culture. This radical view and movement is relevant to Casciani²⁵ definition of radicalism who says "'radicalism is a vocal or active opposition to fundamental British values, including democracy, the rule of law, individual liberty and mutual respect and tolerance of different faiths and beliefs".

²⁰University-of-Aberdeen. 2014. Understanding Radicalism. Retrieved 30 June 2015, from University of Aberdeen <https://www.abdn.ac.uk/radicalism/understanding.shtml>

²¹Mauro, R. 2014. Understanding Islamic Extremism. Retrieved 24 June 2015, from The Clarion Project <http://www.clarionproject.org/understanding-islamism/islamic-extremism#>, p.1

²²Ramsay, G., *Jihadi Culture on the World Wide Web*. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2013, p.3

²³Ridouani, D, The Representation of Arabs and Muslims in Western Media. *RUTA*, 3, 15. 2011, p.3

²⁴Egon, B. (1963). Radicalism and the Organization of Radical Movements. *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 28 No. 6, 1963, p.929

²⁵Casciani, D. 2014. How do you define Islamist extremism? Retrieved 30 June 2015, from BBC News <http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-27777892>

3 Radicalism on World Wide Web

Radicalism is also exist within religion other than Islam. For example, Christian fundamentalism in America Latin and USA is considered to bring real threat to democracy in the United States²⁶. Similarly, small number of Judaism believers in Israel and Europe also have radical belief who post threat to other communities life²⁷. Most acholars agree that radicalism is resulted from excessive interpretation of religion, social, and political values within communities.

Within Islam context, scholars also argue that radicalism derives from a radical interpretation of Islam teaching. Even among radical individual and groups, there are interpretative differences stemming from different sects and/or doctrines but it is important to note that not all Muslims subscribe to a radical interpretation of Islam²⁸. However, radical individual and group are much lesser in number, their presence and activities have caused massive impact on many government policies across the world. This exacerbad by use of world wide web in every activities of radicalism groups.

As result, it is important for any interest institutions to monitor radicalism on websites. According to Hui et al.,(2010)monitoring extremist websites allows the understanding of two important points.The first is the development of the organizations responsible for managing the websites.The second is to allow researchers to understand the activities conducted by the groups or individuals and what these may mean for the organization, individual, or the society aroundthem. In addition, monitoring websites allows readers to identify the ideology held by thegroups or individuals responsible for creating them and the message they communicate tofollowers in order to win supporters²⁹.

The number of radical and terrorist groups operate on Internet is increasing from day to day because they realize benefits provided by this technology. For example, Hui found that websites which belong to Al-Qaeda affiliated radical organizations is increasing by 900 every year³⁰. Terrorint mostly use Internet for; propaganda, recruitmemnt, incitement,

²⁶ Fleet, M, Christian Communities in Chile and Peru ...p. 3

²⁷ Shahak, I. and N. Mezvinsky, Jewish Fundamentalism ...p.220

²⁸Mauro, R, Understanding Islamic Extremism, p.1

²⁹Hui, J. Y, The Internet in Indonesia, pp. 172

³⁰ Ibid, p. 171

radicalization, financing, training, planning, execution, cyberattack,³¹. The reasons to operate on Internet to practice those activities are supported by notably benefits offered on Internet.

Those benefits included as follows:

- 1) Access to information is easy;
- 2) Government and regulation usually have little or no regulation to censor and control online radical activities;
- 3) Radical groups may able to recruit huge audiences throughout the world;
- 4) Radical groups is also able to practice anonymous communication;
- 5) Internet support fast flow of information;
- 6) A website is inexpensive in term of development and maintenance;
- 7) Internet supports a multimedia environment (such as the ability to combine text, graphics, audio, and video andto allow users to download films, songs, books, posters, and so forth);
- 8) Internet also has the ability to shape coverage in the traditional mass media, which increasingly use theInternet as a source for stories³².

Terrorism in cyberspace consists of both cybercrime and terror. Terrorist attacks in cyberspace are a category of cybercrime and a criminal misuse of information technologies. The term “cyberterrorism” is often used to describethis phenomenon, but using this term doest not mean “cyberterrorism” can be chatergorized as a new category of crime³³. This implies that terror in online space has similar law consequences and the actors will be presecuted as normal crimes.

However, online radicalim and terrorism might cause massive and widespread impact within community due to technology ability to reach wider audience across the globe. People may become a jihadist or terrorist without direct interaction with radical organizations. In this context, Internet may serve as an alternative to “violent radical” practice³⁴.

