ECRANISATION, FROM TEXTUAL TRADITION TO CINEMA: THE INFIDELITY AGAINST THE VALUES OF LITERARY WRITING?

EKRANISASI, DARI TRADISI TEKSTUAL KE SINEMA: KETIDAKSETIAAN TERHADAP NILAI-NILAI-NILAI DALAM SASTRA TULIS?

Istadiyantha
Faculty of cultural sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret of Surakarta,
Jebres, Surakarta, Central Java 57126
Email: istadiyantha@staff.uns.ac.id

Submitted: 2017-06-08 Published: 2017-09-10 DOI: 10.24036/jh.v16i1.7961
Accepted: 2017-08-30 URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.24036/jh.v16i1.7961

Abstract

Ecranization is a wide-screening or transferring process of a novel into the movie. Ecranization can be a process of sifting or transferring or removing characteristics of a novel into a film. This study is written descriptive-qualitatively based on data collected from the results of literature studies. The data include primary and secondary data. Primary data covers the novel of Ayat-Ayat Cinta published by PT Penerbit Republika-Basmala in 2005 which is also a material object, some quotes or dialogues in Ayat-Ayat Cinta (AAC) by Habiburahman El Shirazy and the AAC film directed by Hanung Bramantyo. The study found that despite the fact both the title of the film and the names of the main characters are the same as the novel, but the rides from novel to film have separated and distinguished the distinctive features of the media itself with their respective rides, novel vehicles and movie rides. We can neither expect the loyalty of a film to the novel as the source of the story because there will certainly occur changes following the nature of the media and their respective lovers. It is important to emphasize that in distinguishing how to enjoy two different mediums it is necessary to appreciate the works of literature to avoid disappointment because of the natural differences that must exist between the film and the novel.

Keywords: Ayat-Ayat Cinta, difference, ecranization, film, novel, media

Abstrak


© Universitas Negeri Padang
83
terhadap karya-karya sastra untuk menghindari kekecewaan karena perbedaan alamiah yang harus ada antara film dan novel.

*Kata Kunci:* Ayat-Ayat Cinta, perbedaan, ekranisasi, film, novel, media

**Introduction**

Novel is one of the most widely used literary works for making a film. Some of the best-selling novels proved to be commercially successful as films such as The Da Vinci Code by Dan Brown (published in 2003) and Harry Potter by JK Rowling (first series published in 1997). Nearly all over the worlds the Dan Brown's novel sold over 40 million copies. While the films make a profit of US $ 750 million from the sale of tickets (Haryadi, 2008). While the entire Harry Potter novel series recorded until July 2013 has been sold 450 million copies. Mega Best Seller. For the film, his first four films have reached a mount of US $ 3.65 billion in revenues from ticket sales worldwide. Harry Potter film made up to eight sequels following the novel series of the novel which has been initially published.

Most of what we see from the emerging films is essentially an adaptation of the novels or literary works alike. In Indonesia, this kind of adaptation process has been started since the Dutch East Indies, when the novel Siti Noerbaja a work by Marah Rusli (1922) was filmed with a title Haryadi Rohmat, 2008, Saat Bioskop Jadi Majelis Taklim, Sihir Film Ayat-Ayat Cinta, and MMU Bandung were hosted by the same director Lie Tek Swie in 1942. Siti Noerbaja Lie’s version is still in the form of black and white film and advertised as a Padang style pencak film. The film premiered for the first time in Surabaya, on January 23, 1942. Another source mentioned that the Lie’s film actually has been released since 1941.

Movie filming activities have actually been started since the early 90's. A series of Indonesian novel titles have been integrated to the wide-screen filming. In addition there are also some integrated pieces of writing novels into a wide screen filming like sinetron. A row of titles like “Rara Mendut”, “Salah Asuhan”, “Atheis”, Ronggeng Dukuh Paruk”, and “Si Doel Anak Betawi” are some titles that have been transformed into movie. The development of the novel filmization has skyrocketed the public responses and the enthusiasm as can be seen from the AAC era filmmaking by Hanung Bramantyo. This booming film is, of course, influenced by various factors. This success was then followed by the filming of "Ketika Cinta Berbasaibi", which until now, has yet to be witnessed by the results, and "Laskar Pelangi". Recent literary film-making is not only about novels, but also short stories. Among the short stories that have been filmed are "Tentang Dia" by Melly Goeslaw, and “Mereka Bilang Saya Monyet", by Djenar Maesa Ayu. Djenar’s MBSM filmmaking is an exciting and unique film. Not only from the cinematic aspect and the story, but also the result of their transformation.