An example of how internet can serve as an altenative tool to practice radicalism. Sageman, for example, describes how Hussain Osman, one of the London bombers, claimedto have been influenced by watching Internet

³¹United Nation, The use of the Internet for terrorist purposes. Vienna: UNODC, 2012, pp. 3-12

³²Weimann, G, www.terror.net: How Modern Terrorism Uses the Internet Vol. 116, 2006, . Washington: United States Institute of Peace, p.3

³³Schjolberg, S. 2005. *Terrorism in Cyberspace – Myth or reality?* Paper presented at the 4th Annual Conference: Effective Counter-Terrorism and the Rule of International La, Hague, Netherland. <http://www.cybercrimelaw.net/documents/Cyberterrorism.pdf> , p.2

³⁴Ramsay, G, *Jihadi Culture*, p.3

video footage of the Iraq conflict and reading about jihad online³⁵. Another dramatic example is the perpetrators of the 2005 Khan al-Khalili bombing in Cairo downloaded bomb-making instructions from a jihadist website³⁶. There is broad agreement and many evidences amongst both researchers and policymakers that the Internet is a new venue for jihadist radicalization. Latest finding shows that 50% of the top ten videos on social media are hailing individuals as martyrs, while a further 30% contain footage of suicide bombings which were used to explore the support base for political violence amongst the online audience³⁷.

C. Approach of this Paper

This study employs content analysis approach^{38, 39}. Content analysis approach is commonly used in studying online content⁴⁰. The use of content analysis approach in studying online issue can deepen understanding of a topic being studied because a researcher is able to obtain sufficient data from different formats such as texts, images, symbols, graphics, etc. Such data is available at various radical websites and former studies. Content analysis also enables the researcher to categorize online content, extract emergence concept, and detect various radical sentiment and subjects in online space⁴¹.

The researcher gathered data from the large number of web sites run by different terrorist organizations, through the URLs and geographical

³⁵Awan, A. N, Radicalization on the Internet? *The RUSI Journal*, vol. 152, No.3, 2007, pp. 76-81

³⁶Sageman, M, *Leaderless Jihad*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008, p.125

³⁷Conway, M., & McInerney, L, "Jihadi Video and Auto-radicalisation: Evidence from an Exploratory YouTube Study". In D. Ortiz-Arroyo, H. Larsen, D. Zeng, D. Hicks & G. Wagner (Eds.), *Intelligence and Security Informatics* (Vol. 5376): Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2008, pp. 108-118

³⁸Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. [Article]. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, Vol. 62 No. 1, 2008, pp.107-115

³⁹Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S. E, Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, Vol. 15 No. 9, 2005, pp. 1277-1288

⁴⁰Hara, N., Bonk, C., & Angeli, C, Content analysis of online discussion in an applied educational psychology course. *Instructional Science*, Vol. 28 No. 2, 2000, pp. 115-152

⁴¹Yang, C. C., & Ng, T. D, . *Terrorism and Crime Related Weblog Social Network: Link, Content Analysis and Information Visualization*. Paper presented at the Intelligence and Security Informatics, 2007 IEEE, p. 3

locations of these web sites as practiced by Last & kandel⁴². The websites' content, then, was analysed using thematic approach⁴³. The result was presented based on emergence themes and the use of web sites by radical individuals and organizations.

D. Result and Discussion

1. Internet adoption and use in Indonesia

Internet is new technology which is adopted fastly and widely used across the globe. Currently about 3.36 billion or about 46 percent of world population use internet and 1.6 billion or 48 percent of them live in Asia continent⁴⁴. This number is increasing significantly every year due to improvement in technology infrastructure, regulation, and politics. Western population has adopted and use the Internet in every aspect of life earlier compared to Asian and African population. However, Asian countries' populations are considered have experienced higher Internet adoption and use in last few years due to economic development.

Indonesia is a muslim country where the number of citizens who have access to the Internet and telephone lines has significantly increased in last few years. According to Asia World Stats, Internet subscribers in Indonesia is about 78 million or about 30.5 % of Indonesia population. However, overall internet penetration in Indonesia is lower (23%) compared to other South East Asia countries such as Malaysia (67.5%), Brunei (72%) Singapore (82%) Philippines (43%), and Thailand (56%)⁴⁵. It is predicted, Indonesia internet users will outnumber neighbourcountries in next few years.

This impacts the increase of humans activities in online space. People start moving their conventional daily activities to online space. For example, conventional trading is changed with e-commerce, offline learning become e-learning, and so on. Such fenomena is also practiced by

⁴²Last, M., & Kandel, A, *Fighting Terror in Cyberspace*. Hackensack, N.J.: World Scientific Publishing Company, 2005.

⁴³Attridge-Stirling, J. (2001). Thematic Networks: an Analytic Tool for Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Research, Vol 1 No. 3*, 2001, pp. 385-405

⁴⁴Internet WorldStats. 2015a. Internet Usage Statistics: The Internet Big Picture World Internet Users and 2015 Population Stats. Retrieved 20 januari 2016, from Internet World Stats <http://www.internetworldstats.com/stats.htm>

⁴⁵InternetWorldStats. 2015. Internet Users in Asia. Retrieved 20 januari 2016, from Internet World Stats <http://www.internetworldstats.com/stats3.htm#asia>

radical individual and organizations. They use Internet to persuade and recruit new members as well as deliver massive online propaganda across the globe. In Indonesia, number of radical websites is also increase sharply. This requires government hard effort from relevant authorities to monitor radical groups online activities. From 2010 to 2015, there were 814594 radical sites was shut down⁴⁶. Those websites were used to disseminate hatred and radical contents that potentially harm Indonesian security.

2 Radical Groups on World wide web

Base on web monitoring and observation, the author found a number of radical individuals and groups in Indonesia and International have intensively used the Internet to recruit, radicalize, prepare and plan for attacks. A website is considered radical when it posts radical views, violent, and terror^{47, 48}. Radical organizations explore world wide web to promote and disseminate their missions. Currently, many radical and terrorist group built their own sites as a tool to effectively achieve those missions. The number of radical and terrorist sites could have reached more than thousand but there is no accurate numbers have been reported. Some example of well-known radical and terrorist sites in Indonesia and International are depicted in table 1.

Table 1. Some Identified Radical Sites Within and Outside Indonesia

Site Names	Countries	Description
keabsahankhilafah.blogspot	Indonesia	The site displayed ISIS Flag, promote islamic law to be implemented, promote khalkiphat state by arguing that muslim cannot live without a khaliphat state principles, defense

⁴⁶Kominfo. 2015. Kominfo Sudah Blokir 814.594 Situs Radikal Retrieved 21 Pebruari 2016, from Kominfo http://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/5083/Kominfo+Sudah+Blokir+814.594+Situs+Radikal+/0/sorotan_media#.Vsm0q0AaiwY

⁴⁷ Weimann, G. (2010). "Terror on Facebook, Twitter, and Youtube." *Brown Journal of World Affairs* XVI(II): 55

⁴⁸ Weimann, G. (2012). "Lone Wolves in Cyberspace." *Journal of Terrorism Research* 3(2): 18

		negative news toward ISIS).
tauhidjihad.blogspot	Indonesia	The site defended abu Bakar Basyir by arguing institutions and people who arrest Abu Bakar are <i>thogut</i> , arguing that all laws created by human are rubbish, and that people are <i>thogut</i> , ask people to fight who are not agree with syariah law
bushro2.blogspot	Indonesia	The site mostly used qur'an verses to justify violence. For example, the site quoted QS. Al Anfal:17 to justify killing no muslim people is legal.
Mahabbatiloveislam.blogspot	Indonesia	The site moslty talked about Isalmic syariah from radical perpspectives and static views.
www.azzam.in	Indonesia	The site postes violent images such as ISIS beheaded non muslim people. The site also promoted radical figures in the world.
al-Faloja	Iraq	Highly respected among radicals and terrorists group. The site focuses on the Iraq War and the Salafi-jihadi struggle.
al-Medad	Afghanistan	The site was associated with Abu Jihad al-Masri, the al-Qaeda propaganda chief killed in a U.S. missile strike in Pakistan on 30 October 2008. The site also disseminates Salafi-jihadi ideology.
Ana al-Muslm	Afghanistan	The site was very active and was used by al Qaeda to communicate with Abu Musab al-Zarqawi (Osama bin Laden's deputy in Iraq) until he was killed by U.S. forces in 2006.
al-Mujahideen	Palestine	The sites attract a strong contingent of Hamas supporters, with an overall global jihad perspective; especially focused on electronic jihad.
al-Hanein	Iraq	The sites has a significant amount of jihadist content tinged by Iraqi, Egyptian and Moroccan nationalism

at-Tahaddi		The site belongs to Sunni jihadist. They recruit from Somali, Taliban and other terrorist groups.
TrueIslam1.com	Unknown	The site hosted an impressive archive of jihadist texts, with audio and video organized by means of the online publishing tool Blogger. The website connects to Pimentel's YouTube channel, which was similarly thorough; it had collected more than 600 videos relating to radical and violent interpretations of Islam, 60 of which he had uploaded himself. This channel had more than 1,500 subscribers.
The ek-Is.org (the site is associated with Al-Qaeda)	Iraq	The site provide six training sessions for aspiring terrorists: The site posted "Do you want to form a terror cell?" Using the name Shamil al-Baghdadi, the instructor described how to choose a leader, recruit members and select initial assassination targets. The second lesson outlined assassination techniques.