Ecranization is a wide-screening or transferring process of a novel into a movie. Ecranization can be a process of sifting or transferring or removing characteristics of a novel into a film. Moving from novel to white-screen inevitably leads to various changes (Eneste, 1991, p. 60). The phenomenon of ecranization certainly cannot be completely distinguished from the early fame of a work. Successful novels are not uncommon to be the starting point for the birth of successful films as well. It is often a reference to the birth of a new success of a diversified form, from novel to film and vice versa. One example of a successful novel lifted to the wide screen is the novel Ayat-Ayat Cinta by Habiburrahman El-Shirazy. The differences that emerge between novels and films are not uncommon to cause disappointment because they can be released
from the process of reading the film workers against the novel to be adapted. According to Iser (1987: 169), the text is the whole system in which there is a blank. The blank can not be filled by the system in the text itself. Blank in the text is filled by the reader who interprets it. Meanwhile, the interpretation of the reader as a form of filling the blank is met through the storage reader. Therefore, the interpretation of literary works between one reader to another who are varied depending on the storage of each reader.

The existence of blank filling as a form of communication between readers with the text raises an assumption that there is a difference between the films with the novel that adapted. Bluestone (1957: 31) states that the difference in raw materials between novels and films cannot be fully explained on the basis of differences in content. Each medium requires a privilege through heterogeneity and overlapping, the condition of audience demand, and its artistic form. In addition, the film-bound factor with duration causes film workers to be creative to sort and select the events that are important to be filmed. Therefore, it is common to see differences and shifts in particular with regard to the story line considering that each has a character that adapts to the function of the media of the work. In the adaptation process contained the concept, conversions, along with the understanding of different characters.

Films which have been mostly adapted from the novels actually appears as a consequence of "fulfillment of its function". In general the film is divided into two constituent elements ie, narrative elements and cinematic elements. The two elements interact and sustain each other to form a movie. Each of these elements will not be able to form a film if only stand alone (Pratista, 2008, p. 1). It can be said that the narrative element is the material to be processed, while the cinematic element is the way (style) to process it. In the story film, the narrative element is the treatment of the film's story. While the cinematic element or also often termed cinematic style is a technical aspect of film makers. The cinematic element is divided into four main elements namely: 1) mise-en-scene; 2) cinematography; 3) editing; and 4) votes. Each of these cinematic elements also interacts and continuously interconnects with each other to form a complete cinematic style.

Several related studies have been done in the area, Karkono (2009) in his thesis report studied the Ecranization on the Novel of Aya t-ayat Cinta which in his findings assumed that the fundamental differences in the existing novel and film of AAC are not limited to the technical problems such as the novel media in the form of words and languages distinguished from the film out of the audio-visual making processes. However, much of his study concerns that there are deliberate intended differences made by the film production team along with the specific purposes. Other similar and recent studies in litereray work of novel are Abdul Manaf (2015) in his article entitled Dinamika Penggunaan Kata Dan Istilah Dalam Karya Sastra Indonesia Dan Implikaturnya, which in his research results confirms that Indonesian literary works written in Indonesian language using the word / term Regional language is more striking than other periods. This period can be used as an alternative to mark the period of Indonesian language development, especially the development of Indonesian vocabulary. In addition, the use of words and terms prominently observed by the characters in the novels of Indonesia; is an implicatur that the Indonesian peoples in this case the author feel anxiety into shifting the regional culture by the national culture of Indonesia. Meanwhile Tanita Liasna, Khairil Ansari (2016) studied Perspektif Gender dalam Dwilogi Novel Padang Bulan dan Cinta Di Dalam Gelas karya Andrea Hirata: Kajian Struktur dan Kritik Sastra Feminisme serta Relevansinya sebagai Bahan
Bacaan Sastra di SMA. The results of his research found that (1) the structure of the novel Dwilogi Padang Bulan and Cinta di Dalam Gelas are themes, plot, character and character, background, point of view, and mandate, (2) gender perspective that appears in the novel Dwilogi Padang Bulan dan Cinta di In Gelas are gender equality and gender inequality. Gender equality in Padang Bulan novel in the form of access, participation, and control. Yustin Sartika (2017) discussed in her article *Pola Asuh Dan Narsisme Dalam Mengkonstruksi Gambaran Diri Di Cerita Joice Carol Oates*, uses the theory of object relations, her study found that the lack of closeness and sense of rejection gave rise to depression. To prevent further rejection, the self can be divided into different characters.