Sources : adopted from Detiknews⁴⁹Mantel⁵⁰ and Weimann⁵¹

The numbers of radical websites could be millions because in Indonesian itself has been found about 814594 radical websites. The selection of websites for this study was based on number of users and visitors of the websites as well as their popularity⁵². This number is not included unaffiliated individual site accused radicalism. Those individual websites are often operated under lone wolf radicalism, jihadist, or

⁴⁹Detiknews. 2016. Pemerintah Tutup 11 Situs Radikalisme Termasuk www.bahrurnaim.com. Retrieved 21 February 2016, from Detik News <http://news.detik.com/berita/3119768/pemerintah-tutup-11-situs-radikalisme-termasuk-wwwbahrurnaimco>

⁵⁰Mantel, B. 2009. Terrorism and the Internet : Should Web Sites That Promote Terrorism Be Shut Down? Retrieved 26 June 2015, from CQ Researcher http://www.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/upm-binaries/36306_6.pdf.

⁵¹Weimann, G, Lone Wolves in Cyberspace. *Journal of Terrorism Research*, Vol 3 No. 2, 2012, p. 80

⁵² Hui, J. Y, The Internet in Indonesia, p. 177

terrorist. Lone wolf jihadist is understood as *Leaderless Jihad*⁵³. Lone wolf jihadist operate without coordinated by radical organizations or groups. There are also other sites which are widely considered radical or terrorist, but who are not officially so designated according to the criteria discussed in section two above.

Since the emerging of Internet, radical individual and groups have move their offline activities to online platforms. Their presences on various online sites allow them to reach more audience and supporter across the world. They have proved fluent in setting foothold in cyberspace by creating identities on various sites such as YouTube, Twitter, Instagram, Tumblr, internet memes and other Internet sites. For example, Islamic State in Iraq and Syria (ISIS) used online sites to post their activities and it gained huge respond from online users across the world during early offensive. ISIS postings on Twitter has ramped up during early offensive and the posting were tweeted and re-tweeted almost 40.000 a day as they attacked northern Iraqi city of Mosul⁵⁴.

However, the way radical and terrorist groups use Internet is shifting every year depend on technological development. This shifting is described in the following table 2.

⁵³Bräuchler, B, Islamic Radicalism Online: The Moluccan Mission of the Laskar Jihad in Cyberspace. *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 15 No. 3, 2004, 267-285

⁵⁴Odell, J. S, Case Study Method in International Political Economy. *International Studies Perspectives*, Vol. 2, 2001, pp. 161-176

Tabel 2. Evolution of Terrorist Use of Internet

Author (s)	<i>Furnell & Warren (1999)⁵⁵</i>	<i>Cohen (2002)⁵⁶</i>	<i>Thomas (2003)⁵⁷</i>	<i>Weimann⁵⁸</i>	<i>Conway (2005)⁵⁹</i>	<i>Weimann (2006)⁶⁰</i>
Uses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Propaganda & Publicity - Fundraising - Information Dissemination - Secure Communications 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Planning - Finance - Coordination & Operations - Political Action - Propaganda 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Profiling - Propaganda - Anonymous/Covert Communication - Generating "Cyberfear" - Finance - Command & Control - Mobilisation & Recruitment - Information Gathering - Mitigation of Risk - Theft/Manipulation of Data - Offensive Use 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Psychological Warfare - Publicity & Propaganda - Data Mining - Fundraising - Recruitment & Mobilisation - Networking - Sharing Information - Planning & Coordination 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Information Provision - Financing such as through <i>Direct Solicitation Via Terrorist Web Sites and Exploitation of E-Commerce Tools & Entities and Exploitation of Charities and Fronts</i> - Networking which was done through <i>transforming organizational structures and planning and coordination</i> Recruitment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Communicative uses (black and white propaganda) - Instrumental Uses - Data Mining - Fundraising - Recruitment and mobilization - Networking - Training - Attacking other terrorists