**Method**

This study is written descriptive-qualitatively based on data collected from the results of literature studies. The data include primary and secondary data. Primary data covers the novel of Ayat-Ayat Cinta published by PT Penerbit Republika-Basmala in 2005 which is also a material object, some quotes or dialogues in Ayat-Ayat Cinta (AAC) by Habiburahman El Shirazy and the AAC film directed by Hanung Bramantyo. In addition, the authors also use secondary data in the form of written reference sources (books, journals, theses, dissertations, research reports) relevant to the text study, the aesthetic principles of literary reception. The data were analyzed which compiled with other results such as relevant books and a number of literary works related to the studied novel and other short stories alike, as well as the movie script to provide the best explanation on the ecranizationome examples of the the novel works that have been adapted into films, presented descriptively to give an idea that ecranization as a vehicle for adaptation from literature to filmmaking activities which is currently in demand especially in Indonesia.

**Result and Discussion**

**Acculturation of Middle Eastern Culture to Indonesia**

Measuring a nation's determination in teaching development goals means talking about the dynamics of the Indonesian nation and about the quality of Indonesian people. Unraveling the various contradictory phenomena associated with the uniformity and diversity of Islam is not easy, we are not only faced with the question of whether "Islam" and "Muslim" are myths or realities, but also on the question of how Islamic dynamics proceed. Therefore we need not only to map out the same and different aspects, but also to explain why there are similarities and differences. In the sociology of culture there is a lifestyle in which the soul and matter and the relationship is very strong, for example, *keris*, (physical form is *keris*, which in itself manifest a value).

The personality of the eastern nation can be defined as the attitude possessed by a country that determines its adaptability to the environment. Eastern personality in general is a personality that has a high tolerance. Indonesia has diverse cultures, tribes and customs. Indonesia is included in the part of the countries that are in the position of the Asian continent to have customs called "eastern customs", very different from the western countries, due to different views of life and community habits. The eastern nation is identical to the Asian continent whose inhabitants are mostly black-haired, brown-skinned and unisex-skinned white-eyed. Most of the ways of dressing the
eastern people are more polite and closed, perhaps because most eastern people embrace the religion of Islam and uphold the prevailing norms. But it can not be said to say that eastern culture is better than western culture, since situations and conditions play a very important role to determine by which culture one must solve a problem for it has some consideration that is comprehensive, in eastern culture we have its advantages.

**Middle Eastern Culture in Modern Indonesia Literature**

Middle Eastern cultural travel in modern Indonesian literature has decreased the socio-cultural elements that shape and influence various aspects of people's lives. It includes literary works in touch with themes and issues of femininity. For approximately 300 years, since the scholars of Java and Malay have studied in the region from the 18th century AD until now, there are countless scholars and scholars, experts and scholars. Starting in the 80s alone, on average there are 115 students who received scholarships from universities in the Middle East, especially in Al-Azhar, Egypt. Even the influence is quite real and always used as the main reference. However, little information indicates the existence of writers and literary works that have involvement in the discourse and movement of Indonesian women.

One such information is the birth of the novel - Faridah Hanum - the work of Sheikh Ahmad Al-Hadi, published Jelotong Press in 1925. Through the thoughts and actions of the main character, Hanum and Shafiq, the love story in the novel is always juxtaposed with narration and concepts about modern culture related to women's issues. As such, the novel is recorded as the first modern Malay-Indonesian literary work to address gender issues. Al-Hadi was born in Riau and later settled in Singapore. During his schooling in Al-Azhar (Egypt), he studied and studied many of the reformers of modern Islamic thought. And intensively explore the thoughts of Qasim Amin (1863-1908), which is touted as the father of Muslim feminists. Two of Qasim Amin's famous books are; "*Tahrir Al-Mar'ah*" (Liberation of Women) and "*Mar'ah Al-Jadidah*" (Modern Women).