Adopted from Conway (2005)⁶¹ and Ramsay (2013)⁶²

⁵⁵Furnell, S., & Warren, M, Computer Hacking and Cyber Terrorism: The Real Threats in the New Millennium. *Computers and Security* 18(1), 28-34

⁵⁶Cohen, F. (2002). Terrorism and Cyberspace. *Network Security, Vol.20 No. 5*, 1999, pp. 17-19

⁵⁷Thomas, T. L. 2003. Al Qaeda and the Internet: The Danger of "Cyberplanning. Retrieved 21 Pebruary 2016, from Parameters Spring <http://carlisle-www.army.mil/usawc/Parameters/03spring/thomas.htm>

⁵⁸Weimann, G, www.terror.net: How Modern Terrorism Uses the Internet, pp. 5-10

⁵⁹Conway, M, *TERRORIST 'USE' OF THE INTERNET AND FIGHTING BACK*. Paper presented at the Cybersafety: Safety and Security in a Networked World: Balancing Cyber-Rights and Responsibilities, London. 2005,p.4

⁶⁰Weimann, G, *Terror in Cyberspace* . Washington: Haifa University, 2006, p.31

⁶¹Conway, M, *TERRORIST 'USE' OF THE INTERNET*, P.4

⁶²Ramsay, G, *Jihadi Culture on the World Wide Web*, p. 6

Data from table 2 shows that since 1999 terrorists activities on Internet have become more complex. At the beginning, terrorists use Internet merely to disseminate information and to communicate with other users. In later years, terrorist use Internet for more sophisticated actions such as to recruit new members, raise funds, build networking, and coordinate attacks.

3 Radical Propaganda Strategy on Internet

The use of Internet by radical and terrorist groups is sharply increased as found by Hui⁶³. The radical and terrorist groups have been found expert in using various websites such as Facebook, You Tube, and Twitter to infuse images and texts that inspire young and vulnerable generation. In certain case, the radical and terrorist groups have posted not only an online magazine or text that contains a wide range of inspirational narratives material but also to practical bomb making techniques⁶⁴. These strategies have brought huge impact on public psychology, social, and political views.

The findings of this study show some propaganda strategies of social media use by radical and terrorist groups as presented in table 3 below.

Table3.Online Radical Propaganda Strategies

Radical Organization Names	Propaganda Strategies
jehad.net, alsaha.com, and islammemo.com	Use tactical communications, organization, recruitment, fundraising, strategic positioning, media relations, affinity connections, and international connections
	1. Amateur videos and images are being uploaded daily by its footsoldiers, which are

⁶³ Hui, J. Y, The Internet in Indonesia, p. 171

⁶⁴Hodkinson, P., & Hodkinson, H. 2001. The Strengths and Limitations of Case Study Research. Retrieved 25 Juy 2015, from University of Leeds [http://education.exeter.ac.uk/tlc/docs/publications/LE PH PUB 05.12.01.rtf](http://education.exeter.ac.uk/tlc/docs/publications/LE_PH_PUB_05.12.01.rtf)

<p>Islamic State in Iraq and Syria (ISIS)</p>	<p>then globally shared both by ordinary users and mainstream news organizations.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. ISIS used of hash tags is interesting, as they focus them on group messaging and branding concepts. 3. ISIS had succeeded in creating hype with a total of 700,000 accounts discussing the terrorist group. 4. Upload videos of them attacking towns and firing weapons. 5. Recruit to their cause, with a focus on children. 6. Consolidate local support and increase territorial control. 7. Raise funds and spread propaganda to incite fears, specifically in the Western World. 8. Manipulate military tactics of their adversaries for use toward their own agenda.
<p>Al-Qaeda</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Al-Qaeda are spreading its ideology among the Muslim community in Europe, mainly through the means of social media sites. 2. Released an English-language video entitled, "A Call to Arms," and featuring an American-born spokesperson, Adam Gadahn. The video, directed at jihadists in the United States, Israel, and the United Kingdom, highlights the Fort Hood shooter, Nidal Hasan, whom Gadahn describes in glowing terms ("a pioneer, a trailblazer and a role model who has opened a door, lit a path, and shown the way forward for every Muslim who finds himself among the unbelievers). 3. Teaching Jihadist how to fight alone and advocated that acts of terrorism be carried out by small, autonomous cells or individuals