Subjectively (as far as the information the writer obtain), since the days of the New Poets flew to the 45th generation, then the birth of the 66th and 70th's generations, there is the variety of modern Indonesian literary works that brought the theme, related or influenced discourses and women's movements in the Middle East. Even in the 80's generation, similar works have not yet seen the bridge of his nose. Literary works on emancipation, feminism and gender theme, but all of that is influenced by the discourse and movement of women from the West.

Along with the birth of the development of NGOs and women's movement in Indonesia in the 90's, the influence of Middle Eastern culture and thought was beginning to show. Through the translation of Muslim feminist thought books such as Riffat Hasan, Aminah Wadud, Fatima Mernissi, Asghar Ali Enginer, Mazharul Haq Khan etc., as well as books of discourse and literary works from Al-Jabiri, Nasr Hamid, Ben Prophet, and novels Nawal El Sadawi, the influence is increasingly visible again. All of that is only a subjective assumption. To explore further, whether or not the influence of Middle Eastern culture and thinking in modern Indonesian literature still requires study and academic research. And from this place, from this forum, the studies must be born.
The Novel of Ayat-Ayat Cinta

Something reasonable if the best-selling novel makes the producers want to visualize it into a movie. The best-selling novel that was filmed at least already has the prospect’s potential pet capital from the reader of the novel. So the estimated profit is already unimaginable. Some of them are indeed commercially successful following the success of the sale of his novel. For example Ayat-ayat Cinta movie (4 million viewers), Laskar Pelangi (reaching 1 million viewers), Habibie Ainun (reaching 3 million viewers), 5 cm (reaching 1.5 million viewers). Another benchmark for commercial film success is that the films were able to sit on the 21st Cinema network for more than two weeks. Cinema 21 will usually lower the movie if after three days of viewers remain quiet.

Apparently, not all the films that adapt the best-selling novels will obtain more money if they are to convert into a movie and released in theaters. I.e., Andera Hirata's best-selling novel "Edensor", which is a trilogy of Laskar Pelangi, failed in the market when it became a movie of the same name. So is the movie "Negeri Lima Menara" which is adapted from the novel titled the same work of A. Fuadi was not received quite encouraging response. Even the film Ketika Cinta Bertasbih 1-2 are planned to follow the success of Ayat-Ayat Cinta was in the market place. Based on the writer's observation in the field, those films could not able to survive more than one week in cinema 21 network in Jakarta.

From the novelty of the novel to the film, it is necessary to get the special attention of a novel that became the cornerstone of the phenomenon of the rise of Islamic religious novel and great success when converted into a movie. The novel is Ayat-ayat Cinta by Habiburahman El Shirazy. Novel "Ayat Ayat Cinta" was published in 2004 and was recorded to have sold over 450 thousand copies in its third year of sales. This novel reap the praise of various circles as a religious novel that intelligently provides an understanding of life and love in the Islamic horizon. The author of this novel is also considered to successfully describe the social cultural background of the Middle East (Egypt) with life without having to use Arabic terms. Ahmadun Yosi Herfanda, writer and editor of the daily culture of Republika also praised him by saying that the language in this novel flows, the characterization of his strong figures and the background image of life so as to make the story in this novel really happen (El Shirazy, 2005).

Ayat-Ayat Cinta is considered to have given a new phenomenon in the Indonesian literature. A novel that is considered Islamic able to penetrate the market to the various circles and survive so long in the market. Many who value the verses of Love are very good for teenagers because it is loaded with Islamic values and teaches the true meaning of life. So this novel is given the title as "Novel Pembangun Jiwa". The novel also reached out Best Seller in Southeast Asia. Once translated into Malay, Canadian, German, Dutch, English and Australian publishers are also interested. A number of awards were received by Habiburahman El Shirazy, which was awarded as Novelis No.1 2007 from Insani Diponegoro University of Semarang and the 2007 Changes figures by the Republika daily. 2005 won the Pena Award for the category of National Praised Novel and the Most Favorite Books and Writer 2005. For Southeast Asia Ayat-Ayat Cinta won the South East Asia Writer Award from the Thai government and the Mastera Prize (Southeast Asia Literary Assembly).