Abu Asma' Al-Cubi ("the Cuban")	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Posted a message detailing how Muslims living in the West, particularly in the U.S., can promote the global Jihadi movement and can weaken America from within.2. Inspire promotes "open-source jihad.3. Splintered first into "franchises" by country or region, then further into lone operators.4. Tool for recruiting, informing and motivating these lone jihadists
British Islamic militants	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Radical groups communicate with members and supporters all over the world, to recruit new followers and to share information at little risk of identification by authorities.2. Shared personal experiences online of fighting Arab-Afghans.
Hezbollah	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Effective coordination tool for terrorists trying to launch militant attacks such as send and receive near real-time updates on the logistics of troop movements in order to conduct more successful ambushes.2. Send images of his or her location to a second operative who can use the near real-time imagery to time the precise moment to detonate the explosive device
Ansar al-Mujahideen	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Dissuade a member (called "islamic jihad union") from connecting with other jihad supporters2. Warning members such as reminding readers that a Facebook network would allow security agencies to trace entire groups of jihadists3. Target youth for propaganda, incitement, and recruitment purposes4. To disseminate propaganda to an impressionable age bracket that might empathize with their cause and possibly agree to join.

	5. Open page to provide information, look at the discussion boards, click on links to propaganda videos, and join the group.
--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Sources: adapted from Telegraph⁶⁵, Conway,⁶⁶ Weimann⁶⁷, Weimann⁶⁸, and Zerofox⁶⁹

Mostly online propaganda shares a number of key attributes: It tends to use video rather than text, takes full advantage of the linguistic skills of members (sometimes translating statements and videos into European languages), and makes good use of music—all of which appears to resonate with western youth culture⁷⁰. This helps factional radical across the globe to connect each other. Radical groups in Indonesia are also typically factional in character and retain some sort of director indirect link to larger hardline organizations⁷¹

E. Conclusion and Addressing Research Questions

The findings show that a number of well-recognized radical organizations within and outside Indonesia have used Internet in their daily operation. Their reasons to use Internet in their daily activities are included: a). Radical propaganda is able to be spread to entire community in the world without limited by time and geographycal area, b). Internet helps them to coordinate attacks online, c). Funds can be raised from organization or individual donators across the world, d). Radical activites can be practiced anonymously, and e). Communication and interaction can be practice 24 hours a day and seven days a week.

⁶⁵Telegraph, How terrorists are using social media. 2014. Retrieved 20 May 2015, from The Telegraph <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/islamic-state/11207681/How-terrorists-are-using-social-media.html>,

⁶⁶Conway, M, *TERRORIST 'USE' OF THE INTERNET*, p.4

⁶⁷Weimann, G, *Terror in Cyberspace*, pp. 31

⁶⁸Weimann, G, *Terror on Facebook*, p.55

⁶⁹Zerofox. 2014. *ISIS: Terror Has Gone Social* Retrieved 14 June 2014, from Zerofox <https://www.zerofox.com/blog/islamic-state-isis-terror-has-gone-social-infographic/>

⁷⁰Gates, S., & Podder, S. *Social Media, Recruitment, Allegiance and the Islamic State. PERSPECTIVES ON TERRORISM, No. 9 Vol. 4,2015*, p. 109

⁷¹Carnegie, P. J. (2015). Countering the (Re-) Production of Militancy in Indonesia: between Coercion and Persuasion. *PERSPECTIVES ON TERRORISM, Vol. 9 No. 5*, 2015, p. 18

The findings also show that the propaganda strategies are practiced in the ways; a). Radicals groups upload images and vidoes daily on Internet and then it is shared globally by footsoldiers, b). They create massive number of account on Internet and use hastag for branding, c). They promote open jihad and difuse ideology online, and d). They use Internet to warn their members from being traced and cought by security agencies.

The implication of this study is that Internet has been used as a new arena for moderen radical and terrorist operation. This requires all authorities in Indonesia and across the globbe to take actions through allocation of resources such as fund, intelligence, and military forces to combat radicalism in online sphere. Government should also gather intelligence data gathering from Internet because to prevent devastating effect on society as suggested by Xu et al.,⁷².

REFERENCES

- Aghaei, S., Nematbakhsh, M. A., & Farsani, H. K. 2012. Evolution of the World Wide Web: From Web 1.0 to Web 4.0 *International Journal of Web & Semantic Technology (IJWesT)*, Vol. 3 No. 1, pp. 1-10.
- Attride-Stirling, J. 2001. Thematic Networks: an Analytic Tool for Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Research*, Vol. 1 No. 3, pp. 385-405.
- Bermingham, A., Conway, M., McInerney, L., O'Hare, N., & Smeaton, A. F. 2009. *Combining Social Network Analysis and Sentiment Analysis to Explore the Potential for Online Radicalisation*. Paper presented at the The International Conference on Advances in Social Network Analysis and Mining, 2009. ASONAM '09 Athens.
- Berners-Lee, T. 1998. The World Wide Web: A very short personal history. Retrieved 17 Pebruary 2016 <https://www.w3.org/People/Berners-Lee/ShortHistory.html>