This novel is essentially a romantic novel about love wrapped with a touch of Islamic da'wah/preaching. Using techniques with the "I am" perspective as a storyteller. Illustrates the struggle of a young man from Java named Fahri who studied
at the university AL Azhar Cairo. Fahri is portrayed as a male figure of a less-than-well-deserved, handsome, intelligent, pious family and a seizure of four women: Maria (Christian female copyptic woman), Aisha (German-turk), Noura (Egypt) and Nurul (Indonesian Islam). Each woman loves Fahri in her own way. With the background of Cairo city life in Egypt and the lecture atmosphere in Al Azhar this story takes place. In the end, after the twists and turns of struggle and suffering, Fahri married and lived happily with the beautiful, intelligent Aisha and came from a wealthy family. Fahri is an unsteady figure facing various trials. The message is always steadfast in the face of various trials of life and always cling to the teachings of religion.

Utilizing the best-selling novel "Ayat-Ayat Cinta", producer MD Pictures, Manooj Punjabi then made the novel as the source of the movie story with the same title "The verses of Love". Acting as director is Hanung Bramantyo and as screenwriter Salman Aristo. The film "Ayat-Ayat Cinta" first aired on February 28, 2008, after spending 1.5 years of production process.

Commercially, the Film Ayat-Ayat Cinta earned great success. After three months in theaters the number of spectators penetrated the number 4 million. MD Pictures which produces Ayat-ayat Cinta duplicates film tapes up to 100 copies. That number beat the Hollywood premier class movie which averages only 65-70 copies. While the national film is usually only printed 10-20 copies only. Movies made at a cost of 10 billion profit 48 billion within four months. The film also gained great success when it was screened in neighboring Malaysia and Brunei. The trend of religious romantic movies has been on the rise ever since.

Film Ayat-Ayat Cinta won the best film title in Bandung Film Festival (2008). Ministry of Culture and Tourism made the film as a media 'Co-Marketing' for Promotion Visit Indonesia Year 2008 in Southeast Asia. Tried to follow the succession of Ayat-Ayat Cinta then the film appeared When Love (1-2 KCB 1-2) which is also based on two-volume novel by Habiburahman El Shirazy. Even the author of this novel also acted as co director in the film's production. But KCB 1-2, which was made at great expense and tried to be faithful to the flow in his novel, failed in the market.

In the course of ecranization, the conversion on the literary works to film realm, also influences the changing of language or words, into movies made out of audio-visual images. From the novel, the illustrations and depictions are constructed by using language or word media, while the film all is manifested through moving images or audio visuals that present a series of events. The media differences between the two genres of art in themselves manifest different characteristics. Language as a medium of literary work has the nature of openness to the author's imagination. In this regard, it engages much more mental processes. The language used allows a large space for the reader to interpret and imagine each one he watches. Another influential factor is the duration of time in the film's enjoyment. Limited time gives its own influence in the process of acceptance and imagery.

In the case of the novel Ayat-Ayat Cinta, although both the novel and the film were successful in the market, but it turned out there was "disloyalty" of this film on his novel. For readers of this novel who then watch the movie will find many discrepancies from the story or setting (background) between them. Hanung Bramantyo as director of this film admits that he did a lot of changes in the story of the film. According to him when he first read the novel "Ayat-Ayat Cinta" he felt disgusted. He can not bear to see perfect fahri characters, handsome, clever pious, loved by beautiful women at the same time let alone they come uninvited, without even a little Fahri approached him. Hanung decided to stop reading the novel. He was forced to
read the novel again because he was received an offer from his producer to direct the film. The important message in which Hanung found in the novel was sincerity, patience and tolerance as taught by the Qur’an (Haryadi, 2008). By holding on to that important message Hanung visualizes the Love Verses. It is clear that Hanung is not guided by the structure, plot, or storytelling technique of his novel. Hanung ekranisasi by being unfaithful to his novel but loyal to the important message in the novel is sincerity, patience and tolerance of different religious adherents.