⁷²Xu, J., Chen, H., Zhou, Y., & Qin, J, On the Topology of the Dark Web of Terrorist Groups. In S. Mehrotra, D. D. Zeng, H. Chen, B. Thuraisingham & F.-Y. Wang (Eds.), *Intelligence and Security Informatics: IEEE International Conference on Intelligence and Security Informatics, ISI 2006, San Diego, CA, USA, May 23-24, 2006. Proceedings* (pp. 367-376). Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2006, P.65

- Bräuchler, B. 2004. Islamic Radicalism Online: The Moluccan Mission of the Laskar Jihad in Cyberspace. *The Australian Journal of Anthropology*, Vol. 15 No. 3, pp. 267-285.
- Carnegie, P. J. 2015. Countering the (Re-) Production of Militancy in Indonesia: between Coercion and Persuasion. *PERSPECTIVES ON TERRORISM*, Vol. 9 No. 5, pp. 15-25.
- Casciani, D. 2014. How do you define Islamist extremism? Retrieved 30 June 2015, from BBC News <http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-27777892>
- Cohen, F. 2002. Terrorism and Cyberspace. *Network Security*, Vol. 5, pp. 17-19.
- Conway, M. 2005. *TERRORIST 'USE' OF THE INTERNET AND FIGHTING BACK*. Paper presented at the Cybersafety: Safety and Security in a Networked World: Balancing Cyber-Rights and Responsibilities, London.
- Detiknews. 201). Pemerintah Tutup 11 Situs Radikalisme Termasuk www.bahrunaim.com. Retrieved 21 February 2016, from Detik News <http://news.detik.com/berita/3119768/pemerintah-tutup-11-situs-radikalisme-termasuk-wwwbahrunnaimco>
- Egon, B. 1963. Radicalism and the Organization of Radical Movements. *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 28 No. 6, pp. 928-940.
- Ellison, N. B., Steinfield, C., & Lampe, C. 2007). The Benefits of Facebook "Friends:" Social Capital and College Students' Use of Online Social Network Sites. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, Vol. 12 No. 4, pp. 1143-1168.
- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. 2008. The qualitative content analysis process. [Article]. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, Vol. 62 No. 1, pp. 107-115.
- Fleet, M. (1992). Christian Communities in Chile and Peru Toronto, Kellog Institute, 2002, p.3
- Furnell, S., & Warren, M. 1999. Computer Hacking and Cyber Terrorism: The Real Threats in the New Millennium. *Computers and Security* Vol. 18 No. 1, pp. 28-34.
- Gates, S., &Podder, S. 2015. Social Media, Recruitment, Allegiance and the Islamic State. *PERSPECTIVES ON TERRORISM*, Vol. 9 No. 4, pp. 107-116.
- Hara, N., Bonk, C., & Angeli, C. 2000. Content analysis of online discussion in an applied educational psychology course. *Instructional Science*, Vol. 28 No. 2, pp. 115-152.

- Hodkinson, P., & Hodkinson, H. 2001. The Strengths and Limitations of Case Study Research. Retrieved 25 July 2015, from University of Leeds
http://education.exeter.ac.uk/tlc/docs/publications/LE_PH_PUB_05.12.01.rtf.
- Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S. E. 2005. Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, Vol. 15 No. 9, pp. 1277-1288.
- Hui, J. Y. 2010. The Internet in Indonesia: Development and Impact of Radical Websites. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, Vol. 33, pp. 171-191.
- InternetWorldStats. 2015a. Internet Usage Statistics: The Internet Big Picture World Internet Users and 2015 Population Stats. Retrieved 20 januari 2016, from Internet World Stats
<http://www.internetworldstats.com/stats.htm>
- InternetWorldStats. 2015b. Internet Users in Asia. Retrieved 20 januari 2016, from Internet World Stats
<http://www.internetworldstats.com/stats3.htm#asia>
- Kaplan, A. M., & Haenlein, M. 2010. Users of the World, Unite! The Challenges and Opportunities of Social Media. *Business Horizons*, Vol. 53 No. 1, pp. 59 - 68.
- Kominfo. 2015. Kominfo Sudah Blokir 814.594 Situs Radikal Retrieved 21 Pebruari 2016, from Kominfo
http://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/5083/Kominfo+Sudah+Blokir+814.594+Situs+Radikal+/0/sorotan_media#.Vsm0q0AaiwY
- Krotoski, A. 2010. The internet's cyber radicals: heroes of the web changing the world Retrieved 20 February 2016, from The Guardian
<http://www.theguardian.com/technology/2010/nov/28/internet-radicals-world-wide-web>
- Last, M., & Kandel, A. 2005. *Fighting Terror in Cyberspace*. Hackensack, N.J.: World Scientific Publishing Company.
- Mantel, B. 2009. Terrorism and the Internet : Should Web Sites That Promote Terrorism Be Shut Down? Retrieved 26 June 2015, from CQ Researcher http://www.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/upm-binaries/36306_6.pdf.
- Mauro, R. 2014. Understanding Islamic Extremism. Retrieved 24 June 2015, from The Clarion Project