There are several things that become the reasoning reason to be unfaithful to the text of his novel, namely: 1). Difficulty removing all the dialogs and scenes that are written on the novel to become the image (visual and audio) in the movie because not all the meaning, nuance and atmosphere conveyed through the words can be realized in the form of images (visual) in the film. 2). Time to enjoy the movie is different from the time to enjoy the novel because it is the duration or length of the film into consideration in switching the media into a medium of film media. 3). The plot of the novel is composed with the script that the novel reader enjoys over and over depending on the willingness and availability of the reader's time. While in the movie, at the time it is performed through cinema the sequence of images that make up the story move quickly without waiting for the readiness of the audience to follow. Movies in theaters can not be played back based on the willingness of the audience because of the nature which is collectively rather than individually enjoyed. Therefore, the storyline in a slow and rambling novel must be made in such a way as to be simpler and faster. 4). The difficulty to show all the backgrounds in the novel because it will cost big considering the background is abroad (Egypt, Turkey).

So there is a shift and change the story from novel to film. The addition of stories and disappearance of stories conveyed through scenes and dialogue in the film, among others:

1) The encounter of Mary and Fahri in the film happens intentionally. While in the novel took place by accident.
2) In the movie occurred Fahri fight with the Egyptian man on the bus. While in the novel is not there. Visually, the fight scene may be more interesting than the scenes of the Egyptian gentleman apologizing by kissing Fahri's forehead.
3) In the film Maria entered the hospital and experienced coma because hit by a car as part of a conspiracy to corner Fahri in court. Maria then became unconscious until Fahri woke her through a marriage bond she never realized. While in the novel of the collision was due to chance. The film makes it look like a conspiracy to bring down Fahri.

There are many more shifts and changes that are encountered in the film of the novel as the source of the story. Hanung Bramantyo honestly said in his blog that after the failure of filming in Cairo they must rip with the scenario and made a little out of the novel.

The differences and similarities contained in each of the works discussed are due to changes that occur over a long period of time, influenced by the expectations horizon of the reader and the different reader's experience. This is in accordance with Jauss (1983: 20-21), who argues that literary work is not a stand-alone object offering the same view to every reader in any period. Literary works are not monuments that monologically proclaim the essence of all time. Literary works are more like orchestrations that always give new resonances among readers, and liberate texts from the material of words and lead to contemporary existence. In addition ecranization is also a transformation of the work. In the process of creation, the novel is the work or
creation of the individual, while the film is a team or group work. Novels are the work of individuals that involve experience, thoughts, ideas, and others. Thus, ecranization can also be said to be a process of change from something produced individually into something produced collectively.

**Conclusion**

The adaptation of the work or the transfer of literary vehicle to the film is called ecranization. A novel or short story which has been transformed into a film will indeed change. The conversion on the literary works to film realm, also influences the changing of language or words, into movies made out of audio-visual images. The difference of the literary system from the film system is considered a common thing to do. However, analyzing the differences is not simply caused by differences in both the literary system and the film system, but further finding on the meaning of the change is an important action to take.

The director of Ayat-Ayat Cinta movie has actually done an unfaithful action on the novel text of Ayat-Ayat Cinta. Despite the fact the title of the film and the names of the main characters are the same as the novel, but the rides from novel to film have separated and distinguished the distinctive features of the media itself with their respective rides, novel vehicles and movie rides. Although each vehicle has its own text and structure but both carry the same message of sense of sincerity, patience and tolerance toward different religions and cultures. We can neither expect the loyalty of a film to the novel as the source of the story because there will certainly occur changes following the nature of the media and their respective lovers. Viewers of the movie Ayat-ayat Cinta may not all ever read the novels Ayat-ayat Cinta. So do the novel readers of Ayat - Ayat Cinta may not all have watched the movie. Attitudes to differentiate how to enjoy the two different media is needed to avoid disappointment because of the natural differences which should be exist between films and the novel.

**Reference**


Istadiyantha – Ecranisation, from textual tradition