<http://www.clarionproject.org/understanding-islamism/islamic-extremism#>

- McKenna, K. Y. A., Green, A. S., & Gleason, M. E. J. 2002. Relationship Formation on the Internet: What's the Big Attraction? *Journal of Social Issues*, Vol. 58 No. 1, pp. 9-31.
- O'Reilly, T. 2007. What is Web 2.0: Design Patterns and Business Models for the Next Generation of Software. *Communications & Strategies*, Vol 1 No. 1, p.17.
- Odell, J. S. 2001. Case Study Method in International Political Economy. *International Studies Perspectives*, Vol. 2, pp. 161-176.
- Ramsay, G. 2013. *Jihadi Culture on the World Wide Web*. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Ridouani, D. 2011. The Representation of Arabs and Muslims in Western Media. *RUTA*, Vol. 3, p.15.
- Schjolberg, S. 2005. *Terrorism in Cyberspace – Myth or reality?* Paper presented at the 4th Annual Conference: Effective Counter-Terrorism and the Rule of International La, Hague, Netherland. <http://www.cybercrimelaw.net/documents/Cyberterrorism.pdf>
- Shahak, I. and N. Mezvinsky (1999). *Jewish Fundamentalism in Israel*. Bon Germany, Pluto Press. 1999, p. 220.
- Sindonews. 2015. Kominfo Sudah Blokir 814.594 Situs Radikal. Retrieved 21 Pebruari 2016, from Koran Sindo <http://nasional.sindonews.com/read/1009534/14/kominfo-sudah-blokir-814-594-situs-radikal-1433566920>
- Telegraph. 2014. How terrorists are using social media. Retrieved 20 May 2015, from The Telegraph <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/islamic-state/11207681/How-terrorists-are-using-social-media.html>
- Thomas, T. L. 2003. Al Qaeda and the Internet: The Danger of "Cyberplanning. Retrieved 21 Pebruary 2016, from Parameters Spring <http://carlisle-www.army.mil/usawc/Parameters/03spring/thomas.htm>
- United-Nation. 2012. The use of the Internet for terrorist purposes. Vienna: UNODC.
- University-of-Aberdeen. (2014). Understanding Radicalism. Retrieved 30 June 2015, from University of Aberdeen <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/radicalism/understanding.shtml>

- Weimann, G. (2004). www.terror.net: How Modern Terrorism Uses the Internet (Vol. 116, pp. 12). Washington: United States Institute of Peace.
- Weimann, G. 2006. Terror in Cyberspace. Washington: Haifa University. p. 31
- Weimann, G. 2010. Terror on Facebook, Twitter, and Youtube. *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, XVI(II), p.55.
- Weimann, G. 2012. Lone Wolves in Cyberspace. *Journal of Terrorism Research*, Vol 3 No. 2, p. 18.
- Xu, J., Chen, H., Zhou, Y., & Qin, J. 2006. On the Topology of the Dark Web of Terrorist Groups. In S. Mehrotra, D. D. Zeng, H. Chen, B. Thuraisingham & F.-Y. Wang (Eds.), *Intelligence and Security Informatics: IEEE International Conference on Intelligence and Security Informatics, ISI 2006, San Diego, CA, USA, May 23-24, 2006. Proceedings* (pp. 367-376). Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Yang, C. C., & Ng, T. D. 2007. *Terrorism and Crime Related Weblog Social Network: Link, Content Analysis and Information Visualization*. Paper presented at the Intelligence and Security Informatics, 2007 IEEE.
- Zerofox. 2014. ISIS: Terror Has Gone Social Retrieved 14 June 2014, from Zerofox <https://www.zerofox.com/blog/islamic-state-isis-terror-has-gone-social-infographic/>